

**Status of
Implementation of Food Schemes in Orissa**

A Report based on Field Survey in Four Districts

May 2010

Office of Commissioners of Supreme Court (CWP 196/2001)

(in the case PUCL vs. Union of India and ors.)

And

Office of Adviser to Supreme Court Commissioners, Orissa

Contents

1. Background of the Survey	2
2. Integrated Child Development Services	8
3. Mid Day Meal Scheme	26
4. Targeted Public Distribution System and Antodaya Anna Yojana	37
5. National Old Age Pension Scheme/Annapurna	51
6. National Maternity Benefit Scheme(Janani Suraksha Yojana)	58
7. National Family Benefit Scheme	65

1. Background of the Survey

1.1. Orissa: Socio-economic background:

The modern state of Orissa was established in the year 1936 as a separate provincial state under British India consisting of Oriya speaking population. It is located between the parallels of 17.49'N and 22.34'N latitudes and meridians of 81.27'e and 87.29'E longitudes. It is bound by Bay of Bengal on the east, Madhya Pradesh on the west and Andhra Pradesh on the south. It extends over an area of 155,707 square kms. According to 2001 census of India, the total population of Orissa is 36,706,920 of which 18,612,340 (50.89%) are male and 18, 094, 580 (49.11%) are female. The Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe population form 16.53% and 22.13% respectively of the total state population, thereby consisting 38.66% of total population of the state.

The state has one of the highest reserves of natural resources and forest coverage in the country. On the contrary it happens to be one of the poorest states with 47.15% of its population living below the poverty line. The percent of people under poverty line is more than double as compared to the national average. About 87% of the population lives in the villages and the per capita income is estimated to be approximately Rs 16,149, which is less than half as compared to per capita income of the country. Orissa is ranked among the bottom five states in the aspects of the human development index in the country. The agriculture sector employs more than eighty percent of its labour force though its contribution to gross domestic product of the state is less than one third. Most of the farmers in the state are either small or marginal, which is one of the predominant causes of poor agriculture production in the state. As mentioned earlier the state ranks top in matter of people living with below poverty line out of which ninety percent of the population live in the rural areas, making poverty in Orissa a rural phenomenon. The inequalities in poverty are sharp, based on geographical regions. The southern and western part of Orissa is poorer than the eastern and the coastal regions.

1.2. Prevailing hunger and food deprivation

The state of Orissa is notorious for reports of hunger, starvation deaths and large-scale distress migration. In the last assembly session it was reported by the Revenue department of the state that more than 404 starvation deaths have been reported in different media within a duration of eight years (during the year 2000 to 2008). However the other part of the story is that none of the alleged starvation deaths were accepted by the state government.

As per the NFHS -3, the infant mortality rate in the state is 65 per 1000 live births and child mortality is 91 per 1000 live births (in case of children under 5 years of age). The IMR of the state is more than the national average. As per the same report about two third (65%) of all the children and 61% of all the women are anemic. As per the data, one third (34%) of all the men are anemic in the age group of 20 to 39 years of age. If we go by the nutritional status 45% of all the children in the state are stunted, 20% of the children are wasted and 41% percent of the children are under weight. These are the indicators of chronic and acute under nutrition. As per the NFHS-3 41% of women and 36% of all men in the state are too thin, with a body mass index

of less than 18.5. As per the report only 52-58% of men and women are “healthy” (weight as per their height).

Prevailing food schemes in the state: In the context of large scale poverty and destitution in the state the food schemes plays a vital role in tackling hunger and destitution. The government of India and the state government are implementing different schemes which act as a safety net to prevent people from falling under further destitution and towards enhancing their nutritional status. The prevailing schemes are ICDS, MDMS, TPDS and Emergency feeding programme (EFP) which provides either cooked food or dry rations. EFP is a programme which provides one hot cooked meal per day to the destitute and it is functioning in the KBK region of Orissa only.

Emergency Feeding was initiated with an objective to provide nutritional support to the aged, infirm and the indigent, belonging to BPL households residing in the KBK districts of Orissa. It was started initially in 5 districts under the KBK region (Kalahandi, Nuapada, Koraput, Malakangiri and Rayagada) in the year 1995-96. From the year 1996-97, Bolangir district was included in the feeding programme. In 2000-01 the programme was extended to the whole KBK region and the remaining two districts, Sonepur and Nabarangapur, were added to the list. The programme is being implemented under the Revised Long Term Action Plan (RLTAP) with funds are provided from the Special Central Assistance (SCA). Under the scheme a cooked meal is be provided to the beneficiaries through the Anganwadi center every day throughout the year.

The schemes like NMBS, NFBS and NOAP provide cash rather than food. NREGS entitles the rural wage labour 100 days of unskilled labour per family per year. In line with the NOAP the state government is also operating its separate scheme which is called the Madhu Babu Pension Yojna (MBPY) for old people in the age group of 60 to 65 years as the central scheme only covers those who are above 65 years of age.

These schemes cover the entire life cycle of a human being, from the time when a child is in its mother’s womb assistance is provided to the mother in the form of NMBS. It is a support to the mother who is unable to do hard labour but she needs more nutrition and calorie support at that time. The ICDS programme is meant to address the nutritional requirement of the child till s/he attains six year of age. The scheme also supports the adolescent girls and the pregnant and lactating women. The Mid-Day Meal programme covers all the school going children. Similarly the NREGS provides work to all the adults in rural households in India and under Old pension scheme all the old people above 65 years of age are covered. In case of death of earning member in the family, the family members get ex-gratia relief in the form of NFBS.

1.3. Introduction to the study:

To address the unending chronic hunger in the country a PIL¹ was filed by PUCL Rajasthan in the Supreme Court of India under CWP-196/2001 which is popularly known as “Right to Food case”. In its interim verdicts Honorable Supreme Court appointed Commissioners to monitor the eight food related schemes declared as entitlements by the orders of the Supreme Court. As part of their responsibility the commissioners submit regular reports on the status of implementation of the food-related schemes to the apex court. The present study “Status of Implementation of food related schemes” was under taken to find out the functioning of food related schemes in ten states of India. The study will contribute to the 10th report of the Commissioners to be submitted to the Supreme Court of India.

The study was facilitated by the Orissa State Advisor’s office. The preparation of questionnaires and training of researchers were undertaken by the Commissioners’ office.

Objective of the study:

To access the implementation of food related schemes monitored by the Supreme Court of India under (CWP-196/2001) the right to food case. The survey covered the following aspects

- Coverage
- Availability, accessibility and quality
- Problems in implementation
- Grievance redressal mechanism and general grievances

The purpose of the study was to identify the present status of functioning of the schemes in four districts of Orissa.

1.4. Study design:

Selection of districts

The study was conducted in four districts of Orissa. The districts are Balasore, Gajapati, Kandhamal and Nuapada. The districts were selected based on their geographical location to represent different regions in the state. Balasore district represents eastern Orissa, Gajapati represents the southern part of Orissa, Kandhamal is located in the central part of the state and Nuapada represents the western part. Further Balasore is not only located in the east but it also in coastal Orissa and is one of the developed districts of the state. Gajapati is one of the remote tribal districts of Orissa and is highly affected by the left wing extremism. The district of Kandhamal was very recently devastated by riots. The Nuapada district belongs to the KBK² region of the state and one of the poorest districts of the country, known for hunger deaths and child sale.

Selection of Blocks

¹ Visit www.righttofoodindia.org to know detail about the PIL

² Please visit http://planningcommission.gov.in/plans/stateplan/sp_kbktour.pdf

Two blocks were selected from each district – one relatively forward block and the second one being one of the remote blocks of the district. The selection of the district and block was done by the State Advisor and the villages were selected by the Commissioners' office.

Selection of villages

From the Census list of villages, five villages were randomly selected from each block. Of the total 10 villages selected in each district it was ensured that at least one had a SC population in the range of 20% to 50% and that at least one other village had a population of minorities (Muslims, Christians) or PTGs.

Sample size:

The survey did not take individuals as the sample but villages were taken as sample. Data were collected from all the AWCs and the schools to find out the functioning of the ICDS and MDM schemes respectively. The information relating to all people above 65 years in the sample villages were taken as per the interview schedule. It covered all the families below poverty line who are supposed to be entitled to the cash-transfer schemes such as NMBS, NOAPS and NFBS.

Research team:

The survey was conducted in four districts of Orissa in two phases. In the first phase it was undertaken in Nuapada and Kandhamal, and in the second phase in Balasore and Gajapati districts. For smooth conduct of the study nine researchers were appointed for the survey. A team of four researchers went to the district to conduct the study along with the research coordinator. Both the researchers from the Advisor's office coordinated one district each in both phases of the study.

1.5. Accessibility of the villages:

The survey was undertaken in 40 villages from 32 Gram Panchayats from 8 blocks under 4 districts. As per the information the average distance between the villages surveyed and nearest town/ city is nine kilometers, the lowest distance being one kilometer and highest distance being 18 kilometers. The average distance from the district head quarter to the villages surveyed is 65.5 kilometers. The farthest distance from the district head quarter is 120 kilometers. This shows the remoteness of the villages.

Health Facility

The villages are situated at distance of 4.2 kilometer on an average from the nearest Primary health center. Out of 40 villages surveyed there is a PHC in 5 villages. The farthest distance from the village to PHC is 12 kilometers. It shows that accessibility of the surveyed villages to the nearest PHC is in a better situation. The surveyed villages are situated at an average

distance of 12 kilometer from the nearest Community Health Center. The nearest government hospital is situated at an average distance of 55.5 kilometers from the surveyed villages. It shows the remoteness of the villages with regards to better health facilities. Therefore as per the information for basic health services people can easily access the nearest PHC which at a distance of 4.2 kilometer on an average but for complicated cases or for better health facilities they have to go to 55.5 kilometer on an average. Upgraded health facilities need to be provided in the local PHC and CHC as the government hospital is quite far away.

Educational institution

The nearest high school is at an average distance of 2 kilometers from the villages surveyed. There are four villages in the sample where they have a presence of a high school in the village. The farthest distance from the villages surveyed to nearest high school is five kilometers. It is seen that most of the villages have a fair accessibility to high schools.

Bank and post office

The nearest bank branch and Post office are situated at a distance of 5 kilometer and 1 kilometer respectively on an average from the villages surveyed. It shows better accessibility of villages from the nearest banking institution.

Population

The villages surveyed have an average of 262 households, which is more than average household in villages of Orissa. The average number of households in a village in Orissa is 192 household³ per village. The Khaira village under Nuapada district has the highest house hold size of 482 house hold out of all the villages surveyed. If we see the voters list the number of female voter is less than half of the total voters. All the villages have presence of Scheduled Caste families. The average scheduled caste households in the surveyed villages is 47 which is more than 20% of the total households of the village. There are six villages in the sample which have no scheduled tribe population/ households. However the average number of ST households is more than 60 households per village in the surveyed villages. Only two villages are inhabited by Muslims out of all the survey villages. None of the villages surveyed had any PTG household.

Hamlets

The surveyed villages consist of on an average 3 hamlets. The size of hamlets varies from 4 households to 462 households.

Ration cards

If we analyze the number of ration cards in the village it was found that average numbers of ration cards per village is 239 cards. That means on an average 91% of the household have ration cards. In six villages it was found that number of ration cards is more than the total numbers of households in the village. It was also found that in as many as 21 villages the number of ration cards is equal to the number of households. The details related to ration cards and PDS will be discussed in the fourth chapter.

³ As per 2001 population census, for more information please visit <http://censusindia.gov.in/>

Roads and electricity

Out of 40 villages 35 villages have pucca road connectivity and only 5 are connected through Kachha roads. This shows that most of the sample villages have better connectivity. Except two villages all the sample villages have electricity. It shows that most of the sample villages have basic connectivity and basic amenities like electricity.

School

Out of forty sample villages 11 villages have two schools, one village has four schools and in rest of the 28 villages there is only one primary school. It is good to see that each sample village has at least one primary school. There are four sample villages having one high school in it. Rests of the schools are upper primary schools having highest class till 7th class. It will be discussed in detail in the 3rd chapter dealing with the mid day meal scheme.

Anganwadi center

As many as 13 sample villages have two AWCs per village. Rest of the villages has one AWC per village. It will be discussed in detail in the second chapter dealing with integrated Child Development Scheme.

2. Integrated Child Development Services:

2.1. Introduction:

The integrated child development services scheme popularly known as ICDS is the only scheme that addresses the complexities of issues relating to the children under six. It also caters the health and nutrition requirements of pregnant and lactating mothers as well as adolescent girls. It is the largest such scheme of its type in the world. It is a complex scheme both in terms of the range of services it offers and diverse and complex objectives it seeks to achieve.

The scheme was initially started in the year 1975 on a pilot basis with the following objectives.

- To improve the nutritional and health status of the children below the age of six years
- To lay the foundation for the proper psychological, physical and social development of the child
- To reduce the incidence of mortality, morbidity, malnutrition and school dropouts
- To achieve effective coordination of policy and implementation among various departments to promote child development
- To enhance the capability of mother to look after the normal health, nutritional and developmental needs of the child through proper community education

It provides a range of services which are very vital for child development. The six services covered under the ICDS programme are

1. Supplementary nutrition
2. Immunization
3. Preschool education
4. Referral services
5. Nutrition and health Counseling
6. Health check ups

The ICDS Scheme has been in focus in the recent past, in policy and civil society discussion especially after the results of recent National Family Health Survey (NFHS-3) which showed that 46% of the children in the country are underweight. Even more worrying is the fact that there has been almost no improvement in this figure since 1998-99 when the previous NFHS survey was undertaken which found that 47% of the children were underweight. Such poor performance in improving health status of the children in the country called for a rapid improvement in the ICDS scheme both in terms of expanding coverage and enhancing quality.

As per NFHS-3 the nutritional status of children under 3 years of age in Orissa is as follows: 43.9% children are stunted, 23.7 % children are wasted and 39.5 % children are underweight. Though the status is slightly better than the all India average the level of under-nutrition in the state is still very poor. Further, in terms of wasting which represents acute malnutrition, Orissa's figure is higher than the national average.

2.2. The Supreme Courts Orders on ICDS scheme

Since 2001, the Supreme Court has passed many significant orders in relation to the ICDS. Most importantly, through the orders of the Court the services of the ICDS have become legal entitlements for all children under six, all pregnant and lactating mothers and all adolescent girls.

Supreme Court's Order on ICDS scheme

Order dated 28 November 2001:

- Each child up to 6 years of age is to get 300 calories and 8-10 grams of protein.
- Each adolescent girl to get 500 calories and 20-25 grams of protein.
- Each pregnant woman and each nursing mother to get 500 calories and 20-25 grams of protein.
- Each malnourished child to get 600 calories and 16-20 grams of protein.
- Every settlement is to have a disbursement centre [Anganwadi].

Order dated 29 April 2004

- All 0-6 years children, adolescent girls and pregnant and nursing mother shall receive supplementary nutrition for 300 days a year.

Order dated 7 October 2004

- The number of Anganwadi shall be increasing from 6 to 14 lakhs.
- The minimum provision for supplementary nutrition to child shall be increased to Rs 2/- per child per day.
- All sanctioned Anganwadi shall be operationalised immediately.
- All SC/ST hamlets shall have Anganwadi as early as possible and the hamlets having high SC/ST population shall receive priority in the placement of new Anganwadis.
- All slums shall have Anganwadis.
- Contractor shall not be used for supply of supplementary nutrition.
- The local women self help groups and Mahila mandals should be encouraged to supply supplementary food distributed in the Anganwadis. They can purchase, prepare food

locally and supervise the distribution.

- The central government states/ UTs shall ensure that all amount allocated should be sanctioned on time so there is no disruption of feeding of children.
- All state governments/UTs should put on their websites the full data for the ICDS programme including where AWC are operational, the numbers of beneficiaries category wise and fund allocated and used and related matters.

Order dated 13 December 2006

- The government shall sanction and operationalise a minimum 14 lakhs Anganwadis.
- All SC/ST hamlets to be identified and given Anganwadi on a priority basis.
- Rural and slum communities with at least 40 children under six are entitled to an “Anganwadi on demand”.
- Universalisation of ICDS involves extending all ICDS services to every child under six.
- At least Rs. 2/- per child per day must be allocated and spent on supplementary nutrition.

Order dated 22 April 2009

- Children in the age group of 6 months to 3 years must be entitled to food supplement of 500 calorie of energy and 12-15 gm of protein per child per day in the form of take home ration (THR).
- For the age group of 3-6 years, food supplement of 500 calories of energy and 12-15 gm of protein per child must be made available at the Anganwadi Centres in the form of a hot cooked meal and a morning snack.
- For severely underweight children in the age group of 6 months to 6 years, an additional 300 calories of energy and 8-10 gm of protein would be given as THR.
- For pregnant and lactating mothers, a food supplement of 600 calories of energy and 18-20 gm of protein per beneficiary per day would be provided as THR.
- Provide supplementary nutrition- in the form of a morning snack and a hot cooked meal to the children in the age group of 3 to 6 years.

Source: Dreze, Jean and Yamini Jaishankar (2005), ‘Supreme Court Orders on the Right to Food: A Tool for Action’, Delhi: Right to Food Campaign Secretariat.

2.3. ICDS in Orissa

The pilot ICDS programme was launched during 1975 in Subdega Block of Sundergarh district and it has since been extended to 314 blocks of the state and 12 urban local bodies. As per Government records there are 60,918 Anganwadi centres and 10,216 Mini Anganwadi centres operating in the state of Orissa. The Anganwadi centres are spread across 326 projects out of which 196 are rural, 118 are tribal and 12 are urban projects.

Coverage of ICDS

After the Supreme Court's intervention and orders making the ICDS universal (to reach the target of 14 lakhs AWCs across the country) new Anganwadis have been sanctioned. At present 71134 Anganwadi (including Mini-Anganwadis) have been sanctioned in the state, however the newly sanctioned Anganwadis are yet to be functional after more than one year of sanction. As per the Govt. records there are 19149 Anganwadi centres that are sanctioned but yet to be made operational. It is expected that all the Anganwadis (including Mini-Anganwadis) are providing all the six critical services to the beneficiaries. The following table shows the total number of Anganwadis in the state.

2.4. Status of Anganwadis in Orissa:

Date and year of sanction	Mini – Anganwadis	Anganwadis
Existing as on 2004	1708	34201
24.08.2005	0	3279
20.12.2006	3111	4217
11.12.2008	5397	19221
TOTAL	10216	60918

During the study it was found that the earlier tagged / periphery villages / hamlets are now sanctioned with either a new Anganwadi or a Mini-Anganwadi. Similarly big villages / hamlets have been sanctioned additional Anganwadi. This has been done according to the revised population norms for setting up of anganwadis which now provides for one anganwadi centre per 800 population as against the earlier norm of one AWC per 1000 population.

2.5. Survey Details:

Table-2.1. Sample covered in the survey

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of Anganwadi Centers covered	No. of Anganwadis located in SC/ST Mohallas	No. of FGDs conducted where ICDS was discussed
Nuapada	10	13	6	13
Kandhamal	10	10	8	15
Balasore	10	13	6	10
Gajapati	10	16	6	15
Overall	40	52	26	53

(Source-Field Survey)

In the 40 survey villages, there were 52 Anganwadi centers. Out of the 52, 30 centers are running in their own (govt.) building and the rest do not have their own building. Of the districts included in the survey, the coastal district of Balasore is the worst in terms of infrastructure with only one out of the 13 anganwadi centres visited having its own building. On the other hand in case of Kandhamal district, only one out of the 10 AWCs surveyed does not have its own building.

Table-2.2. Quality of buildings in which Anganwadi Centers are housed

District	Anganwadis housed in government buildings		Number of anganwadis that are in:		
	Number	Percent	Pakka	Kachcha	Semi-Pakka
Nuapada	9	69.2	8	2	3
Kandhamal	9	90.0	2	0	7
Balasore	1*	0.0	6	6	1
Gajapati	11	75.0	11	1	4
Overall	30	57.7	28	9	14

(Source-Field Survey)

* There are seven AWCs using one class room of primary school and one AWC run in an open place.

Out of 22 AWCs which are not functioning in a government building only 3 building pay rent for the space they occupy and the rest 19 don't pay any rent. Most anganwadi centres that are not based in government owned buildings, function out of the houses of anganwadi worker or helper. In some places it is also functioning in the community center in the village.

Out of the 52 AWCs surveyed only 28 AWCs are functioning in Pucca buildings, 9 in Kutcha buildings, 14 in semi-pakka buildings and one does not have any building and functions in an open space. The AWC which functions in the open is the Gamandi AWC under Raikia block of Kandhamal district.

The state level information (as on 30.11.2009) shows that, out of 71134 sanctioned Anganwadis the state govt. has the information about only 48824 Anganwadis. As per record of the implementing agency only one third of the Anganwadis in the state are running in government buildings. If we take the overall (sanctioned) Anganwadis the percentage of Anganwadis running out of its own building will further dip down to 22.5%.

Table-2.3. Facilities in Anganwadi Centers

Facilities/District	Number of anganwadis where the following facilities are available		Number of anganwadis where these are working:	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Weighing scaling for children:				
Nuapada	13	100	12	92.3
Kandhamal	10	100	10	100
Balasore	11	84.6	8	61.53
Gajapati	15	93.8	12	75.00
Total	49	94.2	42	80.76
Toys for children				
Nuapada	13	100	12	92.3
Kandhamal	5	50.0	1	10.0

Balasore	11	84.6	6	46.15
Gajapati	15	938	15	93.75
Total	44	84.6	34	65.38
Medicine Kit				
Nuapada	3	23.1	3	23.07
Kandhamal	5	50.0	5	50
Balasore	0	0	0	0
Gajapati	10	76.9	7	43.75
Total	18	34.6	15	28.84
Drinking Water				
Nuapada	10	76.9	7	53.84
Kandhamal	10	100	7	70.0
Balasore	9	69.2	8	61.53
Gajapati	11	68.7	9	56.25
Total	40	76.9	31	59.61
Cooking facilities				
Nuapada	9	69.2	9	69.23
Kandhamal	7	70.0	7	70
Balasore	6	46.1	4	30.76
Gajapati	8	50.0	7	43.75
Total	30	57.7	27	51.92
Toilet Facilities				
Nuapada	10	76.9	5	38.46

Kandhamal	7	70.0	2	20
Balasore	2	15.4	1	7.69
Gajapati	9	56.2	6	37.5
Total	28	53.8	14	26.92

(Source-Field Survey)

For an AWC to function properly few basic equipments and services, as listed in the table above, need to be available at the center itself. Through visits to the anganwadi centres, the survey tried to find out the availability of equipment like weighing machines, Toys, Medicine Kit and basic facilities like Drinking water facilities and cooking facilities etc. at the anganwadi centre. It was found that out of the 52 AWCs surveyed, 49 have weighing machine (out of which in 7 are non functional). 44 of the AWCs have toys (out of which in 10 they are non functional) and 18 AWC have been provided with medicine kits (but in 3 these are non functional). Similarly 40 AWCs have drinking water facilities and 30 have their own cooking shed but in 9 centres the drinking water facility and in 3 the cooking sheds are in a non functional state.

Table-2.4. Pre-School activities in Anganwadi Centers

District	Average Number of children present during visit	Av.no. of children attending pre-school as reported by FGD	Number of centres where pre-school activities were being conducted during visit:		Number of centres where pre-school activities are conducted regularly according to FGD:	
			Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	7	11	4	30.8	2	15.4
Kandhamal	9.4	7.3	5	50.0	9	90.0
Balasore	13.5	16	1	7.7	2	3.8
Gajapati	8	11.4	10	76.9	12	75.0
Total	9.4	11.1	20	38.5	25	48.1

(Source-Field Survey)

Pre-school for the three-to six years old children in the Anganwadi is directed towards providing and ensuring a natural, joyful and stimulating environment, with emphasis on necessary inputs for optimal growth and development. The early learning component of the ICDS is a significant

input for providing a sound foundation for cumulative lifelong learning and development. It also contributes to the universalisation of primary education, by providing the child the necessary preparation for primary schooling and offering substitute care to younger siblings, thus freeing the older ones – especially girls – to attend school.

Non formal pre-school is an important component of the ICDS Scheme which covers the children in the age group of three to six years. Pre-school education is conducted in the Anganwadi Centre with the pre-school kit, colorful wall paintings and through play methods. For organising the pre-school Anganwadi Workers are supposed to undertake four months training.

As per the Supreme Court directions AWCS shall supply nutritious food / supplement to the children, adolescent girls and pregnant and lactating mothers under ICDS for 300 days in a year. So, on an average Anganwadi should remain open 25 days in a month.

On visits to 52 anganwadi centres during the survey (the visits were unannounced, on a working day and at a time when the anganwadi was supposed to be open) the average number of children present in the centres was only around 10 and out of the 52AWCs, in only 20 Anganwadi Centers were any preschool activities being conducted. According to discussions with the community as well through the FGDs, in about half (25 FGD responses) the people responded saying that pre-school activities are conducted regularly at the anganwadi centre.

Table-2.5. Coverage of Children:

District	Percent of children in the village enrolled and being given SNP according to AW registers			Average number of children enrolled for SNP
	0-6months old (lactating mothers)	6 months to 3 years old	3 years to 6 years old	
Nuapada	100.0	89.5	89.8	110.2
Kandhamal	100.0	100.0	78.6	62.2
Balasore	100.0	100.0	77.2	88.7
Gajapati	98.5	89.2	69.2	61.7
Total	99.6	93.6	79.3	80.7

(Source-Field Survey)

The team had to rely on the records of the AWC to find out the number of children in the village and the number of children enrolled in the AWC.

As per the AWC register in the age group of 0 to 6 months 452 (99.6 %) out of 454 children are enrolled in the AWC. In the 6 months to 3 years age group 2019 (93.60 %) out of 2157 children are enrolled in the AWC. In the 3 to 6 years of age group 1724 (79.3 %) out of 2174 children are enrolled in the AWC. The reason that was given for lower enrollment in the 3 to 6 years age group or the preschool period was that they enrol in the primary school at an early age. The average number of children per centre who are shown as getting SNP is 80.7%. The data supplied by the AWWs are not convincing as it came out in 20 FGDs that the distribution of SNP is being disrupted on a regular basis. The children from the tagged villages (which do not have an AWC) are left out in most of the cases. However, it could not be verified as the team had to rely on the records of anganwadi workers.

Table-2.6. Caste discrimination

District	Number of anganwadis visited	Number of these in upper caste mohallas	No. of upper caste mohallas where dalit children:			Number of anganwadis that investigators felt is equally accessible to all castes	No. of anganwadi workers who belonged to SC/ST communities*
			Attend AWC	Don't attend as there is separate AW in dalit mohalla	There is no separate anganwadi but still they don't come		
Nuapada	13	7	6	1	0	8	2
Kandhamal	10	2	1	1	0	8	7
Balasore	13	7	6	1	0	12	2
Gajapati	16	10	10	0	0	15	4
Total	52	26	23	3	0	43	15

(Source-Field Survey)

Half the AWCs visited are situated in upper caste mohallas. However the research team did not find any such mohalla where children don't go to the AWCs of upper caste mohalla despite non availability of centers in their dalit mohallas. The investigators have also felt that out of 52 AWCs, 43 are equally accessible to all castes. The proportion of AWW from SC/ST communities is very low even in SC/ST dominated districts like Nuapada and Gajapati.

Table-2.7. Frequency of opening of Anganwadi Centre

District	Average no. of days anganwadi centre was open in a month according to attendance register	Average no. of days anganwadi centre was open during the last month according to responses of the community from FGD
Nuapada	24.8	18.3
Kandhamal	22.6	18.5
Balasore	23.6	20.0
Gajapati	22.0	22.0
Total	23.2	19.7

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the norm the Anganwadi center should open 25 days a month. The average number of days for opening of AWCs is 23.2 as per their attendance register and less than 20 days as per FGD responses.

2.8. Supplementary Nutrition Programme

Pregnant and nursing mothers and children within the age group 6 months to 6 years are supposed to be provided with a supplementary nutrition support under the scheme for 300 days a year. The government of Orissa has recently revised the cost norm under supplementary nutrition programme in line with the new guidelines of the Ministry of Women and Child development, Government of India.

The cost norms for the SNP is

Beneficiaries	Present Rates With effect from 3.9.09	Proposed calories	Proposed protein
(i) Children (6 months to 72 months)	Rs.4.00 per child/ per day.	500	12-15

(ii) Severely malnourished Children (6 months-72 months)	Rs.6.00 per child/ per day.	800	20-25
(iii) Pregnant women and Nursing mothers / Adolescent Girls (under KSY).	Rs.5.00 per beneficiary per day.	600	18-20

2.8. a. Kind of SNP Given:

Category	Supplementary Nutrition: Total number of Centres providing:					
	Uncooked Chattua	RTE mix	Dry rations (rice, dal, etc.)	Chana/peanuts	Cooked food (khichdi, etc.)	Other
under 3	5	5	43	0	9	11
3-6 years	5	5	4	0	48	6
Pregnant/ Lactating mothers	5	2	52	7	0	0
Adolescent girls	0	0	0	0	0	0

(Source-Field Survey)

The Pregnant and lactating mother are provided with 190 gms of rice and 30 gms of dal per day for 25 days in a month. As per the revised norm they also get micro nutrition fortified RTU of Rs 0.65 per day and soya chunk of Rs 0.90 per day for 25 days in month. However if go through the data, only seven beneficiaries have received fortified RTU along with rice and dal. The children below 3 years of age should receive 80 gms of rice and 30 gms of dal as take home ration. As per the revised guidelines of the state, they should also get micronutrient fortified RTU of Rs 0.90 per day for 25 days a month.

As per the information provided by the AWW uncooked Chhatua and RTE has been distributed from October 2009 under the provision of snacks in 5 AWCs in Gajapati distict. Out of 52 AWCs dry ration in 43 AWCs to under-3 children, in 4 AWCs to 3-6 years children and in 52 AWCs to Pregnant & Lactating mothers is being provided (rice and dal as dry ration). In 7 AWCs of Balasore district 200-250 gram Buta is being distributed from October 2009 under snacks to pregnant & lactating mother. Cooked food for under-3 children is being given in 9 AWCs and for 3-6 year old children cooked food is being given in 48 AWCs. Similarly 2-3 pieces of biscuits are also being distributed in 11 AWCs for under-3 children and 6 AWCs for 3-6 years of children in Balasore district under snacks.

2.8. b. Regularity in distribution of SNP

District	Number of centres where AWW reported that SNP was distributed without disruption in the last 3 months		Av. No. of days of disruption according to AWW in centres where there was disruption	Responses from FGD		
	Number	Percent		No. of anganwadis where SNP for under 3 was regular in the last one month	No. of anganwadis where SNP for 3 to 6 was regular in the last one month	No. of anganwadis where quality of food was reported to be good
Nuapada	1	7.7	47	4	2	1
Kandhamal	3	30.0	44	6	6	3
Balasore	7	5.4	19	6	6	4
Gajapati	15	93.7	60	14	12	7
Total	26	50.0	40	30	26	15

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the data in 26 out of 52 AWCs the distribution of SNP is irregular in supply which is 50 percent of the total centers visited. In the 26 centers where supply of SNP is irregular, this is due to unavailability of stock at the center. If we see the irregularity of supply as per the table then the average number of days of disruption is 40 in these 26 AWCs. Out of 53, 30 FGD responses for under-3 children and 26 FGD responses for 3-6 children agreed on regular supply in the last month and 15 FGD it was agreed that food distributed is of good quality.

Growth Monitoring and Care of Severely Malnourished Children

2.9a. Weighing in Anganwadi Centers:

District	Number of AWWs where children were weighed in the last three months	Number of AWWs where grading was done in the last three months according to	Number of AWCs where weighing was done in the last 3 months according to	Number of Centres where FGD participants said parents were informed about

	according to AWW	AWW	FGD	the growth monitoring
Nuapada	13	13	9	5
Kandhamal	9 *	8	9	9
Balasore	13	13	6	6
Gajapati	16	16	15	14
Total	51	50	40	35

(Source-Field Survey)

* Last time the weight measurement is being taken in June 2009 in Sugudabadi AWC under Raikia block in Kandhamal district.

Each month the AWW is suppose to take weight of all the children enrolled in the center. It helps to find out the nutrition status of the children. They should communicate the weight of the child and its grade to the parents/mother of child. According to AWWs except one all 51 centres had carried out weighing and growth monitoring of children. But according to the FGD responses only in 40 FGDs did people say that weighing was taking place and a fewer number, 35, said that parents are informed about the growth monitoring (out of 53 FGDs).

2.9b. Grade III and Grade IV children:

District	No. of Grade III & Grade IV children identified by AWCs	No. of Grade III & Grade IV children visited by survey team	No. of families where nutrition counseling was given	No. of children who received extra rations	No. of children who were referred to a health centre
Nuapada	17	17	6	1	13
Kandhamal	4	4	2	2	2
Balasore	14	14	7	2	12
Gajapati	9	9	9	5	8
Total	45	45	24	10	35

(Source-Field Survey)

During the survey the teams tried to find out the nutrition status of all the children enrolled in the AWC. The total number of grade III & IV children identified by the anganwadi workers in these 40 villages is 45. The survey teams have visited all these households. The figure is slightly more

in Nuapada and Balasore districts. Children who are identified as being Grade III or Grade IV malnourished are supposed to be referred to the health centre, receive double rations and the parents of these families are to be given nutrition and health counseling. Out of 45 malnourished children visited only 24 families had been given any nutrition counseling, only 10 are being provided extra rations and 35 children were referred to a health centre. The data shows that services to severely malnourished children being worse in Nuapada district as out of 17 grade III and grade IV children only 6 got nutrition counseling and only one child got extra rations. However 13 children were referred to health center. In case of services to severely malnourished children, Gajapati district seemed to be performing well. However, it must also be noted that it is very likely that the number of severely malnourished children in these villages are much higher and they have not been identified. Comparing with the high level of malnutrition in the state according to the NFHS-3 it is hard to believe that on an average there are only 1 or 2 children in each village who are Grade III or Grade IV malnourished.

2.10. Health and nutrition Counseling

District	Number of FGDs where the community responded the following:		
	Anganwadi worker holds meetings for mothers	Anganwadi worker makes home visits	Anganwadi worker comes regularly
Nuapada	3	1	4
Kandhamal	10	3	10
Balasore	4	0	3
Gajapati	11	6	14
Total	28	10	31

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the 53 FGD responses, it came out in 28 FGDs that AWW holds meeting with the mothers, in only 10 FGDs it was agreed that the AWW goes for home visits and it came out in 31 FGDs that AWW comes to the center regularly.

2.11. Disability Survey:

District	Number of Centres where any disabled children were present during the visit:	Number of Centres where disability survey was conducted in the last	Number of Centres where disability survey was NEVER conducted

			one year			
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	0	0	12	92.3	1	7.7
Kandhamal	0	0	4	40.0	6	60.0
Balasore	1	7.7	9	69.2	4	30.8
Gajapati	0	0	14	12.5	2	87.5
Total	1	1.9	39	75.0	13	25.0

(Source-Field Survey)

From all the AWCs surveyed the team could find only one disabled child present in one ICDS center in Balasore district. All the AWWs are supposed to conduct a disability survey in the area under the respective Anganwadi center. As per the data 39 AWWs (75%) said that they have undertaken the survey and 13 AWWs (25 %) said that they did not undertake the survey.

2.12. Visit of supervisor and health worker

District	Average no. of visits by supervisor per centre in the last 12 months:	Average no. of visits by health worker per centre in the last 12 months:
Nuapada	11.5	17.9
Kandhamal	4.7	16.1
Balasore	1.2	7.7
Gajapati	8.2	13.2
Total	6.6	13.6

(Source-Field Survey)

The role of Supervisor is very critical, as she provides on the job guidance to the AWW that bridges the gap between the training and job requirement. The Supervisor is supposed to visit every AWC once a month and she is supposed to stay a night in a far away AWC once every week. As per the survey (the 'visit' registers were checked to verify the dates of visits of the supervisors) average number of visits by a supervisor in the last 12 months is 6.6 times and a health worker is 13.6 times in a year. The number of visits by the supervisor is very low in Balasore district.

The ANM is the link between the health department and the functioning of Anganwadi center; they are supposed to visit once a month to each center to administer immunization programme and other health aspects of the center jointly with the Anganwadi worker.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The findings of the survey show that the ICDS scheme is not functioning at its optimal level in the state. In many places the anganwadi centres are being run only feeding centers without preschool teaching, nutritional counseling, health education and other services. The infrastructure facilities are quite poor, also it lacks basic requirements like toys, medicine kits and toilets facilities etc. It was also seen that the distribution of SNP is not regular and the awareness level among the beneficiaries regarding the SNP is very low. The survey also reflects that the motivation level among the AWWs is quite low which is another reason the scheme is not able to perform upto its mark. The following are some recommendations for effective implementation of the scheme:

1. All the AWCs need to have their own pucca building with adequate infrastructural facilities like toilet, toys, weighing machine, medicine kit etc. The ICDS in Orissa fairing poor in these aspects as only 57% AWCs run in their own building and only 53.8% of them are pucca building, only 50% of them have a functional toilet , 57.7% have cooking facility and 34.6% AWCs have medicine kit. For effective implementation of ICDS in the state, putting the infrastructure in place would be highly recommended. Infrastructure includes, AWC building, playing, teaching and learning materials, adequate staff to ensure all services reaching all the beneficiaries. It is recommended that Govt. should take adequate measures, also fund is allocated to ensure basic infrastructure in place to provide the entitlements to the beneficiaries.
2. The Pre School was functioning in only 38.5% of all the anganwadis surveyed and only 9 children in an average present during the survey. As non formal pre school education is one of the important service under ICDS scheme therefore regular pre school need to be ensured with regular supervision by the supervisors and CDPOs with strict instruction being issued to AWWs for regular opening up the center.
3. Location of the Anganwadi is important in terms of access of ST (PTG), SC and minorities. So new Anganwadis should be located in the community itself.
4. It is not sure whether all the SC and ST and minorities habitation has been covered under ICDS. It is advisable that as per the direction of the Supreme Court of India dated 13 December 2006, priority should be given to "Anganwadi on demand" to cover the SC and ST habitation in the state.
5. It has been reported that there is regular disruption of supply of food grain in half of the centers surveyed, it also came out that the average disruption is 40days. The principal reasons for disruption is non supply of food grain from the CDPO or from district level

which was done in a centralized manner. It completely violates the letter and spirit of supreme courts order which ask for complete decentralization of food grain procurement and regular distribution at the anganwadi center. The regular distribution of SNP at the centers need to be ensured with decentralized procurement and distribution of food grain with out involvement of contractors.

6. The supply of the food grain to the beneficiaries should be regular and as per the stipulated amount.
7. More emphasis should be given to the capacity building of AWWs and AWHs. More importantly the Supervisors have to be more accountable to impart on-going monitoring and training to the AWW and AWH
8. Fund for managing AWC should be regular and rational. The fund meant for AWC towards condiments and fuel wood should be released on a monthly basis, and in case of delay the project and sector officials should be made accountable.
9. There is urgent need for awareness generation of the beneficiaries about their entitlements under ICDS.
10. The disable children were almost invisible in the anganwadi centers during the survey. Only one disable children was present in all 52 anganwadis surveyed. As per the records disability survey was not undertaken 25% of all the centers. Therefore proper survey should be done at a regular basis to identify the children with disability as they are most vulnerable among all the children. The anganwadi workers should be motivated not only to identify and give them stipulated amount of SNP but also take initiative to make the disable children intermix and participate with other children.
11. There should be uniform and robust grievance redressal mechanism in place in the state. The complaints that are coming are either not attended or solved without any time frame. So web based grievance redressal mechanism along with toll free number at the district and state level would help in this regard. However, effort should be made to take the grievance redressal in public domain.

3. Mid Day Meal Scheme

3.1. Introduction

School Mid Day Meal programmes have a long history in India. In 1925, a Mid Day Meal Programme was introduced for disadvantaged children in Madras Municipal Corporation. By the mid 1980s three States viz. Gujarat, Kerala and Tamil Nadu and the UT of Pondicherry had universalized a cooked Mid Day Meal Programme with their own resources for children studying at the primary stage.

With a view to enhancing enrollment, retention and attendance and simultaneously improving nutritional levels among children, the National Programme of Nutritional Support to Primary Education (**NP-NSPE**) was launched as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme on 15th August 1995, initially in 2408 blocks in the country. By the year 1997-98 the NP-NSPE was introduced in all blocks of the country. Following Supreme Court orders in 2001, the Government of India began making a provision for cooking costs for the mid day meal, where as earlier in most states monthly dry rations were distributed in place of a cooked meal. It was further extended in 2002 to cover not only children in classes I-V of government, government aided and local body schools, but also children studying in centres run under the Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) and Alternative and innovative Education (AIE) Scheme. It has been further extended to include the students from the class sixth to class eighth in upper primary schools. The programme was further revised in the year 2004 and 2006 with the following objectives:

- Improving the nutritional status of children in classes' I-V in government, local body and government aided schools and EGS and AIE centres;
- Encouraging poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections, to attend schools more regularly and help them concentrate on class room activities; and
- Providing nutritional support to children of primary stage in drought affected areas during summer vacation.

Today, the NP-NSPE is the world's largest school feeding programme reaching out to about 12 crore children in over 9.50 lakh schools/EGS centers across the country.

3.2. Supreme Court interventions on the Mid Day Meal Scheme

On November 28th, 2001, the Supreme Court of India passed a landmark interim order on the Mid Day Meal Scheme. The order was in a petition (PUCL v. UoI, CWP 196/ 2001), popularly known as the "Right to Food Case". The Supreme Court directed the State governments and Union Territories *"to implement the Mid Day Meal Scheme by providing every child in every Government and Government assisted primary school with a prepared mid day meal with a*

minimum content of 300 calories and 8-12 grams of protein each day of school for a minimum of 200 days”.

This interim order has made the mid day meal a legal entitlement of every child in India attending a Government or Government aided primary school. The Supreme Court has also subsequently passed a series of interim orders given below (extracted from the Primer on the Mid Day Meal Scheme developed by the Right to Food Campaign):

Supreme Court Interim Orders on Mid Day Meals:

The Supreme Court has been issuing “interim orders” on midday meals from time to time, starting with the landmark order of 28 November 2001. The key orders are summarized below.

Basic entitlement: “**Every child in every government and government-assisted primary school should be given a prepared midday meal; with a minimum content of 300 calories and 8-12 grams of protein each day of school; for a minimum of 200 days a year.**” (*Order dated 28 November 2001*)

No charges: “The conversion costs for a cooked meal, under no circumstances, shall be recovered from the children or their parents.” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*) **Central assistance:** “The Central Government... shall also allocate funds to meet with the conversion costs of food-grains into cooked midday meals.” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*)

Kitchen sheds: “**The Central Government shall make provisions for construction of kitchen sheds.**” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*)

Priority to Dalit cooks: “**In appointment of cooks and helpers, preference shall be given to Dalits, Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.**” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*)

Quality safeguards: “*Attempts shall be made for better infrastructure, improved facilities (safe drinking water etc.), closer monitoring (regular inspection etc.) and other quality safeguards as also the improvement of the contents of the meal so as to provide nutritious meal to the children of the primary schools.*” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*)

Summer holidays: “In drought affected areas, midday meals shall be supplied even during summer vacations.” (*Order dated 20 April 2004*)

Joint quality monitoring: “*We direct the Union of India and the FCI to ensure provision of fair average quality grain for the Scheme on time. The States/UTs and the FCI are directed to do joint inspection of food grains. If the food grain is found, on joint inspection, not to be of fair average quality, it will be replaced by the FCI prior to lifting.*” (*Order dated 28 May 2001*)

3.3. Mid day meal in Orissa

The Mid-Day-Meal Programme was introduced in the year 1995 in Orissa to provide a cooked noon meal to primary school children of all Government and Government-aided Schools studying in Class I to V all over the State for about 210 working days in a year. The scheme aims at increasing the enrolment and reducing the number of school dropouts while also improving the nutritional status of the children. However, during 2001-2002, w.e.f. the 1st of July 2001, it was decided to provide a cooked meal to the primary school children in all Govt. and Govt.-aided primary school children only in the rural areas of the 8 KBK districts (80 Blocks including 44 ITDA Blocks) and in 74 ITDA Blocks of the Non-KBK districts. Thus, cooked food under the MDM Programme was being provided only in the KBK districts and the ITDA Blocks. As regards the other districts of the State, dry ration, @ 3 kgs. of rice per beneficiary per month was being supplied. During the year 2002-03, the cooked meal system under the MDM Programme was also extended to the primary school children in the backward district of Boudh, w.e.f. 01.04.2002. Thus, 157 Blocks out of the 314 Blocks in the State were covered under the 'dry ration system' till 31.08.2004.

As per directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court cooked meal at noon time is being provided to all students of all the Govt./Govt.-aided Primary Schools, EGS & AIE Centers w.e.f 01.09.2004.

As per information supplied by Dept. of Women and Child development Dept., Govt. of Orissa in the year 2007-08, MDM scheme covers 53,026 schools in the state. Presently, the Govt. of Orissa has extended MDM scheme up to the upper primary schools in the state with provision of 150 gram of food grain per child per day. Women and Child Development Dept. is the nodal dept. for implementing the scheme. While District Social welfare Officer is responsible for ensuring proper implementation of the scheme at district level, Social Educational officer (SEO) is the nodal officer at Block level to monitor the implementation of the same. Earlier, MDM was managed by the Headmaster of the Schools. Now Govt. has started delivering responsibility to women SHGs for management of MDM in the state. Currently, women SHGs manage MDM in 33, 210 schools. As per Govt. report (2007-08), provision of drinking water has been made available in 45,881 out of 53,026 schools. It means 17% of schools are still devoid of drinking water. Similarly, cooking shed has been completed in only 16, 758 schools (31.65%)

Survey Details:

The team made unannounced visits to all the government and government added school in all the 40 sample villages. The visit was at the time of distribution of mid day meal in the school. The team observed the distribution of mid day meal and the quality and quantity of meal being served. After the meal, the team interacted with the students, teachers, cooks and also interacted with the villagers regarding the functioning of the scheme.

Table-3.1. Sample covered in the survey

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of schools covered				
		Government	Government Assisted	EGS/AIE centres	Other	Total
Nuapada	10	12	0	0	0	12
Kandhamal	10	12	1	0	0	13
Balasore	10	12	0	0	0	12
Gajapati	10	14	0	0	0	14
Total	40	50	1	0	0	51

(Source-Field Survey)

There are 51 schools in the 40 villages surveyed under the study. This included 12 schools in Balasore, 14 in Gajapati, 13 in Kandhamal and 12 schools in Nuapada district. During the survey the team interacted with the students, teachers, cook/helper, the WSHGs responsible for managing the MDM and the village education committees. Focus group discussions were also held with the community. Out of the 51 school one is government assisted school and rest are government schools.

Table-3.2. Coverage

District	No. of schools where MDMS was not served on the day of the visit		Number of FGDs where community reported that hot cooked meal is served in school	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	2	16.7	13	100.0
Kandhamal	2	15.4	15	100.0
Balasore	7	58.3	10	100.0
Gajapati	1	7.1	15	100.0
Total	12	23.5	53	100.0

(Source-Field Survey)

Although in all the FGDs, members of the community reported that a hot cooked meal was served in the school, on the basis of an unannounced visit made to the school as part of the survey, it was seen that the mid day meal is probably not every regular. In 12(23.5 %) out of the 50 schools visited MDM was not being served on the day of the visit by the survey team. Out of these 12, in 2 schools in Nuapada district and 2 schools in Kandhamal district the meal was not being cooked due to non availability of stock. In the remaining 8 schools the reasons given for not cooking MDM were absence of Cook/Helper, Half yearly examination and low attendance.

Table-3.3. Facilities for MDM in the school

District	Drinking water		Cooking shed		Plates		Utensils	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	12	100.0	12	100.0	0	0	12	100.0
Kandhamal	10	76.9	7	53.8	0	0	13	100.0
Balasore	12	100.0	3	25.0	1	8.3	9	75.0
Gajapati	12	85.7	10	71.4	2	14.3	14	100.0
Total	46	90.2	32	62.7	3	5.9	48	94.1

(Source-Field Survey)

Providing a hygienic and nutritious meal also requires proper infrastructure like kitchen, store, containers, utensils, plates, source of clean drinking water etc. The guidelines of the mid day meal scheme (2006) envisages the provision of assistance to construct kitchen-cum-store in a phased manner up to a maximum of Rs. 60,000/- per unit and an assistance Rs. 5,000/- per school for provisioning and replacement of kitchen devices.

a. Drinking water facility:

Out of 51 schools surveyed 46 schools have drinking water facility and rest five does not. Therefore 90 percent of the schools have drinking water facility. The schools which have drinking water facility mostly have tube wells.

b. Kitchen shade:

As per the information, 32 out of 51 schools have kitchen shades rest of the schools do not. It was found during the survey that most the school which have kitchen shades are not cleaned properly and in rest of the schools the MDM is cooked in an open space which quite unhygienic. There was a district-wise variation in this, with all the schools in Nuapada having a kitchen shed and only 3 out of the 12 schools visited in Balasore having a kitchen shed.

c. Provision of plates:

In only 3 schools plates are provided to the children by the school itself and in rest of the schools the students bring their own plates during lunch.

d. Cooking utensils:

The cooking utensils are provided by the government to the school. Except three schools, all schools have cooking equipments. MDM is not being cooked in the school where there are no cooking equipments. Most of the cooking equipments have become out dated and need immediate replacement.

Table-3.4. Fuel used for cooking:

District	No. of schools where food is cooking in the school		LPG		Kerosene		Wood		Other	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Nuapada	12	100	0	0	0	0	12	100	0	0
Kandhamal	13	100	0	0	0	0	13	100	0	0
Balasore	12	100	0	0	0	0	12	100	0	0
Gajapati	14	100	0	0	0	0	14	100	0	0
Total	51	100	0	0	0	0	51	100	0	0

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the survey all 51 schools are using wood as fuel for cooking the mid-day meal. It is very difficult for the coastal district like Balasore or semi urban areas of other districts to purchase firewood at a high fuel cost. It came out from the discussions with the cooks and the teachers that in a few schools mid day meal was not being cooked for a few days every month because they are unable to meet the high fuel cost.

Table-3.5. Quality of Food Given

District	Quality of grains used in MDM				% schools where same menu is served everyday	% schools where eggs or fruits are given in MDM
	Good (%)	Fair (%)	Poor (%)	Not known (%)		
Nuapada	8.3	41.7	50.0	0	100.0	16.7

Kandhamal	0	100.0	0	0	100.0	53.8
Balasore	25.0	75.0	0	0	83.3	83.3
Gajapati	28.6	28.6	42.6	0	92.9	21.4
Total	15.7	60.8	23.5	0	94.1	43.1

(Source-Field Survey)

The quality of food provided under noon meal is equally important as quantity. However when asked only 15.7 percent of the students think that the quality of food provided is good. The students of 60.8 percent of schools were of the view that the food is average in quality. Students of the remaining 23.5 percent schools think that the quality of food is really poor and not good for consumption. It shows that students from very few schools are satisfied with the quality of food provided to them.

For the children to like the meal, the variety in the food provided is important and makes the meal delicious. The varied menu is also an indication of the quality of the meal provided and the students were asked whether there was a weekly menu for the mid-day meal. As per the students in 48 (94.1 %) out of 51 schools there is no variation in menu and only in three schools they have a variation in menu. The menu followed in most schools is only rice and Dal. In some places it was found that instead of dal they gave dalma (dal added with vegetables) one typical oriya dish. Some children mentioned that they were fed up with the same menu. Many said were satisfied with with the meal but would like the menu to be modified. A few children and parents also said that because the same menu is served every day the children aren't willing to participate in meals regularly. There is provision of egg in the school mid day meal. As per the norm each child is supposed to be provided two eggs every week and here is a budgetary provision for it. However only in 22 (43.1%) out of 51 school the children said that they get eggs as part of the meal in school. The observation of the investigators also matched the opinion of the children in that the quantity was most sufficient but the quality could be greatly improved.

Table-3.6. Regularity of Supplies:

District	Schools where grain reaches on time		SHGs/cooks are usually paid on time	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	4	25.0	0	0.0
Kandhamal	10	76.9	13	100.0
Balasore	8	66.7	0	0.0

Gajapati	14	100.0	6	42.9
Total	36	70.6	19	37.3

(Source-Field Survey)

The rice is supplied by the Food Corporation of India and dal is supplied by a contractor appointed by the district collector. The food grain needs to reach the school in time for MDM to continue without any disruption. The cook/helper and the school teachers were asked about the regularity in the supply of grains for the mid day meal and according to them in 36 (70.59%) schools it is regular while in the remaining 30 percent schools the supply is irregular. The schools where there is a delay in the supply of grains also are likely to see a disruption in MDM when they run out of supply.

As per the norm one cook and one helper are appointed in each school. They are responsible for preparing the MDM, distributing food to the children and washing the cooking utensils and other related tasks. The cook and helper were being paid Rs 200 and Rs 100 respectively. The cook and helper need to be paid regularly and timely for smooth conduct of the mid day meal. As per the recent guidelines issued by the government of Orissa dated 12.01.2010, the cook and helper will get a monthly honorarium of Rs 600 and Rs 400 respectively. Out of the 51 schools, cook/helper in 19 (37.3 %) schools responded that they get the payment regularly and rest 32 complained about irregular payment.

Table-3.7. Cooks:

District	Who has been given responsibility to cook?		% of female cooks	% cooks from SC/ST communities
	Cooks appointed by school	SHGs		
Nuapada	6	6	98.5	20.0
Kandhamal	3	10	92.0	68.0
Balasore	8	4	100.0	8.3
Gajapati	2	12	100.0	46.4
Total	19	32	97.8	31.7

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the survey out of 51 schools, in 19 schools cooks and helpers are responsible for cooking in the schools and in the rest of the schools the noon meal is being prepared by the SHG responsible for managing the mid day meal programme. According to FGD the role of Gram Sabha in selection of Cook/helper is minimal and it is mostly done by the school staff and

the block officials. In many instances the ICDS officials also played a key role in the selection process.

If we see the gender of the cook or the person responsible for cooking, in 48 out of 51 schools both the cook and helper are female. In only one school both the cook and helper are male and in the remaining two either the cook or the helper is a women. Therefore in almost all the schools the cooks and the helpers were both women.

The Supreme Court of India in its interim order dated 20th April 2004 directed that preference should be given to dalits and tribals in the appointment of cooks and helpers.

In the schools visited during the survey, 31.7 percent cooks belong to SC or ST communities. There is a variation in this among the districts visited. The percent of SC/ST cooks is the lowest in Balasore district (8.3 %). Even in districts like Nuapada and Gajapati which are ST dominated districts, the percent of SC/ST cooks should have been more. Further, it was seen that only in schools that were located in scheduled caste hamlets and where most of the students are from the SC communities, were SC cooks or helpers appointed.

Table-3.8. Caste Discrimination:

District	No. of schools where investigators found evidence of caste discrimination		No. of schools where community reported that children of all castes sit and eat together	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	1	1.3	8	61.5
Kandhamal	1	7.7	13	86.7
Balasore	0	0	10	100.0
Gajapati	2	14.3	12	80.0
Total	4	7.8	43	81.1

(Source-Field Survey)

During the visits by the survey team, caste discrimination was not observed in most of the schools. In 4 out of 51 schools there were reported cases of caste discrimination and in one school while there was some indication it could not be confirmed. However the team did not spend enough time in the schools to actually grasp whether there was any discrimination on the basis of caste and it could be one of the reasons for finding a low prevalence of this. Even in the FGDs, not many reported there being any caste discrimination during the serving of the mid-

day meals in schools. Again, it is well known that different types of research methodology is required to understand discrimination and the present study was not designed specifically towards that. Where there were reported cases of caste discrimination it was mostly of the kind where parents of upper caste children ask them not to take MDM when the food is being prepared by a dalit cook. In one school it was reported that the students sit separately on the basis of caste.

Other Aspects of MDMS

Table-3.9. Supervision & Hygiene

District	No. of schools where MDMS has been inspected by government official in the last one year		No. of schools where child fell ill after consuming MDM in the last 4 weeks	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	8	66.7	0	0
Kandhamal	4	30.8	0	0
Balasore	7	58.3	0	0
Gajapati	9	64.3	0	0
Overall	28	54.9	0	0

(Source-Field Survey)

For proper implementation of the scheme it is the responsibility of the social educational organizer and the school inspectors and other responsible officials to visit the school and inspect the cooking and distribution. As per the teachers, in 28 out of 51 schools some officials had visited the school at least once in the last one year. There were no reported cases of children falling ill after consuming the mid-day meal in the last four weeks. However in most of the schools it was seen that the storage of foodgrains was in quite unhygienic conditions. Further, the dal provided as part of the meal in most of the cases was found to be inedible.

Conclusion and Recommendations:

Major Findings

The mid day meal scheme is one of the better functioning schemes in the state. The team found that 75% of all the schools were distributing meal during the time of visit. In almost all FGDs, it was informed that hot meal is distributed in the schools on most of the working days. However there are still many issues which need to be looked into for effective implementation of the scheme. There are 37.8% schools which still do not have cooking facility. It was also observed that in 23.5% schools the food grain used for cooking is poor in quality. In only 6% of all school

surveyed there is a varied menu, which reduces the interest of the children from the mid day meal. It came out from the survey that in 57% of the schools they have not been providing eggs though they are supposed to provide it. The children informed that egg is one of the main attractions for the children to come to school. The team was also informed by the teachers that attendance increases on the day when egg is distributed. The irregularity in supply of foodgrains which was reported in 30% cases was also another important reason for improper implementation of the scheme.

Recommendations:

For effective implementation of the scheme these are few recommendations

1. Minimum infrastructural facilities for proper cooking and distribution of meal need to be provided in the schools, as 37.3% schools have no cooking sheds, only 5% schools provide plates to the children and there are problems of lack of required utensils and drinking water facility.
2. The quality of meal should be improved as in 23.5% of the schools, it was reported that poor quality grain is being used for cooking of noon meal. The day wise menu should be fixed based upon the availability of vegetables and it should be prepared with the suggestion of parents teachers committee and all the children should know the menu. The distribution of egg/banana should be made mandatory at least thrice in a week. It will not only help in enhancing attendance rate of students, also the nutrition status of the children as well. However though there is provision of distribution of eggs/bananas twice a week it has not been provided in 57% of the schools for the last one year.
3. Rising of vegetable price even for potato and egg has forced the responsible persons for not to providing or providing less. So inflation-indexed allocation as well as mobilization for kitchen garden in school premises should be encouraged.
4. The foodgrains should be supplied at regular basis and in advance so that there is no disruption in distribution of mid day meal in the schools as reported in 25% of the schools surveyed.
5. The cooks and helpers should be paid monthly on a regular basis. The Government of Odisha has notified for a revised payment of Rs 600 and Rs 400 for the cook and helper respectively. But still it is far below the minimum wage.
6. Serious action should be taken in the event of any form of social discrimination in mid-day meals, such as discrimination against Dalit children or Dalit cooks. Priority should be given to cooks and helpers of Dalit or Tribal communities.
7. Information on stock, provision of the schemes etc to be displayed in the schools premises.

4. TARGETED PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION SYSTEM

4.1. Introduction

The Public Distribution System (PDS) is one of the oldest food subsidy programmes in the Country. It was introduced by the British Government during the Second World War in 1939 to face food scarcity, maintain price stability and check dishonest practices in private trade. The basic framework for the PDS was firmed up in 1942. Since then there have been many changes in the Public Distribution System. The Revamped Public Distribution System (RPDS) was introduced in 1992 for the people of disadvantageous geographic locations like hilly tribal areas after the reported hunger death in Orissa and Madhya Pradesh. Under RPDS, 1752 blocks falling under Desert Development Programme, Drought Prone Areas Programme, Integrated Tribal Development Projects and Designated Hill areas were covered to supply essential commodities like wheat, rice, sugar, edible oil, kerosene and soft coke. 143 blocks of Orissa were covered under this RPDS scheme. But it had been widely criticized for its failure to serve the population Below the Poverty Line (BPL), limited coverage in the States with high concentration of rural poor and lack of transparent and accountable arrangements for delivery.

The Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) was then introduced in June, 1997. It envisaged that the Below Poverty Line (BPL) population would be identified in every State and every BPL family would be entitled to a certain quantity of food grains at specially subsidized prices. In order to make TPDS more focused and targeted towards the poorest category of population, the "Antyodaya Anna Yojana" (AAY) was launched in December 2000 for one crore poorest of the poor families. AAY contemplates providing them food grains at a highly subsidized rate of Rs 2/ per kg for wheat and Rs 3/ per kg for rice. The scale of issue that was initially 25 kg per family per month has been increased to 35 kg per family per month with effect from 1st April, 2002. The AAY Scheme has been expanded in stages each time by 50 lakh households; in 2003-2004, August, 2004 and the third in May 2005, thus bringing the total number of beneficiaries to 2.5 crores households, which is about 38% of the BPL households. Food grains are also provided to families above the poverty line (APL), but the quantum of subsidy is very low as compared to that for the BPL families. Therefore there was a shift in the PDS from being a universal system to a targeted one where the population is divided into those above the poverty line and below the poverty line. The prices at which grains are sold to these two groups differ and in most states the quantity of grain allocated is also different.

The targeted PDS brings along with it issues related to setting a cap on the number of BPL households and identifying BPL households. There have been many problems documented with the estimation and the identification of poverty, with the overwhelming opinion now being that the current poverty line is too low and that the methodology for estimation is inappropriate resulting in a large number of exclusion and inclusion errors. To correct these problems the Government of India set up two committees (Tendulkar Committee and Saxena Committee) to review the methodology for estimation and identification respectively. While both these committees have submitted their reports to the Government, a decision on these is yet to be taken,

While this survey as well encountered many problems in the identification of the poor, where many poor families were left out of the BPL net and therefore out of the resulting benefits from the various schemes aimed at the BPL households, the objective of the survey did not include assessing the identification issues. This survey was mainly concerned with assessing whether the benefits that are supposed to reach those who are already eligible (identified as "BPL") are reaching them or not.

4.2. Orders of the Supreme Court

Supreme Court orders related to TPDS and AAY:

1. **Identification of BPL families:** On 28th November 2001, the Court directed the State Governments "to complete the identification of BPL families, issuing of cards and commencement of distribution of 25 kgs. Grain per family per month latest by 1st January, 2002". The entitlements of BPL families were subsequently raised from 35 kgs of grain per month to 35 kgs.
2. **Accessibility of ration shops and regular supply of grain:** On several occasions, the Supreme Court directed the government to ensure that all ration shops open regularly.
3. **Accountability of PDS dealers:** The licenses of PDS dealers and shop-keepers should be cancelled if they: "(a) do not keep their shops open throughout the month during the stipulated period; (b) fail to provide grain to BPL families strictly at BPL rates and no higher; (c) keep the cards of BPL households with them; (d) make false entries in the BPL cards; (e) engage in black-marketing or siphoning away of grains to the open market and hand over such ration shops to such other person/organizations".
4. **Permission to buy in installments:** Arrangements must be made to "permit the BPL Household to buy the ration in installments".
5. **Awareness generation:** "Wide publicity shall be given so as to make BPL families aware of their entitlement."
6. **Antodaya Anna Yojana** On 2nd May 2003, the Supreme Court declared that all Households belonging to six "priority groups" would be entitled to Antyodaya cards. More precisely, the Government of India was directed "to place on AAY category the following groups of persons:
 - (1) Aged, infirm, disabled, destitute men and women, pregnant and lactating women, destitute women;
 - (2) Widows and other single women with no regular support;
 - (3) Old persons (aged 60 or above) with no regular support and no assured means of subsistence;
 - (4) Households with a disabled adult and assured means of subsistence;
 - (5) Households where due to old age, lack of physical or mental fitness, social customs, need to care for a disabled, or other reasons, no adult member is

available to engage in gainful employment outside the house;
 (6) Primitive tribes.”

Some of the significant orders in relation to the Targeted Public Distribution System and the Antodaya Anna Yojana are presented in the box below. The Supreme Court also appointed a Central Vigilance Committee, in July 2006, to particularly look into issues of corruption in PDS, with special reference to Delhi. This Committee has recently submitted its report to the Supreme Court.

4.3. Schemes under TPDS

The State Government of Orissa introduced a 2 Rupees rice scheme from 1st August 2008. The feature of the scheme is given below.

(i) The scheme will cover about 55.79 Lakh beneficiaries entitled to BPL and Antyodaya rice as per the following details:

Table-4.1 (Guidelines for 2 Rupee rice)

Scheme	Number	Scale of entitlement (per month)	Current Consumer Price	Revised Con (From 1 st Aug 2008)
Antyodaya Anna Yojana	12.645 Lakh	35 kg	3.00 Rs/Kg	2.00 Rs/Kg
BPL families in ITDP/DPAP Blocks (143 blocks)	15.84 Lakh	25 kg	16 Kg @ Rs. 4.75/Kg 9 Kg @ Rs. 6.30/Kg	2.00 Rs/Kg
BPL families in other areas	21.75 Lakh	25 kg	Rs. 6.30/Kg	2.00 Rs/Kg
Non-BPL families in KBK districts	5.56 Lakh	25 kg	Rs. 6.30/Kg	2.00 Rs/Kg

(ii) Rice will also be supplied for the SC/ST boarders staying in hostels run and/or funded by the SC & ST Development Department at the scale of entitlement of 15 Kg per student @ Rs. 2/Kg for ten months in a year.

Wheat

APL Cardholders get wheat 15 kg P.M. @ Rs.7.00 per kg.

Levy Sugar

BPL/AAY - 2 kg Sugar per month @ Rs.13.50 per kg.

4.4. Macro Data of Survey districts in Orissa:

Table- 4.2(DISTRICTWISE ABSTRACT OF B.P.L. SURVEY 1997)

District	Rural				Urban				Overall				Anna purna
	BPL Cards	AAY Cards	APL Cards	TOTAL	BPL Cards	AAY Cards	APL Cards	Total	BPL Cards	AAY Cards	APL Cards	Total	
Nuapada	83115	25904	25958	134977	2015	697	8109	10821	85130	26601	34067	145798	961
Kandhamal	90262	28841	21940	141043	1849	726	7519	10094	92111	29567	29459	151137	1118
Balasore	178179	80906	100899	359984	9319	3104	54059	66482	187498	84010	154958	426466	3472
Gajapati	54339	18701	38642	111682	4367	2171	8027	14565	58706	20872	46669	126247	932
Orissa	3506280	1173245	2503452	7182977	252434	91475	1101857	1445766	3758714	1264720	3605309	8628743	64800

(Source-Food Security Section, GoO)

This 1997 BPL list is still prevailing in Orissa because the 2002 BPL has not yet been accepted by the state government.

Table- 4.3(Abstract of SC/ST BPL beneficiary in Survey districts)

District	Total No of Families	Total No of BPL Families	% of BPL Families
Nuapada	127022	108864	85.7
Kandhamal	145335	113970	78.42
Balasore	349446	257606	73.72
Gajapati	112029	68763	61.38
Orissa	6784127	4502809	66.37

(Source-Food Security Section, GoO)

The total no of household under BPL category in Orissa is **45, 02,809**, out of **67, 84,127** no of households in the state. This amounts to **66.38** % of the total households. The percentage of BPL households for the districts where the survey was conducted are 85.7%, 78.42%, 73.72% and 61.38% for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati respectively.

Table- 4.4Status of Fair Price Shop as on May 2008

District	Urban						Rural						Grand Total
	PV T	SHG	Co-op	Mun/NAC	Maitry	Total	PVt	SH G	Co-op.	Mun/NAC	Mai try	Total	
Nuapada	29	49	1			79	38	157	6	70		271	350
Kandhamal	19	6	2		1	28	129	179	69	96	1	474	502
Balasore	92		6		1	99	1288	3	52	9		1352	1451
Gajapati	42					42	260	161	7	54		482	524
Orissa	3633	653	134	11	43	4474	13918	6996	687	3236	11	24848	29322

(Source-Food Security Section, GoO)

Out of 92 mobile vans for PDS distribution there are 5, 3, 3 &10 for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. While most of the fair price shops are still run by

private dealers a significant proportion are also run by SHGs, as can be seen in the table above. There is also a district wise variation in this. For example, while most of the fair price shops in rural areas of Nuapada and Kandhamal are run by SHGs, in rural areas of Balasore and Gajapati most of the fair price shops are still run by private dealers.

4.5 Survey Details:

For the TPDS survey, 10 villages from each district of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati were chosen. The ration shops were visited in each village and the details of 5 randomly selected households (i.e.3 BPL and 2 AAY) from each village were gathered from the distribution register of the ration shop. Out of the 40 villages, in 5 villages this was not available because of mobile van distribution in these villages. The selected households were then asked about the benefit they received and this was then compared with the entries in the ration cards and in the distribution registers. Again 53 Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) were conducted to get further information on the functioning of TPDS scheme.

Table-4.5 (Sample covered in the Survey)

District	No. of Villages Covered	Villages that have a ration shop within the same village		Number of villages where nearest ration shop if ration shop is not in village is:		
		Number	Percent	<3kms away	>3kms away	Avg. distance (in Kms)
Nuapada	10	1	10.0	9	0	1.4
Kandhamal	10	3	30.0	5	2	1.7
Balasore	10	8	80.0	0	2	0.2
Gajapati	10	4	40.0	5	1	1.7
Overall	40	16	40.0	19	5	0.5

(Source-Field Survey)

There are 10 sample villages in each of the four survey districts. The number of villages with ration shop available within the village are 1(10%), 3 (30%), 4(40%) and 4(40%) in Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. The number of villages where the ration shops are situated more than 3 kms away is 2 in Kandhamal and Balasore and 1 in Gajapati district respectively. The average distance of nearest ration shops are 1.4 kms, 1.7 kms, 0.2 kms and 1.7 kms for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. Overall 16 (40%) villages have ration shops in the village and the average distance of the nearest ration shop is half a kilometer from the villages.

Table-4.6 (Distribution of ration cards)

District	Total number of households in the survey villages	APL Cards		BPL Cards		AAY Cards	
		No	Percent	No	Percent	No	Percent
Nuapada	3611	639	17.7	2381	65.9	591	16.4
Kandhamal	1836	528	28.8	1084	59.0	214	11.7
Balasore	2501	968	38.7	1057	42.3	476	19.0
Gajapati	2384	801	33.6	1263	53.0	320	13.4
Overall	10322	2936	28.5	5785	56.0	1601	15.5

(Source-Field Survey)

It has seen that out of total ration cards the percentage of BPL card holders are 65.9, 59, 42.3 and 53 percent in the survey villages of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. Similarly the percentages of AAY card holders are 16.4, 11.7, 19 and 13.4 for the same districts. The overall percentage of BPL and AAY card holders for all the survey districts put together are 56% and 15.5% respectively.

Information on ration shops**Table-4.7a (Information display)**

District	Information publicly displayed							
	Timings		Prices		Quotas		Card details	Holder details
	No	%	No	%	No	%	No	%
Nuapada	2	40.0	2	40.0	2	40.0	0	0.0
Kandhamal	0	0.0	5	50.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Balasore	3	30.0	5	50.0	0	0.0	1	10.0
Gajapati	1	10.0	8	80.0	5	50.0	1	10.0
Overall	6	17.1	20	57.1	7	20.0	2	5.7

(Source- Field Survey)

The survey found that inspite of the Supreme Court orders, provisions under the PDS Control Order and the Right to Information Act, the display of information related to the functioning of the PDS shop was very poor. Only in 17% of the shops visited were the timings displayed, more than half (57%) displayed the information on the prices of the food grains, 20% displayed the quantities and only about 6% displayed the details of the card holders at the ration shops. As can be seen in the table above the situation was slightly different in the different districts covered under the survey, with almost no information being displayed in the Kandhamal district. The percentages of ration shops where timings were displayed are 40, 0, 30 and 10, pricing was displayed 40, 50, 50 and 80 percent of ration shops, quotas in 40, 0, 0 and 50 percent of ration shops and 0, 0, 10 and 10 per cent of ration shops displayed details of card holders in survey villages of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively.

Table-4.7b (FGD responses on card holding, installment purchase & public record scrutiny)

District	No. of villages where ration dealers from same village		No. of villages where ration cards are usually kept with the households		No. of villages where ration can be bought in installments		No. of villages where someone asked for ration records and it was made available for public scrutiny	
	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%	No.	%
Nuapada	1	10.0	11	84.6	1	7.7	0	0.0
Kandhamal	1	10.0	15	100	3	20.0	0	0.0
Balasore	8	80.0	10	100	1	10.0	2	20.0
Gajapati	4	40.0	15	100	1	6.7	1	6.7
Overall	14	35.0	51	96.2	6	11.3	3	5.7

(Source- Field Survey)

The percentages of villages where the dealers were from the same village was very low at 10% in Nuapada & Kandhamal. A higher number of ration dealers were from the same village in Balasore (80%) and Gajapati (40%) districts. Amongst all the surveyed villages in about 35% of the villages the ration dealer was from the same village.

According to responses from the community during the FGDs in most of the villages people said that the ration cards were in possession of the households, which is a positive finding. While overall in 51 out of the 53 FGDs conducted people said that the ration cards were held with

themselves. Only in two communities in Nuapada did people say that the ration cards were not with them.

There is a Supreme Court order which specifies that rations can be bought in installments. However, from the discussions with the communities it was seen that this provision was not available in almost all the places. In only about 10% of the FGDs did people say that it was possible to buy ration in installments. This was slightly higher in Kandhamal compared to other districts. In order to understand how much people are able to scrutinize and monitor the performance of the PDS in the villages, they were asked whether they ever asked to see the PDS records and if they did whether they were able to access the records. It was found that this happened in very few of the villages. In Nuapada and Kandhamal districts in all the villages people responded that records were not available for scrutiny while in 20% of the villages in Balasore and 6.7% in Gajapati it was possible to examine the PDS records.

Table-4.7c (Details of food grains given in one month)

District	APL				BPL				AAY			
	Rice		Wheat **		Rice		Wheat		Rice		Wheat	
	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)	Avg Qty (in Kg)	Avg Price (in Rs)
Nuapada	25	2	8.4	7.00	25	2.00	No provision		35	2.00	No provision	
Kandhamal	No provision		6.6	7.00 to 7.50	25	2.00	No provision		35	2.00	No provision	
Balasore	No provision		5	7.0 to 8.00	25	2.00	No provision		35	2.00	No provision	
Gajapati	No provision		5	7.50	25	2.00	No provision		35	2.00	No provision	

(Source-Field Survey)

*** In all survey villages, wheat is not distributed regularly. The average quantity is based on the last distribution.*

In all the survey villages it was seen that the allocation was 25kgs of rice per month for BPL cardholders and 35 kgs of rice per month for AAY card holders. As per the state scheme of Rs.

2 per kg rice, both the categories of households were receiving rice at Rs. 2 per kg. There is no provision of giving rice to APL card holders except in Nuapada that comes under the KBK region. In Nuapada, APL card holders are also getting 25 kilograms of rice at Rs 2 per kg. There is no provision to distribute wheat for BPL and AAY card holders in any of the districts. It has been seen that wheat is not distributed on a regular monthly basis. The average quantities of wheat distribution for the last time are 8.4 kg, 6.6 kg, 5 kg and 5 kg at the rates of Rs 7.00, Rs 7.00 to 7.50, Rs 7.0 to Rs 8.0 and Rs 7.50 per kg for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively.

4.8 Verification of records/Leakages

District	Number of villages accessible for verification of records	Number of people whose ration cards and official records were cross-checked	Number of discrepancies between		
			distribution register and ration card	distribution register and reported by the people themselves	ration card and reported by the people themselves
Nuapada*	5	25	0	0	0
Kandhamal	10	50	0	0	0
Balasore	10	50	0	0	0
Gajapati	10	50	0	0	0
Overall	35	175	0	0	0

(Source-Field Survey)

* In Nuapada PDS rice is distributed through Mobile Van. So Sample for 15 BPL and 10 AAY Beneficiaries in 5 villages was not available.

For verification of BPL and AAY cards, details of 105 BPL and 90 AAY card holders were taken from the distribution registers of the ration shops. The records of these five households in terms of the last time food grains were received, the quantity of grain given and the price paid as mentioned in the distribution registered was verified by checking the entries in the ration cards and also asking the beneficiary household. It was a very positive finding to see that there was no discrepancy in the records maintained at the ration shop and what was reported by the beneficiaries indicating that there is probably not much leakage in the grains allocated for the BPL and AAY category households. However, as can be seen in the table below in 22 out of the 53 FGDs held people reported that they had to pay more than what the right price for food grains was under the PDS. This was especially high in Kandhamal and Balasore. Further in

Nuapada and Balasore there were complaints of interruptions in the supply of food grains in the last three months.

Table-4.9 (FGD responses on Right price & interruption of PDS items)

District	Number of villages where the community reported that they have to pay more than the right price for their food grains from PDS		Number of villages where there was an any interruption of supply of food grains in the last 3 months		
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Avg. no of days
Nuapada	2	15.4	5	38.5	50
Kandhamal	11	73.3	0	0.0	0
Balasore	9	90.0	8	80.0	86
Gajapati	0	0	0	0.0	0
Overall	22	41.5	13	24.5	72

(Source-Field Survey)

There was no interruption of food grain especially rice in Kandhamal and Gajapati districts where as it was the case in 38.5 & 80 percent for Nuapada and Balasore respectively. It came out in the FGD that in about one fourth cases there is a disruption in distribution. The average no of interrupted days in 5 villages of Nuapada and 8 villages in Balasore district were 50 and 86 respectively. The overall average interrupted days for 13 villages was 72.

Table-4.10(FGD responses on PDS normal quota, pilfered & Vigilance Committee)

District	No. of FGDs where people said that they normally get their entire quota of grain under PDS		No. of FGDs where people reported instances of grain being pilfered/sold in the black market		No. of FGDs where there is a vigilance committee for PDS		No. of FGDs that have a vigilance committee where a meeting was held in the last one year	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	No	Per cent
Nuapada	8	61.5	1*	7.6	0	0.0	0	0.0

Kandhamal	15	100.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Balasore	2	20.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Gajapati	15	100.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
Overall	40	75.5	1	1.9	0	0.0	0	0.0

(Source-Field Survey)

* *Ankapur in Larka GP, Boden Block, Nuapada district- The weight of 50 kg bags are lower weight.*

The other responses of the FGDs also indicated a similar situation, while only in one village in Nuapada there was a complaint of PDS grain being pilfered, in 40 out of the 53 FGDs people said that they normally get their entire quota of grain from the PDS. There was a problem in Balasore where people reported otherwise. In all the FGDs it was found that none of the villages have a vigilance committee or had a meeting of vigilance committee under the knowledge of people. People were completely ignorant about the vigilance committee for PDS.

Table- 4.11(FGD responses on BPL/AAY identification through Gram Sabha and opening of Ration shop)

District	Nos of FGD where people told Gram Sabha held for identification of BPL/AAY		Nos of FGD where people told Opening of Ration Shop on 4 th to 6 th and 20 th to 22 nd every month.	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	1	7.7	9	69.2
Kandhamal	3	20.0	13	86.7
Balasore	2	20.0	5	50
Gajapati	2	13.3	15	100
Overall	8	15.1	42	79.2

(Source- Field Survey)

In the FGDs people were asked if a gram sabha was held to ratify the identification of BPL and AAY household. Only in 8 out of the 53 groups with whom FGDs were conducted in the 40 villages, did people say that there was a gram sabha held for identification of BPL and AAY. According to the FGDs, in 7.7, 20, 20 and 13.3 percents of the survey villages in Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively Gram Sabhas were held for

identification of BPL and AAY beneficiaries. Overall, only in 15.1 percent of the FGDs did people say that FGDs were held on identification of BPL/AAY.

In Orissa, for the distribution of rice, ration shops should be open on the 4th to 6th and 20th to 21st of every month. While this was indeed the case as reported by the people in most of the villages in Gajapati and Kandhamal, in Balasore and Nuapada there were complaints that the PDS shop was not opened on the allocated days. Overall in 42 out of the 53 FGDs, people said that the ration shop was open on the specified days. The overall percentage is 79.2.

Findings and Recommendations:

The public distribution system is a very important scheme for a poverty stricken state like Orissa. After introduction of the revised two rupees rice scheme it seems like the operation of the scheme has improved. It also increased the number of beneficiaries covered under the scheme also covering all the APL card holders from the KBK districts. It came out during the study that ration is mostly distributed during the six days notified by the state government. Another positive thing that came out from the study is that around 97% of the households surveyed keep their ration cards in their home. The distribution of ration has been quite regular in two sample districts such as Gajapati and Kandhamal but disruption in supply of food grain have been reported in Nuapada and Balasore districts.

Many critical gaps in the implementation of the scheme were brought out during the survey. The BPL households in Orissa are still getting only 25 Kilograms of rice although the Supreme Court in its order dated 1st January 2002 has clearly ask the governments to provide 35 kilograms of foodgrain to each BPL household.

The priority should also be given to display of information on timing, price and quota of food grain at the FPS level. Public scrutiny of records relating to PDS is not allowed and in none of the villages surveyed, one single functioning vigilance committee was noticed. It was also reported that only in 11% cases the beneficiaries are allowed to buy grain in installment which is also a clear violation of supreme courts order. In Balasore district the public distribution system is still in the hands of private dealers.

In the line of findings these are the few recommendations for improving PDS in the state.

1. The allocation of foodgrains to BPL families needs to be enhanced immediately to 35 kilograms per BPL household from the present 25 kgs per BPL household by abiding the order of the Supreme Court.
2. The operation of Fair Price Shops should be handed over either to Panchayats or WSHGs in the Balasore district as well for better implementation and checking pilferages in the scheme.

3. The information like timing of opening of the Fair Price Shop, allocation, quota, pricings of food grain, list of ration card holder should be displayed at a public place on a priority basis.
4. The state government should strictly instruct the fair price shop owners to open the ration shop in all working days, ration should be distributed in prescribe rate and records should be maintained properly.
5. The food grain should be made available in installments by the ration dealer if asked by any beneficiaries.
6. The state government should take steps to constitute vigilance and monitoring committees for every fair price shop and it should be made functional for regular monitoring of ration shops. The details like list of ration card holders, monthly allocation, offtake and distribution of ration by the ration shop should be made available to the vigilance committee at regular basis.
7. All records and documents related to ration shop should be made available for public scrutiny as it will enhance transparency and help to reduce black marketing in the scheme.
8. The state government should investigate the issues of quality and irregularity in distribution food grain on a priority basis.

5. NATIONAL OLD AGE PENSION SCHEME

5.1. Introduction

The National Social Assistance Programme (NSAP) was initiated in August 1995 and since then has undergone many changes in its design. The present structure of NSAP includes National Old Age Pension Scheme (NOAPS) and National Family Benefit Scheme (NFBS), which are implemented along with the Annapurna Scheme. NSAP comprises of NOAPS, which is a monthly pension scheme for the aged destitute, and NFBS, which is a one-time relief to a family that has lost an earning member. Annapurna provides food grains on a monthly basis to the aged poor to ensure their food security. It is meant for “those senior citizens who though eligible have remained uncovered under the National Old Age Pension Scheme”. This is a very critical programme as most of starvation deaths are either of infants or aged people from very poor families or without care givers.

The scheme started as a 100 percent centrally sponsored programme that extended complete central assistance to State Governments in order to enable them to provide benefits as per the norms and guidelines laid down by the Central Government. The NSAP and Annapurna were then transferred to State/UT Plans from the financial year 2002-03. As per the available centralized guidelines of the Ministry of Rural Development (MoRD), funds for the operation of the Schemes are allocated by the Planning Commission and released as Additional Central Assistance (ACA) to the States/UTs by the Ministry of Finance. The ACA provided to the States / UTs under NSAP and Annapurna can be utilized by the States / UTs on Welfare Schemes such as the Old Age Pension, Family Benefit or free food grains to the aged by taking up one or two or all of the three or in any other combination in accordance with their own priorities and needs. These programmes often suffer from low priority and monitoring, both by government and even sometimes civil society activists, but it must be remembered that for several sections of the country's most food vulnerable and at-risk categories, these schemes constitute their sole life-line to bare survival.

The National Old Age Pension scheme has recently been expanded to cover ALL old people above 65 years of age and below the poverty line and the amount of pension has also been increased to Rs. 400 per month. According to the current norms the Government of India contributes Rs. 200 per month towards old age pension and urges state governments to make a matching contribution.

In Orissa a pension scheme by the government of Orissa has been there since 1975. However the government of Orissa launched Madhu Babu Pension Yojana (MBPY) on 1st January 2008, revising the prevailing state pension scheme. The Government of Orissa lunched MBPY by merging the SOAP, Widow Pension and Disabled Pension Schemes. The MBPY has also incorporated people living with HIV/AIDs and Leprosy patients with visible signs of deformity as

the new category for pension holders. The women and child development department, government of Orissa is the nodal agency for MBPY. A person shall be eligible to get the pension under MBPY if s/he:

- (i) Is of 60 years of age and above(**OAP**)
- (ii) Is a widow (irrespective of age) (**WP**)
- (iii) Is a leprosy patient with visible signs of deformity (irrespective of age) (**CLP**)
- (iv) Is a person of 5 years of age or, above and unable to do normal work due to his/her deformity or disability being totally blind or, orthopedically handicapped or, mentally retarded or, with cerebral palsy. (**DP**)
- (v) A widow of AIDS patient (irrespective of age and income criteria mentioned under Rule 6 (b). (**WP-AIDS**)
- (vi) AN AIDS patient identified by the Orissa State AIDS Control Society (irrespective of income) (**DP-AIDS**)

The criteria are as follows:-

- A. The family income from all sources does not exceed Rs12,000/- per annum. (the concerned Tahasildar needs to certify for this) (in case of BPL no certificate is required)
- B. Is a permanent resident/domicile of Orissa.
- C. Has not been convicted of any criminal offence involving moral turpitude.
- D. Is not receipt of any other pension from the union Government or the state government or any organization aided either Government.
- E. Where both husband and wife are covered under the above definition, each of them will be eligible for such pension.

The pension amount under MBPY is Rs. 200/- per month. The pension amount to each beneficiary shall be distributed in the presence of the elected personnel of that G.P on the "**JANA SEVA DIVAS**" i.e. the 15th of every month irrespective of it being a holiday at the concerned G.P. Head quarters in the rural areas unless otherwise decided by the Government

5.2 Supreme Court orders on NOAPS and Annapurna

Supreme Court orders on NOAPS and Annapurna

NOAPS was one of the schemes covered under the interim order of November 2001. Further orders were also issued in 2004 that were relevant to this scheme. The following give the gist of the orders related to the old age pension scheme¹⁰:

1. State governments have been directed to complete the identification of persons entitled to pensions under NOAPS, and to ensure that the pensions are paid regularly (Supreme Court Order dated 28th November, 2001).
2. Payment of pensions is to be made by the 7th day of each month (Supreme Court Order dated 28th November, 2001).
3. The scheme must not be discontinued or restricted without the permission of the Supreme Court (Supreme Court Order dated 27th April, 2004).
4. The NOAPS grants paid by the Central Government to the State Governments under "Additional Central Assistance" should not be diverted for any other purposes (Supreme Court Order dated 18th November, 2004).

The orders that are relevant to the Annapurna scheme are the ones calling for prompt implementation of all the food schemes and that the scheme is not to be discontinued or restricted in any way without the permission of the Supreme Court.

Survey Details:

5.1. Sample covered in the survey

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible old persons visited			Age group of old persons	
		Male	Female	Total	60 – 65 years *	> 65 years
Nuapada	10	493	433	926	0	926
Kandhamal	10	65	50	115	0	115
Balasore	10	119	77	196	0	196
Gajapati	10	98	93	191	0	191
Overall	40	775	653	1428	0	1428

(Source-Field Survey)

* Old persons below 65 years of age, non BPL card holders and other state level pension beneficiaries were not surveyed.

During survey in 40 villages the numbers of persons above 65 years under BPL/Antyodaya households were 1428. So every fifth BPL/Antyodaya household there was a person of above 65 years of age. By the norms of the Indira Gandhi National Old Age Pension scheme all these people are eligible for pensions as they are above 65 years of age and in a BPL household.

5.2. Coverage of old age pensions

District	Total no. of eligible persons covered in survey	No. and % of eligible old persons receiving pension					
		Male		Female		Total	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	926	259	52.5	272	62.8	531	57.3
Kandhamal	115	44	67.7	39	78.0	83	72.2
Balasore	196	43	36.1	46	59.7	89	45.4
Gajapati	191	35	35.7	42	45.2	77	40.3
Overall	1428	381	49.2	399	61.1	780	54.6

(Source-Field Survey)

The number of eligible persons covered the survey were 926, 115, 196 and 191 for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. The proportion of male as well as female eligible beneficiaries visited is almost same. However, it was seen that the coverage among women was better (61.1%) than among men (49.2%). Amongst all the eligible beneficiaries, it was seen that only 54.6 percent were getting benefits under the National Old Age Pension Scheme.

5.3. Amount, Time & Mode of pension received

District	Rs 200 per month		Last month		Cash given in the GP Office	
	No	%	No	%	No	%
Nuapada	531	100.0	531	100.0	531	100.0
Kandhamal	83	100.0	83	100.0	83	100.0
Balasore	89	100.0	89	100.0	89	100.0

Gajapati	77	100.0	77	100.0	77	100.0
Overall	780	100.0	780	100.0	780	100.0

Although the coverage was low, it was seen that among those who were receiving the pension they were receiving the full amount and on a regular basis. According to the survey all beneficiaries reported getting two hundred rupees on 15th of every month at the gram panchayat office. This day is observed as Jana Seva Diwas.

5.4. Annapurna Scheme

District	Number of old persons who do not get old age pensions		No. of these who receive free grain currently		No. of these who do not receive free grain now but used to earlier	
	No	%	No	%*	No	%*
Nuapada	395	42.7	0	0	0	0
Kandhamal	32	27.8	0	0	0	0
Balasore	107	54.6	0	0	0	0
Gajapati	114	59.7	0	0	0	0
Overall	648	45.4	0	0	0	0

* Both these should be percents of the no. of people not getting pensions

The number of old persons who are eligible but not getting old age pension are 395 (42.7 %), 32 (27.8 %), 107 (54.6 %) and 114 (59.7 %) in Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati district respectively. Out of these non beneficiaries no one is getting free of grain currently of earlier. With the old age pensions being expanded to all old people in BPL households, the Annapurna scheme has more or less been scrapped. However, in reality only about 54% of the old people are covered under the pension scheme in spite of it being extended to all.

Table-5.5. FGD Responses on Beneficiary coverage:

District	No of FGDs held	FGD responses on NOAP Beneficiary			
		ALL		Not all but Some	
		Number	Percent	Number	Percent

Nuapada	13	0	0	13	100
Kandhamal	15	3*	20	12	80
Balasore	10	0	0	10	100
Gajapati	15	0	0	15	100
Overall	53	3	5.7	50	94.3

(Source-Field Survey)

* Out of 3 FGD responses 2 from Baida village and 1 from Ganjuguda village under Ganjuguda GP in Phulbani block.

This inadequate coverage of the pensions was also reflected in the Focus Group Discussions held in the community. According to the FGDs except in 3 (20%) FGD responses in Kandhamal district, in the rest of the FGDs people complained that only some of the eligible persons are getting NOAP. When there was a discussion on the reasons for the others not getting the pensions the main reasons given were that the target was fixed from above and this was limited. Further people also claimed that there was an interference of politicians in the selection process, and demands for bribes at the panchayat and block levels to be included in the pension scheme. It was also seen that there was no proper grievance redressal system in place where people could go and complain when such instances occurred.

People also complained that although many of them had applied for pensions they were not given any acknowledgement of receipt of the application. This is creating a lot of confusion as they are not sure whether they are being considered for next allocation.

Findings and Recommendations:

Since the survey covered only BPL household members and 65 years of age more people have not taken into survey. The reason for more people excluded because of prevailing 1997 BPL list.

Major Findings

It is one of the better functioning schemes in the state as the beneficiaries are satisfied with the implementation of the scheme. If one becomes a beneficiary then the payment being made on a regular basis at the GP headquarter on fixed date and also team got almost no complaint over the amount of payment as well.

However the major problem with the scheme is the coverage. The scheme has already been made universal but as per the survey around 54.6% aged person are still waiting to become a beneficiary under it. The selections are in many cases done in a political basis and most of the cases beneficiaries have to pay bribe to the local officials to become a beneficiary. It was also reported that officials do not issue acknowledgement receipt of the application form

Recommendation:

Based on the findings of the survey and the discussions with the community members in the Focus Group Discussions, the following steps need to be taken to ensure that the NOAPS is implemented effectively:

1. **Improve the coverage:** As seen in the survey only slightly above half the eligible people are receiving pensions in the four districts surveyed. The reasons for this are many, with the most important one being inadequate allocations from the state in spite of expansion of the programme in 2007 to cover ALL old people who are above 65 years and from BPL households. An exercise must be conducted in all districts to assess the total number of eligible beneficiaries and allocations must then be made to ensure universal coverage of all eligible old people under the National Old Age Pension Scheme.
2. **Simplify Application Procedure:** Currently people have to go to the block office to apply for the pensions and they do not even receive any acknowledgement. The application procedure must be simplified in a manner where eligible beneficiaries are automatically included in the list every year. Those left out of such a list must be allowed to apply at the panchayat level and receive an acknowledgement for the application. The panchayat must be able to verify the application within one month and forward it to the Block office. Once a recommendation from the panchayat is received the block office must start giving pensions within a maximum period of three months.
3. **Increase the pension amount:** In Orissa it is seen that the pension amount being paid is only Rs. 200. The state government is not making any contribution to enhance pension amount. The state government should contribute an additional amount of Rs. 200 to ensure that at least Rs. 400 per month is paid to the beneficiaries.

6. NATIONAL MATERNITY BENEFIT SCHEME

6.1. Introduction

National Maternity Benefit Scheme (NMBS) came into effect as a component of National Social Assistance programme (NSAP) on 15th August, 1995. The scheme provided Rs.500 as assistance for nutritional support to BPL pregnant women, 8-12 weeks prior to delivery, for each of the first two births. In 2001, under PUCL vs UOI Civil writ petition 196 of 2001, this scheme was one among the schemes taken by the Supreme Court, whereby implying that the ‘maternity relief’ in form of cash assistance worth Rs. 500, also has a food security component in it. The National Maternity Benefit Scheme was modified into a new scheme called Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY) and launched w.e.f 12.04.2005. The objectives of the JSY are reducing maternal mortality/infant mortality through promotion of institutional deliveries through incentivisation, while the focus of the NMBS was provision of maternity benefits. As mentioned in the guidelines for implementation of JSY, “While NMBS is linked to provision of better diet for pregnant women from BPL families, JSY integrates the cash assistance with antenatal care during the pregnancy period, institutional care during delivery and immediate post-partum period in a health centre by establishing a system of coordinated care by field level health worker.” Although the main objective of the JSY scheme remains promoting institutional delivery, the component of Rs.500 payment has been retained for all eligible women, irrespective of place of delivery. This is so, because of the order of the Supreme Court that no existing entitlements for food rights can be abridged without the consent of the Court.

1.2 Orders of the Supreme Court on the NMBS

Orders of the Supreme Court on the NMBS

NMBS was one of the schemes that was covered in the initial order of the Supreme Court which called for implementation of existing food schemes. The matter then came up in the context of the Government of India’s attempts to do away with the scheme entirely and replace it with the Janani Suraksha Yojana. With the interventions of the Court and the Commissioners’ office, the benefits of the NMBS have however been retained under the JSY. The issue of poor implementation again came up in Court in February 2007, when the Court asked the Government of India and state governments to file affidavits in response. This matter has not been heard since. The orders that have been passed until now in relation to NMBS are summarized below.

- The Supreme Court order of 28th November 2001 calls for prompt implementation of the National Maternity Benefit Scheme.

- This scheme is not to be discontinued or restricted in any way without the permission of the Supreme Court (Supreme Court Order dated 27th April, 2004).
- The Supreme Court refused to allow the Government of India to phase out NMBS and provide maternity benefits under a new scheme, Janani Suraksha Yojana (JSY). The reason for this refusal is that it is not clear whether the new scheme preserves all the benefits available under NMBS, as the government claims. The Court requested the government to submit further information on JSY, and asked the Commissioners to “examine the matter in depth and file a report”.
- “Meanwhile, the existing National Maternity Benefit Scheme will continue.” (Supreme Court Order dated 9th May, 2005)
- In the context of NMBS/JSY, the order of the Supreme Court says, “it would be appropriate if the Union of India and the State Governments take steps to make the beneficiaries aware of the benefits of the schemes and the entitlements flowing there from” (Supreme Court Order dated 01.02.2007).
- The order dated 20.11.2007, in the context of the NMBS, states, “The amount shall be Rs. 500 per birth irrespective of number of children and the age of the woman.

Survey Details

For NMBS survey, all the women from BPL/Antodaya families who delivered in the last 12 month prior to survey were the sample. The team visited each and every household having a BPL or Antodaya card in the selected villages. In case of delivery in the last 12 month before the survey they were asked about the benefits they received and other.

Table-6.1. Sample covered in the survey

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible women covered:			Age group of women	
		No. who had home delivery	No. who had hospital delivery	Total	< 19 years	> 19 years
Nuapada	10	220 (55.4)	177 (44.6)	397	4 (1.0)	393 (99.0)
Kandhamal	10	22 (23.9)	70 (76.1)	92	0(0.0)	92(100.0)

Balasore	10	17 (17.3)	81 (82.7)	98	1(1.0)	97(99.0)
Gajapati	10	39 (27.3)	104 (72.7)	143	11 (7.3)	132 (92.3)
Overall	40	298 (40.8)	432(59.2)	730	16 (2.2)	714 (97.8)

(Source- Field Survey)

(Figures in bracket are percentages out of total eligible women covered)

For National Maternity Benefit Scheme 10 villages in each district of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati were taken. During the survey 730 eligible women were found in these villages those were eligible to receive benefit under the NMBS as they had delivered a child in the last one year and belonged to a BPL/AAY household. The numbers of respondents were 397, 92, 98 and 143 for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati district respectively. Out of total eligible women the proportion of home delivery at 55.4 percent was highest in Nuapada district as compared to around one fourth in Kandhamal and Gajapati districts and less than one fifth in Balasore district. The age group under 19 was around 7 percent in Gajapati district but it was negligible for other districts.

During Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) majority responded that not all but only some have got cash benefit under NMBS/JSY.

Coverage under NMBS/JSY

Table-6.2a. by place of delivery

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit:		
		No. who had home delivery	No. who had hospital delivery	Total
Nuapada	397	16 (7.3)	164 (92.7)	180 (45.3)
Kandhamal	92	4 (18.2)	69 (98.6)	73 (79.3)
Balasore	98	1 (5.9)	77 (95.1)	78 (79.6)
Gajapati	143	0 (0)	83 (79.8)	83(58.0)
Overall	730	21(7)	393(91)	414(56.7)

(Source-Field Survey)

(Figures in bracket are percentages women who received monetary benefit out of total eligible women covered)

The findings of the survey show that there is clearly a discrimination against women who have home deliveries in giving the benefits under the NMBS/JSY, in all the districts. While only 7% of the eligible women who had home deliveries received any cash benefit, more than 90% of the women who had institutional delivery received cash benefits. While appreciating the implementation of JSY for women having institutional deliveries, at the same time it cannot be accepted that in spite of repeated Supreme Court orders women who have home deliveries are being kept out of the ambit of the scheme.

It has been found that out of 220, 22, 17 and 39 eligible women who had home deliveries 16 (7.3 %), 4 (18.2 %), 1 (5.9%) and 0(0 %) have received monetary benefit in Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. Similarly out of 177, 70, 81 and 104 eligible women who had institutional deliveries 164 (92.7%), 69 (98.6%), 77 (95.1%) and 83(79.8 %) have received monetary benefit in Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati districts respectively. The overall figures of coverage for home and Institutional delivery were 21 (7 %) and 393 (91%).

The proportion of actual beneficiaries to total eligible women irrespective of place of delivery was around 80 percent for Kandhamal and Balasore, 45 percent for Nuapada and 58 percent for Gajapati district. The overall percentage in the state was around 57 percent. Amongst those who had home deliveries, it was around 4 percent in all districts except Gajapati where it was 0. Similarly on the basis of hospital delivery the percentages were around 41, 75, 78 and 58 for Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and Gajapati district respectively. The overall percentage was 54.

Table-6.2b. by age

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit:		
		No. who were < 19 years of age	No. who were > 19 years of age	Total
Nuapada	397	3	177	180
Kandhamal	92	0	73	73
Balasore	98	1	77	78

Gajapati	143	5	78	83
Overall	730	16	398	414

(Source-Field Survey)

Amongst all the women surveyed there were only 16 who were below 19 years of age and it was found in the survey that all these women received benefit under the NMBS/JSY. Therefore, the survey did not find any discrimination on the basis of age of the mother in receiving the cash benefit under NMBS/JSY. It seems as if the Court order in relation to removing the restriction on age is being followed.

6.2c. by number of children

District	No. of eligible women covered	No. of eligible women who received monetary benefit:		
		No. who had 2 or less children	No. who more than 2 children	Total
Nuapada	397	148	32	180
Kandhamal	92	51	22	73
Balasore	98	69	9	78
Gajapati	143	73	10	83
Overall	730	341	73	414

(Source-Field Survey)

As per the survey out of 730 eligible women 414 have received monetary benefit. Out of those 414 beneficiaries 341 have less than 2 children.

Table-6.3.Total Amount Received

District	Total amount received by women who had hospital delivery and received benefit		Total amount received by women who had home delivery and received benefit	
	< Rs. 1400	>=Rs. 1400	< Rs. 500	>=Rs. 500

Nuapada	1	163	0	16
Kandhamal	0	69	0	4
Balasore	0	77	0	1
Gajapati	0	83	0	0
Overall	1	392	0	21

(Source-Field Survey)

It has been found out that all benefits were given in only one installment in all the districts. In Gajapati and Kandhamal districts all beneficiaries received Rs 1400 as cash benefit. Around 10 percent beneficiaries of Balasore district received more than 1400 rupees, including the money given for travel. In the other places the travel money was invariably taken away by the ASHA. One beneficiary has got Rs 1000 because they lived in urban area.

For home deliveries, all beneficiaries got Rs 500 in one installment.

Out of 414 beneficiaries one had received less than Rs 1400, 392 had received Rs 1400 or more and 21 had received Rs 500 or more. The payment for institutional delivery was through bank payment and for home delivery cash payments were made. There was confusion on whether any benefit was given to women who have home deliveries. During the FGDs as well many said that the Rs. 500 provision irrespective of the place of delivery had been called off. There was clearly, a lack of awareness among the people about the benefits under this scheme. In fact, one ANM also agreed she herself was confused about the prevailing norms of this scheme.

During the survey some further problems related to JSY were also brought out, mainly relation to the quality of care in the government institutions where women go for institutional deliveries. There is a provision under NRHM for the government health institutions to spend Rs 1500 in case a cesarean delivery is needed and a specialist is not available. In Bhogarai block of Balasore district there is no specialist doctor in the CHC, Bhogarai but they can arrange for a specialist from nearby Digha (state of West Bengal). However, the CHC sends patients away simply telling them that there are not facilities available. So, the women have to depend on the governmental hospital of another state with no monetary support. The ASHAs are also not interested as there is not benefit for them also.

In the FGDs the women were asked how the money that they got under NMBS/JSY. It was seen that mostly the money was spent around the event of the delivery. The money was used on expenses such as doctor's fee, vehicle hiring, purchase of medicine and other expenses for the mother and child.

Findings and Recommendations:**Major Findings**

The result of the survey suggests the scheme is almost non functional in the state. Only 7% of the eligible women got benefits under the scheme. However it is as high as 91% in case of JSY, this shows that the JSY is functioning quite well and NMBS is almost non functional. The state government is of the opinion that the NMBS scheme has been phased out in spite of clear order of the Supreme Court that it can't be stopped without its permission. It is clear violation of courts order. In most of the villages people have no idea about the NMBS and even if they know they are not sure whom to approach. It means the government has not disseminated the information regarding the scheme as directed by the court.

It came out in the FGDs most of the women used the money they got under the scheme on food and medicine, so it need to be implemented in its letter and spirit. These are few recommendations for proper implementation of the scheme.

1. The state government should regularize the NMBS abiding the Courts order. The benefits should be provided to all the pregnant women from the BPL families 8-12 prior to the delivery irrespective of age and number of births.
2. The details of NMBS and JSY should be displayed in public places like ICDS centers, Panchayat buildings, Hospitals and also through other mediums. It will help the beneficiaries get an idea and understanding about both the schemes so that they can avail the benefits.
3. The state government should review the bottlenecks in the NMBS and ensure regular fund flow under the scheme.
4. The Village health committees should be made functional and have the rights to review the schemes and give feed backs to the officials.

7. NATIONAL FAMILY BENEFIT SCHEME

7.1. Introduction

The National Family Benefit Scheme is one of the components of the National Social Assistance Programme. NFBS is a one-time relief of Rs. 10,000 to the family that has lost the primary bread winner within four weeks through a local Sarpanch. The implementation of this scheme has been quite poor right from the beginning. Allocations are low and there is no monitoring of the scheme. Further the procedures to get benefit under the scheme are very complicated making it almost impossible for any poor family to prove their eligibility and get the benefit on time. As a result there is a large backlog of applications, sometimes going back to 6-7 years or even more, pending in many states.

7.2. Supreme Court Orders on NFBS

Supreme Court Orders on NFBS

As with other food-related schemes, the Supreme Court order of 28th November 2001 calls for prompt implementation of the National Family Benefit Scheme. BPL families are to be paid Rs 10,000 within four weeks through the local Sarpanch when the breadwinner dies.

- As with NOAPS, this scheme is not to be discontinued or restricted in any way without the permission of the Supreme Court.
- None of the benefits should be withdrawn from this scheme as a result of this order till further orders, by any of the State Governments or Union Territories.

Table-7.1(Sample covered in the survey)

District	No. of Villages Covered	No. of eligible families covered:			Sex of Deceased	
		Deceased member was an "earning" member	Deceased member was not an "earning" member	Total	Male	Female
Nuapada	10	112 (91.1)	11 (8.9)	123	72 (58.5)	51 (41.5)
Kandhamal	10	70(97.2)	2 (2.8)	72	45 (62.5)	27 (37.5)
Balasore	10	25 (100)	0 (0)	25	24 (96.0)	1 (4.0)

Gajapati	10	95(93.1)	7 (6.9)	102	67 (65.7)	35(34.3)
Overall	40	302 (93.8)	20 (6.2)	322	208 (64.6)	114 (35.4)

(Source-Field Survey)

(Figures in brackets refer to the percentage of figure out of total family covered)

During the survey 322, BPL families where there was a death of an adult in the 18 to 64 year age group during January 2005 to October 2009 were identified (123, 72, 25 and 102 in survey villages of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and 'Gajapati district respectively). It was seen that almost all the deceased were earning members of the family. The percentage of earning members was around 91, 97, 100 and 93 for the survey villages of Nuapada, Kandhamal, Balasore and 'Gajapati district respectively. The overall percentage was 93.8.

The percentage of married deceased was around 90 for Kandhamal & Gajapati, 85 for Nuapada and 100 percent for Balasore district.

Table-7.2.Coverage under NFBS

District	No. of Families Covered	No. of eligible families who received benefit under NFBS:			No. of eligible families who received benefit under NFBS:		
		When deceased was male	When deceased was female	Total*	Deceased was a married person	Deceased was not a married person	Total
Nuapada	123	4	3	7 (5.7)	7	0	7
Kandhamal	72	2	2	4 (5.6)	4	0	4
Balasore	25	0	0	0 (0)	0	0	0
Gajapati	102	5	2	7 (6.9)	7	0	7
Overall	322	11	7	18 (5.6)	18	0	18

(Source-Field Survey)

** Figures in the brackets are percentage figures.*

From the survey it is seen that the NFBS is almost non-functioning in the state and this is a matter of great concern. Only 7 (5.7 %) out of 123 families in Nuapada, 4 (5.6 %) out of 72

families in Kandhamal and 7 (6.9 %) out of 102 families in Gajapati where there has been a death of an adult in a BPL family, has the family received any cash benefit. In Balasore there was not a single beneficiary. Overall only about 6% of all the eligible beneficiaries received benefit under NFBS. All the eligible families who got benefit under NFBS were those where the deceased person was married.

Table-7.3.Timing of Payment

District	Number of eligible families who received NFBS	Timing of Payment					
		Within 4 weeks since death	1 to 3 months after death	4 to 6 months after death	7 months to one year after death	13 months to 5 years after death	More than 5 years after death
Nuapada	7	0	0	2	0	5	0
Kandhamal	4	0	0	1	0	3	0
Balasore	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Gajapati	7	1	1	1	0	3	1
Overall	18	1	1	4	0	11	1

(Source-Field Survey)

Even for those who got the benefit, the payment was very much delayed. Out of 7 beneficiaries, 2 received benefit within 4-6 months and the rest 5 only one year or more after the death; in Nuapada district. Similarly out of 4 beneficiaries one had got within 4-6 months and rest 3 had got 13 months to 5 years after the death in Kandhamal district. But in Gajapati district each one had got within 4 weeks, 1 to 3 months, 4 to 6 months and more than 5 years and 3 had got within 13 months to 5 years after the death. So the major proportion of beneficiaries had got within 13 months to 5 years after the death.

Table-7.4-Amount of Payment

District	Total amount received			
	< Rs. 10000		>=Rs. 10000	
	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
Nuapada	1	14.3	6	85.7
Kandhamal	0	0	4	100

Balasore	0	0	0	0
Gajapati	0	0	7	100
Overall	1	5.6	17	94.4

(Source-Field Survey)

It was a good sign that almost all the beneficiaries received the entire amount of Rs 10000/-; except one in Nuapada district.

Findings and Recommendations:

The death of any earning member in a poor family would have a high impact on the family and many times pushes the family further down to the margin of subsistence. Therefore, this scheme is the most significant in a sense that this is the only insurance scheme which provides immediate help for the people living in poverty and destitution.

However the survey shows that only 5.6% of the families got their entitlement. It was also reported that out the people who got the benefits there were huge delays in most of the cases with nearly 60 percent of the families getting the benefit one year after the death. However in 95% of the cases the family got the full amount. It was also observed from the FGDs very few families applied for the scheme due to low level of awareness among people over the scheme.

The following are some suggestions for effective implementation of the scheme:

1. The detailed provisions of the scheme should be pasted/displayed in public buildings such as Panchayat building, hospitals, block headquarters, anaganwadi centers etc to enhance the level of awareness among people over the scheme which abysmally low.
2. The state government should ensure timely disposal of money to the districts and strictly instruct the district collectors to disburse the money to the beneficiaries within a month.
3. The state government should take urgent steps to settle all the pending claims for the last few years.