

2011

Valley of Food Insecurity and Chronic Hunger

A report

**Field Status of Government programs under Sardar Sarovar Dam
Project affected villages in Alirajpur district of Madhya Pradesh, India**

[Type the author name]

Report from
Office of the Advisor to the Supreme Court
Commissioners (Writ petition 196/2001- PUCL vs UoI
and Oths), Madhya Pradesh, India



Valley of Food Insecurity and Chronic Hunger

(Field Status of Government programs under Sardar Sarovar Dam Project affected villages in Alirajpur district of Madhya Pradesh)

July 2011

Fact-finding team

Sachin Kumar Jain (State Advisor)
Rolly Shivhare, Madhukar & Soumitra Roy (Researchers)

Report from

Office of the Advisor to the Supreme Court Commissioners
(Writ petition 196/2001- PUCL vs UoI and Oths)
C/o Vikas Samvad, E-7/226, 1st Floor, Opp. Dhanvantri Complex,
Arera Colony, Shahpura, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh

A. Preface

Food insecurity and Hunger project

B. Summery

Key Findings

Chapter 1

Food (in)Security in Submergence Affected Villages of Alirajpur

Chapter-2

Analysis of Food (in)Security

Chapter 3

Status of the Public Distribution System

Chapter 4

Status of ICDS

Chapter-5

Status of Mid-day-Meal scheme

Chapter- 6

Groaning in Submergence

Chapter-7

Displacement and Social Security

Chapter-8

Status of basic Health Services

Chapter-9

NREGA- Threat to livelihood?

Chapter 10

Recommendations

A. Preface

Food insecurity and Hunger project

The recent visits to Aanjanwada and Bhitada in south-western Madhya Pradesh have provided yet another telling instance of how the current model of development is being implemented: at the expense of self-dependence, sovereignty, and financial independence of communities. This rough-shod top-down model of development has enslaved communities and delivered them to the doorstep of hunger, starvation, and food insecurity. Communities, that were once self-dependent and sovereign, are today dependent on benefits of government schemes. What is being done is startlingly well-planned and equally well executed, so that society becomes a colony of state.

A writ petition 196/2001 (PUCL Vs UOI and Others) was filed in Supreme Court of India. The petition was filed after two kinds of news emerged from across the country: overwhelming pilferage and wastage of grain, on one hand, and so many citizens continuing to live with hunger, on the other. The Court has stated repeatedly that no one should sleep with hunger in this country. Many interim orders have been passed on the petition. There are various government schemes related to this case, like ICDS, MDM, PDS, NREGA, and there are others too that are more indirectly linked to the right to food.

To monitor the progress in the case and monitor implementation of its orders, the Supreme Court has appointed two Commissioners at the national level and their Advisors at state level. The State Advisor of Madhya Pradesh has recently visited the submergence affected areas and villages of Sardar Sarovar Project in Alirajpur, which lies in south west Madhya Pradesh. The report in your hands is a result of this visit. Before detailing the observations and findings, it is imperative that one considers the related history in brief.

In 2004, a report on the status of these villages was sent to the Commissioners to the Supreme Court at the national level. It was on the basis of this 2004 report that Dr. N.C. Saxena, Commissioner to the Supreme Court, had issued directives to the then Chief Secretary Mr. Vijay Singh. One of the most important of the various directives that resulted relates to the directions given so that all the SC/ST families affected by the Sardar Sarovar Project (SSP) are covered under AAY scheme.

In 2010, a people's organization working in this region forwarded two applications to the State Advisor regarding violation of right to food. Based on the applications from the villagers forwarded by the organization, the Advisor office sent a letter to the District Collector of Alirajpur asking for requisite action. In its reply to the Advisor, the district

administration sent a report based on an inquiry conducted by SDM Jamuna Bhide. The report stated that all the schemes were being properly implemented in the village and people were getting their benefits. The mismatch on paper between what the villagers were saying and what the report of the district administration stated, resulted in the Advisor office deciding to make a visit to ascertain facts. The State advisor, along with a team of researchers (Mr. Soumitra Roy, Mrs. Rolly Shivhare, and Mr. Madhukar) therefore travelled to Alirajpur district.

In his visit, the State advisor found lots of people still living in the villages affected by SSP, even though they have lost the means of livelihood because of the project. This has resulted in a situation of food insecurity. In its report, the state administration has said that all the residents have been compensated and that they have been living in the villages due to the fact that they were against the project. However, the team found that since these residents were not given any proper means of livelihood as an alternative, they are still living in their villages. The rehabilitation process has proved to be replete with flaws in planning and implementation due to which residents have not got their due. And, now they are facing the predicament of food insecurity and starvation. In these circumstances the residents expect the government to play the role of their constitutional guardian.

In its report, the district administration has said that all the schemes are running without any hitch and there are no cases of starvation, hunger, or food insecurity. The villagers whose affidavit has been attached in the report said that they didn't know what was written in the document they were asked to sign. They were not told about the content of the document.

Various schemes like PDS, ICDS, MDM, and NREGA have all been found to be completely dysfunctional in the villages visited and there are evidences of large-scale corruption in almost all the schemes. The people for whom the schemes were devised have got virtually no benefits. There is no public transportation for going to these villages. And, there has been no monitoring mechanism for any of the schemes due to lack of transportation system.

Special action plan for the villages: What is important to note that the conclusion arrived by the State Advisor is that these villages are in an entirely different situation from others, which makes the conditions of life and governance extremely difficult. These areas are inaccessible, and there was a dire need of a special action plan to address these particular needs of the area. But, such steps have not been taken.

BPL survey in the villages: The survey carried out to find eligible candidates for BPL, has been found to be dotted with flaws. Many eligible residents, living in very poor conditions have not been included. The district administration has acted whimsically on the issue and asked the villagers to appeal within 10 days of publication of the list. The procedure, as per

directives of Supreme Court, is meant to be open throughout the year. It is the responsibility of administration to verify the claims and modify the list as per the claims. There hasn't been any action on the claims by the Tehsildar of the area. As a result, residents of these villages have been suffering for many years. One directive issued in 2004 by Dr. N.C. Saxena, Commissioner of Supreme Court of India, states that all the SC/ST families affected by SSP should be covered under AAY. Yet, till today, many of these families are listed as APL.

ICDS: On paper there is an allocation of nutrition for aanganwadis since November 2009. But, none of this allocation has reached the actual beneficiaries. The inquiry by the SDM is completely silent on this matter. It has been decided that an inquiry committee headed by District CEO Mr. Amarपाल Singh, to also include Mr. Shrikant and Kailsah Aawasya, will be set-up to probe the matter. For fair and transparent inquiry, a joint committee was necessitated.

Claims under forest right act: Residents of these affected areas have been largely dependent on their land for livelihood; land is what has given them their sovereignty and food security. Yet, they have not been compensated for their land that has been acquired. A total of 146 residents from Bhitada and Aanjanwada had applied for patta under FRA. They should be given pattas of public land as soon as possible so that they can create at least basic livelihood.

MNREGA: Job card holders in the villages surveyed need jobs under MNREGA. A majority of them have in fact asked for jobs following the procedures. But they were not given jobs. In the few cases when they got work, their wages have been found to be pending for long. The community had also applied for un-employment allowance and compensation for delayed wages. All these demands are as per the provisions of MNREGA. But, the administration has been delaying taking necessary action on these demands.

The administration has said that there is not much scope for work under MNREGA as the resources surrounding the village belongs to the forest department. It is to be noted that forest department is an implementing agency under the act; here, the department appears to have been responsible for creating maximum hurdles for people. Residents of the village informed the Advisor that work – like making approach roads, treatment of hills, amongst others akin – can be done in the area. It is telling that despite their ambitions the people of the affected villages are suffering.

Methodology for study

1. Complaints from the people's organization and community members sent to administration for action.
2. A report from the district administration resulted.

3. To assess ground realities, a study visit of 2 villages (Aanjanwada & Bhitada) proposed.
4. Team visited the area on 16-18th, May 2011. District officials accompanied the team during the entire visit. The team stayed in Aanjanwada on the night of 16th May. Only during the night of the 16th were district officials not present with the team.
5. Team reached villages on 16th May and discussed various issues with residents. One primary objective was to ascertain claims made in affidavits attached with the district administration's report.
6. Participatory analysis of food security of villagers conducted in 3 different groups.
7. Discussions conducted with other beneficiaries in the villages and with the SHG that runs sanjha chulha, the ration shop, the aanganwadi worker, the health worker, and the multi-purpose worker.
8. Discussion with various officials of the district administration at multiple levels – the then collector in-charge, District CEO, Sub-divisional magistrate, CDPO, Health Supervisor, District Supply officer, and a representative from the Forest Department.
9. After the study visit of the respective villages, a discussion was held with District Administration on findings of the study and future course of action.

B. Summery

Key Findings

1. **Food insecurity:** Families affected by submergence in these villages have to live with hunger for around 4 months of the year. Using even an inflated count, they get ration sufficient for no more than 8 months of the year. To stretch this ration and make it last for 12 months, residents have to sleep with hunger. District administration has not analyzed the status of food insecurity amongst families living in the villages affected by the project. An average family needs 9.46 quintal of ration per year. But the supply of ration to these families is much lower than this requirement. There is a deficit of almost 65% in need and supply of nutritious ration for these families.

2. **Identification of BPL families:** Contrary to the view of the District Administration, 65 families of Aanjanwada, who are not considered eligible for a BPL card by the authorities, have been found struggling with food insecurity and issues of livelihood loss. The average annual family income for a family of 7 is Rs. 27,000. This amount comes to Rs. 10.71 per head per day. While the annual income is Rs. 27,000, virtually all families suffer from debt, which itself averages out to Rs. 7,000 per family. There is utter disregard to the directions given by Dr. N.C. Saxena, supposed to ensure coverage of all the SC/ST families under AAY.

3. **Public distribution system:** A total of 44 quintals of ration is supposed to be dispatched to the PDS shop of Aanjanwada. But, Huma Patel who runs the PDS shop catering to the villages said he only gets 12-14 quintals of ration. There has been wide scale irregularity in ration distribution under PDS and the Sarpanch and Secretary of Sakarja village panchayat's role in this was found to be quite evident. Against a quota of 62 quintal, only 7 quintal is reaching the shop in Bhitada. The Sarpanch of Bhitada has been distributing ration to BPL and APL families at the same rate and has been compensated for the loss from gram sabha funds. He has been successful in carrying out this process because there are no mechanisms for monitoring the schemes. For many years, the cost of transportation of ration from Bakhatgarh to the village has been met by the Sarpanch himself. This comes to around Rs. 45,000 per year. There hasn't been any allocation of funds for transportation of ration to the village. A total of 63 families of Aanjanwada had applied for AAY cards, but these cards have not been granted. The administration has asked families to first get their names on the BPL list. This violates the orders of the Supreme Court of India. On 14th Feb. 2006 the Court ordered that there would no necessity of getting BPL cards for availing benefits of AAY.

4. **Integrated child development scheme:** Due to the lack of responsibility and monitoring mechanism, ICDS has completely collapsed in the villages of Aanjanwada, Bhitada and

Doobkheda. The SHG responsible for providing hot cooked meal has stocked the ration meant for 17 months at their home. ICDS is successful here only on paper. The visit of ANMs and health workers is irregular and complete immunization has not happened in the villages. Other service provided by ICDS has been non-existent in the villages. In Bhitada the AW helper used to give a handful of take-home ration to every child. There are 321 AWC under CDPO of Sondwa Block.

5. **Mid-day Meal Scheme:** The SHG responsible for MDM in the village of Aanjanwada has not been conducting itself in accordance with its responsibilities. The villagers informed the team that there has been no regular distribution of MDM in the school. There are 58 children enrolled in the school of Aanjanwada, where the daily average attendance is of 38 children. The allocation is for all 58 children. In Bhitada there are 3 schools; none of them open regularly. Teachers of the school come from other villages.

National maternity benefit scheme/ Janani Suraksha Yojana:

In these villages no benefits of these schemes are being provided to pregnant and lactating women. The scheme has been limited to immunization only, and in none of the villages are all women and children immunized. Visit of ANM in Aanjanwada is not regular. If there is any emergency, the women have to be taken to Kakrana SHC which is 12 kms from the village. It takes around 2 hours to traverse these 12 kms. If there are more serious cases, going to Sondawa becomes necessary. It takes Rs. 3000 to get emergency medical service. Other benefits of the scheme have also bypassed the women; there have been just 2 institutional deliveries in the village.

Social Security Pension: There are 23 individuals in the village of Aanjanwada who have crossed the age of 65 and are eligible for old age pension, but since their names are not on the BPL list they are not getting benefits of the scheme. Similarly, there are 3 widows who are eligible for widow pension. Due to the flawed BPL list they have been deprived of benefit.

Health Services: In 15 out of 26 affected villages, the situation is such that even a small health incident becomes a major problem. There is no connectivity to these villages, which in case of emergency, creates disastrous situations. There is a lack of doctors in the villages. The visit of the health supervisor and others is highly irregular. Since all of these villages are close to stagnant water, there is a high incidence of water borne diseases, which residents say wasn't the case earlier when the river flowed freely.

Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act: There are 27 families in Aanjanwada who do not have job cards. They applied for it many times but to no avail. Now, with no job card, they are unable to work under this scheme. Also, as per the villagers,

payment of wages in many of cases has been pending for long. A demand for work by 18 residents of the village was made on 5/01/09, but for 52 days but they did not get any work. On 22/11/10, a total of 87 people of the village demanded job by handing an application to the Janpad CEO, but they did not get any job. There have been cases in which people worked on a job in the village, but no entry has been made in their job cards. Payment of wages has been pending in many cases.

Chapter 1

Food (in)Security in Submergence Affected Villages of Alirajpur

Introduction

This report is on food-nutrition insecurity and starvation in 15 villages of Alirajpur district, Madhya Pradesh, which are affected by submergence of the Sardar Sarovar Project. A report on these villages was sent to Commissioners of Supreme Court in 2004 and in 2005. It was mentioned in the first report of September 2005 that wide discussion on Sardar Sarovar Project and displacement caused by it and its effects on marginalized communities had been taking place. Hunger and poverty in these areas in the name of development was raised.

In 2004, most tribal inhabitants of submergence affected villages of Alirajpur Tehsil (it was made a district in 2008, prior to which it was part of Jhabua district) had to travel 3-5 hours on boat to get to the nearest ration shop. After construction of Sardar Sarovar dam the approach road to these villages got submerged. In this scenario, no special mode of transportation was made available for the villagers. After dismantling sources of livelihood, Jhabua administration began arranging for the supply and distribution of ration in these villages of between 300-400 persons. This arrangement was made, not for the entire year but, for the months of monsoon and flood. There have been instances when 1.5 quintals of ration have been distributed to residents of 10 villages. This ration has been distributed from the ration shop of Mathwad. Reaching this shop for the villagers has been an ordeal in itself. To ensure food security in these villages during monsoon season, there was no arrangement of ration shops in every village.

Relief camps were established in Kakrana and Chikalda. In these camps every "homeless" tribal family was given 500 grams of grain every day. The administration based its calculation on the assumption that, if given at one time, the tribals will sell the ration and buy liquor. To obtain the ration, villagers had to travel daily to Kakrana and Chikhalda relief camps. The government made a ridiculous guideline that those families who have lost their land but haven't lost their house will not get ration.

As per guidelines of FAO, every human has the right to remain free from hunger. Those unable to arrange for food themselves due to physical disability, economical reasons, or discrimination, are entitled to food from the government. This guideline is relevant because India is a signatory to the convention on the Right to Food, which mandates these guidelines.

The government overlooked the fact that land was in valley while houses were on hills so there was no question of houses submerging immediately. More importantly, submergence of cultivable land was what was responsible for food insecurity. At that time, the government informed the team of researchers that it has arranged for a mobile ration shop on boat which goes to 10 villages in a week with 1.5 quintal of ration. These 15 villages have a majority of families whose land has submerged fully after 1996 and they do not have any means of agriculture.

For 450 such families, 1.5 quintal of ration was released once a week. The aanganwadis functioned in such a way that, children below 6 years, and pregnant and lactating mothers had to travel 2 kms across the hills. Despite this, AWCs were not providing all the services. Supplementary nutrition would not reach these centers for periods running into 1-2 years at a time. With increase in the height of the dam and its water level, these 15 villages of Alirajpur were gripped in a circle of starvation, poverty, and exploitation.

Before their land was submerged under the water dammed by SSP, every family in these villages had 15 to 25 acres of irrigable and cultivable land. Between 3-5 patta holders were dependent on it. The tribal community had developed their own ways of irrigation. By using the force of gravitation they had made canals on the hills through which they would bring water to their lands. And they would get two to three crops in a year

In these areas 9 to 11 different crops were produced at a time, so that they could ensure proper nutrition as per changing weather. The Nayak and Bhilala communities lived in these villages and they produced every thing they needed apart from salt and sugar, and they were not dependent on the market for their needs. Termed as synonymous to development, the SSP project ended the sovereignty of these families, and now they are fully dependent on the market and government's ration shop for their needs.

Supreme Court's report Goes Unheeded

Based on a report presented by the MP support group on the right to food campaign, commissioners to the Supreme Court directed the then MP Chief Secretary Vijay Singh to:

1. Cover all the SC/ST families of submergence affected villages under AAY
2. Arrange permanent ration shops running throughout the year in affected villages
3. Ensure distribution of MDM through Jeevanshalas run by the local CBO, since there was either no school, or the schools were not functional in the villages
4. Appointment of special officer for every 7-10 villages to monitor status of food security

5. Families affected by the project be rehabilitated as per their rights and situations. They should be compensated for the loss of land, trees, and other resources, so that their food security is ensured.

Even after 5 years, the MP government has not done anything to ensure implementation of these instructions.

Findings of the baseline study conducted in 2005:

No nutrition without food: This study revealed that the amount of food and nutrition required for ensuring food security wasn't available in these villages. During this study, sarpanch of Bhitada said there were 125 ration card holders in the village. If provided ration at the rate of 3 kg a month then 43.75 quintal of ration would be required, but the administration distributed only 5 quintals of ration between Nov. 2004 and April 2005.

No Aanganwadi, No School: All the affected villages have 4-7 hamlets and distance between them is more than a kilometer. Aanganwadi don't exist in these villages. The administration never tried to find out the situation and status of schools.

Water borne diseases- Since the whole area was in the proximity of the dam, it had stagnant and polluted water which were causing water borne disease. Number of crocodiles in the dam also increased. The biodiversity and the vegetation-bacteria system were also affected. Lack of health services contributed to the spread of disease.

Village cut off from approach road- After submergence, approach roads to the villages were lost under water, which cut off the villages and hamlets from each other. Villagers were forced to live in isolation.

Based on a second report, Commissioners of the Supreme Court wrote once again to the Chief Secretary of Madhya Pradesh on 29th March 2005. The missive clearly mentioned that the MP government was doing nothing to tackle the problem of food insecurity and starvation in affected areas. It appears the government did not issue any action taken report on this letter.

Failure of Madhya Pradesh Government

The Madhya Pradesh government needed to make arrangements, not for any common village, but for villages affected by the Sardar Sarovar project. It was required that the government should conduct an analytical study on the problems faced by affected villages. Since there were people living in these villages affected by SSP, their need assessment should have been done. First and foremost, requirement for any development and protection of human rights in these villages was the establishment of transportation system through water.

The transportation system would have made it easier for delivering various services such as ration, nutrition, immunization; also it would have helped in monitoring.

Contribution of SSP in development of the country may be debatable but there is no doubt in the fact that the MP government has failed to provide a secure and respectable life to families affected by SSP. After a long struggle by the people's movement, a process of rehabilitating the affected in the state of Gujarat was initiated. It was a traumatic period for the families, as they didn't want to leave Madhya Pradesh. For them, leaving Madhya Pradesh would mean abandoning their culture, identity, and roots. Still, due to adverse conditions, they accepted their fate and went to Gujarat. However, to their dismay, they found that the land allotted to them was either unproductive or someone else's possession. Those who got the land didn't get the *pattas* in the next four years.

Under these circumstances, the families who had gone to Gujarat stated returning to Madhya Pradesh. In the meanwhile, Madhya Pradesh government removed these residents from their records, and on paper started believing that all the villages were vacant. In this context, the decision of the grievance redressal

On humanitarian grounds, it is the responsibility of the District Administration to ensure transparent implementation of schemes and policies of the government, right to life with dignity, participation of community, and to prevent discrimination of tribal communities. Especially with respect to decisions on the right to food for tribals, none should have been made without full participation of the communities, so that decisions that may bring future harm can be challenged. (FAO Guidelines)

authority (GRA) of Narmada is of special importance. GRA, in its decision, has said that those families who didn't want to settle in Maharashtra and Gujarat should be provided land in Madhya Pradesh. In the wake of this decision, a policy was made which said that those families that had bought land on their own will be provided with a financial package. The government made a provision of Rs. 5.56 lakhs for each family buying land on its own. As per the policy, the first installment of 2.28 lakh was to be paid initially, and the 2nd installment, after presenting the copy of the registry. This policy resulted in a colossal 'fake registry scam' by a nexus of NVDA officials, revenue department, district administration, and land mafia. The MP government formed an inquiry commission headed Justice Jha, a retired justice of Madhya Pradesh High court, who found that through 8,000 fake registries, a scam worth Rs. 500 crore has taken place. This was the figure in 2008. The Justice Jha inquiry still continues.

Does this Rehabilitation Matter?

It has been found repeatedly in the study that the communities affected by SSP have been forced to bear the wrath of the administration's carelessness and organized corruption. This

first ended what was a content life, not without hardship, but devoid of hunger and full of independence. It then made them dependent. Once proud and self-sufficient, the communities lost the ability to fend for themselves. And, finally the mismanagement and rank corruption, has converted them into refugees in their own land.

When discussing food security with respect to tribal communities, the understanding has become one of how we can ensure tribals maintain control over their own resources. Fencing ourselves and discussing only agriculture, when thinking of food security, is incorrect. The importance of other resources belonging to communities need to be understood too.

All laws related to land in our country talk about personal land holding and land right, but most important factor influencing the life and security is common land, water resource, and forest. The Government is talking about providing land to these families, but it hasn't been cleared that, will these families get access and ownership to forest, water, and other resources at the place where they will be settled? It is to understand that a tribal community's sovereignty depends not only on its land holding but the community's rights on forest, water and other resources. Displacement has a devastating effect on the community rights and common resource ownership of tribals. This is how displacement harms them the most.

Aanjanwada, Struggling for the Bare Minimum!

The team had an extended discussion with the community in Aanjanwada village. Only 3 out of 65 families have revenue land in the village, and this too is only around 5 acres. Villagers said that before the Sardar Sarovar Project their community had access to natural resources over a 2000 hectare area. The forest and a freely flowing Narmada fulfilled all of their needs.

However, when the government discussed rehabilitation with the community, only the idea of compensating privately owned land was laid down. There was no mention of compensation for community owned 2,000 hectares of forest, the loss of water resources, and the loss of livestock maintained on this natural resource base.

"We aren't demanding more but give us at least what you have taken from us."

Their questions are very direct. People here believe that modern development not only snatches resources but also self-respect.

Is this, what our constitution says?

Letter of Displaced Families Unearths the Facts!

The Madhya Pradesh Advisor to Supreme Court Commissioners received a letter from the villagers of Aanjanwada, of Sondwa block, Alirajpur district. The letter stated that in 8

months, between January and August 2010, 3 villages received but 10 quintals of wheat, 200 litres of kerosene, and 1 quintal of sugar and salt. It said that the families were doomed to live with hunger as they were not issued BPL or AAY cards but APL cards. The families had applied for BPL/AAY cards 4 times between 2006 and 2010 at the tehsil office. However, 4 years proved insufficient for the administration to process their applications.

Inquiry report of collector

After receiving this distress letter from the villagers, the Advisor wrote to the District Collector Mr. Ashok Deswal on December 8, 2010, asking for an inquiry into the matter and necessary action. If the facts were true, the letter made it ample clear that people were suffering from starvation and nutrition insecurity.

After getting the Advisor's letter, the administration made an inquiry and sent a report to the Advisor on December 30, 2010. In his letter, District Collector Mr. Deswal stated that this inquiry was conducted by SDM Jamuna Bhide. The report argues that in Aanjanwada and Doobkheda (*alt sp.* Doobkhadda) Rs. 1759680 and Rs. 542096 has been given to the residents as compensation. However, the Advisor has found proof that this compensation was only for houses lost in the project, and not for the loss of land, and other natural resources. To verify this and other claims made in the report sent by the Collector, the Advisor, along with his team of researchers, visited the villages on May 16-18th.

The team stayed in the village to learn about the real situation. During the team's study it emerged that, in Aanjanwada, each family on average got Rs. 29,505 as compensation for the houses they lost to the dam. In Doobkheda, this average amounted to Rs. 17,591 per family. These amounts were used by the affected families, either in Gujarat, or for constructing new houses at higher elevations in their village.

The families did not get one paisa for the massive loss of their cultivable land or the loss of their natural resource base. It is the fertile cultivable land and the natural resources that gave the communities their independence, freedom from exploitation, and food security.

Under these circumstances, the statements of the District Administration in the report, which argue that "people have stayed back even after being compensated" is irresponsible. It seems that the resident of these two villages aren't considered citizens of this country and district administration doesn't feel that it has a constitutional duty towards ensuring their rights. The study shows that the fundamental rights of these affected families are being violated constantly. The justifications used for this violation show that it is not over-sight, but a planned exercise.

The district administration has maintained in its report that ration and PDS, ICDS, MDM, health services, and schools are functioning regularly in the affected villages. But when visiting the villages, the team found that, in the last two years, supplementary nutrition has not been distributed from the ICDS center. The SHG has embezzled 32 quintals of grain and Rs. 36,000. The health department visited the village only during the pulse polio campaign, and that too only because there is provision of Rs. 5000 to rent a boat. There is no budget for providing health facility, check up of pregnant women, or for providing emergency services. As per the food and civil supply department, 44 quintals of ration was sent for Aanjanwada, but the shop operator Huma Patel maintained that only 12-14 quintals arrive every month.

The report also says that people have 3-5 acres of land. The plots of land, which are on hills, are, however, found by the team to be not so big. And, now, with their fertile lands submerged, it is only during monsoon that villagers can plant and produce one crop on what little rocky land they have, because they do not have any facility for irrigation. For a majority of the year the communities are dependent upon ration from PDS. In this context, the study team did a participatory food security analysis of villagers, conducted in the presence of SDM Jamuna Bhide, the author of the government report. The aim was to know that how much ration is available to the villagers and from which sources. It has been found that counting all the services and avenues available to villagers, ration is sufficient for only a maximum of 8 months. This quantity is being stretched to last for 12 months.

It is apparent that the residents of these affected areas have had to sleep with hunger, which has affected their, mental, physical, and social development. It is therefore, most surprising and downright callous of the administration to grant only APL card to 65 of these families.

Official present said that during the BPL survey these 65 families were not found eligible for BPL cards. The process of identifying BPL families applied is not only impractical and irregular, but in-humane and in violation of the constitution, not to mention Supreme Court orders. It violates the right to life. The District administration, in its report, has said that since all the services are being provided, there is no food and nutrition insecurity.

It is verify just these claims, which appeared to be academic and theoretical so far, that the Advisor and his team conducted a participatory food security and livelihood analysis, in the present of administration officials. In groups of 5 families, at a time, the team tried to present a practical picture of food security.

Chapter-2

Analysis of Food (in)Security

Aanjanwada village of Alirajpur district is affected by the Dam built as a part of the Sardar Sarovar Project. Boats are the only mode of transportation for reaching Aanjanwada. It takes around a 2 hour boat ride from Kakrana to reach Aanjanwada. There are 65 families in the village. Since most families live jointly, technically speaking the actual number of families might even be greater than 65. There are 154 MNREGA job card holders in this village. And, only 3 families in Aanjanwada have Pattas. One family usually has between 5-7 members, though some families have even up to 10 members.

The Narmada Valley Development Authority (NVDA), in its 2008-09 report has stated that all families affected by submergence have been rehabilitated. However, in Aanjanwada itself, there are 65 families who stay in the village, a residence that is natural and legal in light of the fact that they have not been rehabilitated as per the laws, rules, and government policies.

When the team began analyzing the state of food security in these villages it became obvious that for the proud and self-respecting tribals, speaking about starvation and hunger is not considered respectable. The residents kept said that they were nature's children, and that it is the land, forest, and Narmada that have always fed them. 'How can we accept that we have to migrate to work as laborers?' lamented the villagers. Going to the city and begging for work, sleeping with hunger, is something our community has not faced before. Jhanga Dhaniya said that 'it is only in the past 10 years that for the first time in I have been forced to migrate for work.' We never heard of people in Narmada Valley migrating for work, reiterated the villagers. It is because of helplessness that we take this step now. It is not a natural option, said the residents. Dajiya, a community elder said that 'they used to go to the market only to buy salt.' 'Everything else was produced by us to feed and fulfill all our nutritional needs' said Dajiya. Grain, spices, vegetables, and Mahua oil were all produced by the community locally until 1996, when SSP changed our lives irrevocably. Once our land and homes were submerged, we lost everything, continued Dajiya.

Taking an average of 7 members in a family, the team did a situational analysis. These centered on the following features and criteria:

1. Minimum food items required for the family, keeping in mind harsh geographical conditions and physical labor involved in their lives.
2. Sources and quantity of grain and other food items.

3. Sources and amount of total financial income.
4. Expenditure breakdown of total financial income.
5. Can the villages be taken to be free from hunger and starvation?
6. If, and how, villagers get trapped into cycles of exploitation?

Availability: Need and Lack of Food Items

Keeping in mind, the minimum need of 14 kg for adults and 7 kg for children, we found that one family required 9.24 quintal of grain in a year. The result of the analysis in Aanjanwada, keeping in mind an average population of 7 in a family, is worrying. One family has 2 acres of land on which it produces 300 quintals of grain. Jwar, Bajra, and Kultha are the major crops. The entire produce is used by the family to fulfill its own needs. The production is highly dependent on favorable monsoon. In case of drought or heavy rain, production falls and makes the situation harsher.

Since the tribals live close to nature, and have knowledge of plants and greens, they also avail of nature's gifts such as aami, piper, gondi, haldi, segla, mukkhha, during various periods of the year. The use of such gatherings is fixed in the community, as per the season and availability.

Jhangya Dhaniya says that in last 10 years they have had to accept migration as they didn't have any choice. Members from every family are going to places as far as Navsari, in Kathiawad, Gujarat. Some of them go to Baroda and Ahmedabad for work too. Saurian from the village, who is also a member of the people's movement, says that people from Jhabua-Alirajpur are considered as hardworking, honest, and peaceful, and they can be paid less than others, so they are given jobs as labors. They are also employed as construction workers. But they prefer to work as agriculture labors. Gildaar says that, while working as construction labour building buildings it seems to them that they are burdening the earth and doing injustice to it. In bad times you don't have choices. For working in farms, 4 members from a family of 7 go for work. The land owner gives them 500 gram of flour per member, apart from the wages, said Gildaar, seconded by others. Villagers from the area thus migrate for two months in which they get work for 40 days, which results in 80 kg flour for them.

In a family of 4 adults and 3 children, the ration requirement for a year is 9.46 quintal. While, through various sources (agriculture, PDS, and migrant labour) they manage to get only 4.6 quintals of ration. During the period of migration, 4 members of the family, migrating to earn together, gets Rs 400 (130 for adult, 70 for children) per day on average. So in 40 days they earn Rs. 16,000, out of which up to around Rs. 14,400 may be spent in the same period on food, transportation and medical services. This leaves them with Rs. 1600.

These families may also get ration and other food items if some payment is in kind, but this still creates the lack of necessary micro-nutrients. A family of 7 needs around 72 Kg of pulses in a year, but these families get only 13 kg, as it is very costly and the PDS shop does not sell pulses. Against 9 kg of spices, they get only 2.5 kg. Earlier the community also used to get mahua from the forest. Its oil is nutritious and has medicinal qualities. Now, against requirement of 82 liters of edible oil, an average family only consumes 14 liters. It is said that there are lots of fish which these villagers can avail. However, a closer look at the situation today reveals that only 3 months of November, December and January are favorable. In these 3 months, villagers get 60 kg of fish per family. Considering conditional requirement per family this number should be 160 kg.

It is not difficult to see how every family in Aanjanwada is facing a crisis of food security. Each family has to buy 4.64 quintals of ration from the market. But, due to financial constraints they are able to buy only 1.5 quintals. The amount of ration they lack annually thus amounts to 3.14 quintals per family. Similarly, against a requirement of 72 kg of pulses, families can only buy 13 kg from the market. These 13 kg of pulses cost each family Rs. 650 out of an overall expenditure on food of Rs. 4,250.

Table

| Ingredients | Requirement | Availability | Mkt. Purchase | Expenses | Scarcity | Hunger % |
|--|--------------|--------------------------------------|---------------|----------|--------------|--------------|
| Grain | 9.24 quintal | 4.24 quintal (farm, labour & PDS) | 1.50 quintal | Rs. 1900 | 3.14 quintal | 34% |
| Pulses | 72 kg. | | 13 kg. | Rs. 650 | 59 kg. | 82% |
| Spices | 8 kg. | | 2 kg. | Rs. 300 | 6 quintal | 75% |
| Edible oil | 82 kg. | | 14 litre | 14 litre | 68 litre | 74% |
| Fish/ animal protein | 160 kg. | 60 kg. | - | - | 100 kg. | 62.5% |
| Total lack of nutrition-rich food | | | | | | 65.5% |

It is evident that affected families have been able to fulfill 2/3rd of their ration requirement in the present conditions. They lacked 75% of micro nutrients intake required by them. The affected villages of Alirajpur lack protein, fat, and micro-nutrients like zinc and calcium. The grains they can avail only fulfill their needs for 8 months. For this ration to last for the whole year they prepare 'Rabari' (a mix of flour and water and salt).

Source of financial income and its expenditure

From the available sources of income (labor, forest produce, livestock, government schemes) one family earns Rs. 22,700 and its expenditure on basic requirements is Rs. 26,115. The remaining balance is covered by falling into debt.

| Income | | Expenditure | |
|--------------------|--------------|--------------------|--------------|
| Resources | Amount (Rs.) | Items | Amount (Rs.) |
| Migration wages | 16,000 | Food ingredients | 4,215 |
| Forest products | 700 | Social behavior | 1,500 |
| Animal husbandry | 1,000 | Health | 4,000 |
| Government schemes | 2,000 | Migration Expenses | 14,400 |
| Other Resources | 2,000 | Transport etc. | 2,000 |
| Income | 21,700 | Expenditure | 26,115 |
| Loan | 6,000 | Interest | 2,160 |
| Total Income | 27,700 | Total Expenditure | 28,275 |

Life for these families remains in deficit. The report sent by the government had also mentioned similar sources of income but that report did not try to ascertain details and thereby concluded that there is no hunger or nutrition insecurity in these villages.

Residents of Aanjanwada and Doobkheda were part of this analysis and they viewed the economics of debt as a circle of exploitation. Most of the families in the village have a debt of Rs. 7,000 to Rs. 10,000 which they had taken for marriage, medical treatment, or food. In good times, these tribal used to make jewelry out of silver, which is part of their culture. In past 10 years, however, most of this silverware has been lost to debtors. Dajiya told us that local money lenders of Alirajpur and other nearby areas would give them money, at 36% interest if they deposited their silver jewelry as security. Without family-jewels as security, the interest rates stand at 60%. A total of 39 families of Aanjanwada have deposited their silver as security which, they are not in position to get back.

The government has announced that they have not returned the debt to lenders, but people forget that in bad times, the bread we get comes from the money lenders. When the hopes are low and plates are vacant, why doesn't the government make us feel that we are living in a free, welfare state, indeed a 'socialist' one, even if one is to pay just a mere lip-service to the constitution.

The Problem of Identification; all methods have failed in identifying poor

Failing the test of poverty, even after losing every thing

Identification of families (BPL Survey) as poor seems to be a lifetime challenge for families affected by developmental projects. These families do not have enough to feed themselves, but they have been placed in the Above Poverty Line (APL) category.

How could this happen? And, how, given the geographical and financial realities, do the displaced villagers get by? These are the questions with which the team confronted the people of Aanjanwada and the Alirajpur district administration officials.

There are 54 families living in Anjanwada with an estimated population of 550. All the irrigated land has been submerged in the backwaters of Narmada. Therefore, the affected families have no option but to subsist on forest land-holdings that are 2-2.5 acre in size on average, atop the rocky hills that have become islands. Here the role of the forest department should have been to give pattas to these affected families as soon as possible, but this has not been fulfilled thus far. So, the affected families are now de-facto owners of the de-jure land of the Forest department. Neither the state govt. nor the district administration has made any effort to persuade the Forest department for allotting pattas. Hence, the people of Aanjanwada have been dodged twice. First they have been denied the right to compensation for their submerged land and after that the state government has not made them legal owners of the land they are currently holding. The people of this village are forced to live with hunger, but the district administration says that the villagers live well by farming and fishing.

The reality is that, on the uneven land in the hills, the community is able to get grains sufficient only for four months of the year. The administration says that it has been ensuring the supply of ration and other such facilities on humanitarian grounds. However, nothing has been reaching the villages in actuality. The records of various departments and testimony of villagers show that they have been getting only 80 kg of ration, which is not enough even for a month. By producing food on the hilly farms, these villagers are able to produce for at least 4 months of the year.

It is unconscionable that for the past 11 years, district administration never tried to know how the villagers were surviving. What were the people eating for 8 months of the year? On top of this, where the administration could have provided assistance, many families were classified as APL. The directives of the Supreme Court have it that the community is eligible for AAY regardless of any flawed BPL selection list.

There is a clear failure on the part of administration. Apart from a generally callous attitude, officials have been non-responsive to the demands for getting benefits of AAY. The officials have incorrectly contended that to avail benefits under AAY, residents need to be on the BPL list.

We tried to know from the people of Aanjanwada how they manage in their limited resources available and what is the status of their food security.

Apart from this they have to spend Rs. 3,000 on marriages, relatives and other such occasions. Every family has a debt of Rs.7000 to Rs.10000 which they take from local money lender after depositing silver jewelry. The interest rate after depositing silver is 36% and without it is 60%

(Gildar, jahangar, Patel, Rajya, Srbhan, Tenagrya, Bhrdya of Aanjanwada participated in this analysis in front of Madhya Pradesh advisor of Supreme Court commissioners) It was clear from the above analysis that people of Aanjanwada lived with hunger for atleast 6 months of the year, whatever they get from farming is used judiciously (**Eating one day and remaining hungry the other day**) so that it lasts for at least 3 months of the year. Ration from the PDS lasts for 1 month only that too on APL rates.

Amid these situations how are people of Aanjanwada above poverty line?

Alirajpur district administration it self is struggling to find the answers to this question, SDM Jamuna Bhide in her inquiry report had said that all the residents of Aanjanwada has been given APL card in 2006, at that time Alirajpur was a part of Jhabua district from which it was craved out in 2008. The commissioner, food and civil supplies did not passed any directive of providing BPL/AAY benefits to these families affected while SSP.

On 16th December 2010 district supply officer went to Aanjanwada for a visit where 14 families applied for BPL card, its been more than 5 months and no action has been taken on it. Administration has been saying that it has provided APL card in 2006 on humanitarian grounds.

While ensuring ownership on land for the families affected by SSP, geographical, social and economical conditions should be taken care of. Policies related to food security should be made in harmony with practices and traditions of tribal community so that there is no adverse effect on their food habit. Due to food insecurity, social functions and tradition of common fest on the occasion of marriage has also affected. This was an integral part of their culture for ages.

Before 2006, 7 people of Aanjanwada had BPL cards, now every one has APL card, there are 23 elderly people in the village ageing more than 65 and 3 widows, who are eligible for social security pension. As per the rules of MNREGA every job card holder should be provided with 100 days of job on demand, if failed to do so state government was liable to pay un-employment bonus. 154 job card holders of Aanjanwada demanded work but they didn't got any work even after demanding for it.

Doesn't this attitude of administration questions the whole process of BPL/AAY in the area?

Or

Is it a deliberately done by administration and state government to evict these people without compensating them for their land and without full filling its constitutional duties?

In the present context second question is more relevant because there were big difference as stated in the report of district administration and as found by the state advisor, also the attitude of the officials showed that government was not at all serious about providing food and nutritional security to these villagers neither did they had any policy for it. The official report mentioned the word "humanitarian ground" which indicated that the state didn't think that these people were right holders.

Ms. Jamuna Bhide in her report also said that people were living happily by farming on 3 to 5 acres of land where they were able to produce Jwar, bajra, makka, etc. Apart from this they were getting sufficient ration from PDS, thus they were getting enough nutrition and food in a year.

Now the question is how can someone produce so many crops on the land which is uneven, un-irrigable and dependent upon monsoon? If the people of Aanjanwada had enough land they could have ensured their food security, which they were doing before submergence of their land. They were producing 4 types of pulses which are rich source of protein, but on these hilly slopes it is almost impossible to produce pulses that too without any source of irrigation. It is in this context that we say, the report of SDM and district supply officer is based on misleading facts.

Fallacies of BPL survey

As per the BPL survey methodology, a 13 point criterion was used to identify poor people. If we rate residents of Aanjanwada on these points on a scale of 0-4 they fit into the poorest category.

| Indicators of BPL survey 2002 | Status in Anjanwada |
|--|---|
| Land holding by family : | There are only three land holders of revenue land in Aanjanwada, rest of the land is of forest department, for which patta is not given. |
| Type of home: | All the homes of the village are Kachcha. |
| Clothes per person: | Clothes of most of the people are torn and in shambles. |
| Food security: | In Aanjanwada, whatever they produce or get from the ration shop is not enough for them to feed the average 7 members of the family twice throughout the year . |
| Hygiene: | None of the households have Pakka toilets, no drinking water facilities; water of Narmada is used for drinking. |
| Ownership of consumer goods: | There is no electricity in the village, since all of these villages are on hilly tract there is no question of owning tractors, harvesters etc. The demand of solar lamps was not met by government. |
| Level of education of most literate person in the family: | Majority are illiterate; there was a satellite school in the village which was converted to primary school after the implementation of RTE. |

| | |
|---|--|
| Level of family labor: | Villagers have to keep working all the time to feed their families. |
| Source of livelihood: | Farming, work as laborers, ration from PDS. |
| Type of Debt: | Informal sources (local money lenders) |
| Reason for migrating out of the village: | For livelihood |
| Total annual income* | A little more than Rs. 27,000 from all the sources: be it farming, fishing, animals, chicken, migrant labour work done by at least 4 members among the average 7 members of the family. |
| Expenditure | Rs. 26,000 |
| Debt | Rs. 7,000 average for ration medical emergency |

***Annual income as per schedule 2 of survey form (BPL survey form)**

It is difficult to decide, in which category we have to put them depending upon their income, expenditure and debt. It is clear, however, that in the present conditions, people of Aanjanwada need free ration. Not only Aanjanwada but Bhitada and Doobkheda has similar tales and they are in equally bad conditions.

Not only food but nutrition security is also important

From the discussion above its clear that people of Aanjanwada need benefits of AAY as per directions of the Supreme Court appointed Commissioner's instructions. The situation of malnutrition cannot be solved by AAY alone. But for this ICDS and MDM will also need to be improved.

One thing which clearly comes out is people of these submergence affected villages haven't been given land for land. It has been an important source of livelihood for these families of scheduled tribes, which they have lost to the dam.

Chapter 3

Status of the Public Distribution System

**There are mountains on both sides.
Between them flows the Narmada.
However, the truth behind what seems
like an idyllic scene
is heart breaking.**

We started from Kakrana in Alirajpur on boat. After sometime, we were told that the spread of the Narmada out boat floated on, and virtually all around as far as the eyes could see, held farms on the most fertile land, which yielded various crops. There were 26 villages in the area, and there was also thick forest, irrigable land, livestock, and approach roads. Villages started submerging from 1996 and by 2000 they were completely engulfed by the dammed Narmada. This resulted in the loss of livelihood and food insecurity for villagers that now make up the 15 villages related to the study. As the waters rose, higher and higher, families had to move to the rocky heights in adjoining hills. They had to chose the best possible locations in atop the hills, such as those places that allowed enough flat area for a cluster of 2-3 houses, forget about the thought of farming.

The ground realities are in stark opposition and contradict the tall claims of development gained from gigantic projects like the SSP. The M.P. government had promised that all the tribals that had lost their land and houses will be compensated. The government promised land for land, which after 12 years is still be fulfilled. The M.P. government thinks that it has compensated all the displaced families, while the truth is that only few families have got 15 to 25 thousand for their house (or the hutments)

Only 9 out of 11 thousand families, which are being claimed to have been rehabilitated in state of Gujarat has got land in MP. The land allotted to the displaced in Gujrat was already occupied by locals. Thus the displaced families of MP did not got, justice and their rightful due and had to return back. For these families government claims that they have been provided land in Gujarat, still they are living in submerged area because they are against construction of the dam. The demand of land for land of tribal has not been met as of now. Thus the tribals lost every thing which they had and are now dependent upon the ration and other such services from government. These tribals do not have access even to some of the basic amenties

Supreme court on 28th November 2001 and 8th may 2002, had directed the state government to provide subsidized food grain through PDS and benefits of other welfare schemes. State government has failed to comply with the orders of the apex court, resulting in contempt of the court

On 8th October 2004 and 29th March 2009, to stop food insecurity and hunger in 16 villages Dr. N.C. Saxena, commissioner of Supreme Court of India has directed the then chief Secretary of Madhya Pradesh that all the SC/ST families affected by submergence in SSP project should be covered under Antyoday Ann Yojana. And, in every submergence affected village, grain should be distributed through the ration shop at least once a week.

On 8th December 2010 Advisor to the Commissioners, in a letter to District Collector of Alirajpur, requested the Collector to take proper action for prevention of starvation and malnutrition in submergence affected village Aanjanwada. In his letter, the Advisor has requested the Collector to inquire about the complaints of non-compliance of the Directive to cover all the families in AAY, and also about non-distribution of ration. This letter of the Advisor was based on complaints from the villagers of Aanjanwada.

In response to this letter, the Collector initiated an inquiry, citing which the Collector averred that villagers were getting the benefits of all the schemes. The report of the Collector included lists of ration allocated per month between April to December 2010. It also included an 'affidavit' by villagers which stated that they were getting benefits of all the schemes and were satisfied with the system.

It may be noted that on May 9th, 2011, Clifton D-Souza, Advisor to Commissioners in Karnataka visited the villages of Aanjanwada and Doobkhadda. In his report he Mr. D-Souza has stated that villagers have not got ration for months in 2010. At the same time, 65 families of Aanjanwada were not getting the benefit of AAY and they had been given APL cards.

Seeing the contradiction in the reports of Karnataka Advisor and the Collector Alirajpur, M.P. Advisor to Supreme Court Commissioners visited the villages of Anjanwada, Bhitada, and Doobkhadda on 16-18th May, 2011 to establish the facts. In the field visit, the State Advisor and the team of researchers found a clear divide between the reports of the administration and ground realities.

No food under PDS regularly, Ration 3 times in a Year

Aanjanwara

There are 65 families in submergence affected village Aanjanwada in Alirajpur District. Only 3 families have Patta of revenue land which measures 3.5 hectares. Rest 1,200 hectares of

land are vested with the forest department as forest land. Somehow villagers have managed to farm the hilly tract of land. The average land holding of the village is presently 2.5 acre per family. Jwar and bajra are the major crops of the village. Because of uneven nature of the land and the lack of irrigation facilities, they are totally dependent on monsoon for irrigation. In these hostile conditions, a family manages to produce 3 quintals of grain which, for a family of 7, is sufficient only for 3 months. For rest of the 9 months they are totally dependent on ration provided by government.

The administration's claim that villagers are making a living off agriculture is false.

Villagers have got ration from PDS only 3 times from January 2010 to December 2010. And, even these 3 ration deliveries have come on APL ration cards (wheat Rs. 6.10 per kg, rice Rs. 8.30 per kg). This is because no one in the village has been deemed to be BPL. The administration's report has quoted from information provided by the Manager of Cooperative Society that the village Aanjanwada has been allotted 276 quintals of Wheat under the BPL quota. This is extra-ordinary claim, in itself, as there is no BPL card holder family in whole Aanjanwada village. No one in the village has AAY card, and still the report states that 80 quintal rice was allotted under AAY quota from April to December 2010. The administration has unfortunately misled the Advisor to the Supreme Court Commissioners in a matter as important as the lives and rights to food of a hungry and stressed community.

Questions on Monitoring Mechanism

The government report has a certificate from the monitoring committee annexed to it for allocation of ration in Aanjanwada village. None of the signatories are, however, residents of Aanjanwada village. No one by the names listed live in the village.

When asked about this Rakesh Kanesh, Secretary Sakarja (Aanjanwada is in Sakarja Panchayat), said that ration in Aanjanwada is sent from Bakhatgarh, and it is unloaded from truck there only, and handed over to lead society.

As the team was not satisfied with this answer, it investigated the issue further. It appears Rajesh Kanesh took the signatures of his relatives on the name of monitoring committee, whereas the rule has it that ration must be un-loaded in front of the monitoring committee of the village so that it can be confirmed that the ration allocated is as per the quota for the beneficiary families. Monitoring committee should have people from the village, and should have representatives from SC/ST populations, and women. The provision of monitoring committee is for checking leakage of ration, but in Aanjanwada there has been no role whatsoever of the committee.

Malnourished Lives that Drag On

Food insecurity has become the reality of life of people of Aanjanwada. This is the result of paucity of ration and its irregular distribution through PDS, apart from submergence, which has left people dependent on government schemes. Not only the old residents and women, but the younger populations of the village too look fragile and weak. The team found children to be worse affected by starvation and hunger. Weak and malnourished bodies, swollen bellies, and bigger feet gave away the condition. Dhaniya Patel, an elderly man from the village, said that the government thinks that we are enjoying ourselves out here, but it is for you all to see whether we are enjoying ourselves or starving. He said that PDS has been irregular in the village since submergence. People here have devised techniques to preserve food, so that what ever is available with them lasts for longer duration of time. If the claims of government reports are considered to be correct then a majority of villagers of Aanjanwada got 5 kg of wheat from April to July 2010, and 5-15 kg of wheat from September to December 2010. The question arises again whether this much of ration is sufficient for a family of 7? Does it fulfill the directions of Supreme Court to ensure food security? Dhaniya says that people of the village have started to eat only once in a day so as to save food and make it last longer. It means that people are forced to sleep hungry. On the hills, where the distance between two houses is on an average 1 to 1 ½ kilometers, a lot of energy is consumed to go from one place to other. To sleep hungry is a kind of double whammy for women as they have to walk down to fetch water from the Narmada, at least 6-8 times a day on average. If the state government continues to fail in fulfilling its constitutional obligations, people will start dying of hunger and starvation.

There is huge difference between the ration allocated and the actual ration distributed; this in itself establishes the leakage in PDS system.

Monitoring committee is functioning through the shop owner/ sarpanch/ relatives of the distributor. The Sarpanch of Sakarja, Aapsingh also seems to be involved in it as he signed the fake certificates and gave affidavit that PDS shop was functioning properly in the village. Role of the lead society should also be probed.

1. It was also found that the Sarpanch and the Secretary of the village took thumb impressions of the villagers on plain paper which were later used for making fake affidavits about proper functioning of the PDS shop in village Aanjanwada. The ration card of villagers is in itself proving this. There have been only three entries of distribution of ration from April to December, 2010. Inquiring into the matter after letter of Advisor, Supreme Court Commissioner was sent to the district, the SDM Alirajpur Jamuna Bhide visited Aanjanwada, but she did not bother to see the ration cards or verify the facts. Ration in the village is distributed from the house of Huma Padiyar, and all the records related to distribution are given to Rakesh Kanesh. Huma told the Advisor that people were not getting ration as per their need. In 2010, ration was distributed thrice only, while this year it has not been distributed since February.

2. Ration in Aanjanwada is brought via Boat, it takes around Rs. 3,000 to Rs. 3,500 for delivery of ration from Bakhatgarh to Aanjanwada, and there hasn't been any provision made by the government for this expenditure. Once the ration has reached the village, some expenditure is required for bringing it to the shop on the hills. It is not clear who will bear this expense. For 65 families of Aanjanwada, 23 quintal ration at the rate of 35 kg per family is allotted. Apart from this, kerosene, salt, and sugar is also allocated through PDS. For delivery of such a big quantity of ration, there is need of a barge. But district administration has not arranged for a barge.
3. While making inquiries with the government, another fact came to light. In village Aanjanwada, no one was allotted rice from the APL quota. Government report details the quantity food grain, salt, and kerosene distributed to the villagers of Aanjanwada.

The report also states that beneficiaries in Aanjanwada have been allotted rice as per BPL or AAY provisions. This when there are no BPL or AAY card holders in the village. When asked about this Rajesh Kanesh said that ration for Sakarja, Khundi, Chhoti Sirkhedi, is sent from Aanjanwada. While there were no BPL families in Chhoti Sirkhedi, Sakarja has 53 BPL families and Khundi has 84. Sakarja has 12 families who are beneficiaries of AAY while there are 8 such families in Khundi. Rajesh Kanesh was unable to answer why the names of Aanjanwada villagers had been written in the affidavits. Did villagers of Aanjanwada not need rice?

Bhitada

Bhitada is 1 hour boat ride from Aanjanwada. When the team reached Bhitada, villagers informed the Advisor that **the ration cards of all the 271 families were with Sarpanch who had taken them on the pretext of making caste certificates for the villagers.** The Sarpanch also accepted this and later said that he will return the cards. The Supreme Court in a 2003 judgment has categorically said that person/s in possession of the ration cards of beneficiaries is/are liable for punishment. As per this judgment, the said Sarpanch was an offender, liable for punishment. Justifying his act, the Sarpanch said that for making corrections to the BPL list, caste certificates were necessary, and that is why he has taken the ration cards. It is worth noting that all the villagers of Bhitada are of Nayak/Nayakada, Bhilala, and other backward castes. SDM Jamuna Bhide who was present there also said that without caste certificate it was not possible to modify the BPL list. While saying so, SDM Bhide forgot that it is responsibility of the administration to verify the claims not the Sarpanch. It was clear that the present system in practice was targeting innocent tribals with the administrative complexities of the system itself.

Dr. N.C. Saxena, Commissioner to Supreme Court, in his letter to Chief Secretary, Government of India, on 8th October 2004, directed the government to cover all the SC/ ST families under AAY scheme. The General administration department of Madhya Pradesh instructed that in all the blocks it is responsibility of the administration to set up camps and issue permanent caste certificates. Despite this, people are running after notaries, tehsildars, and Patwaris, and have to spend anywhere between Rs. 300-5,000 for this petty-bureaucratic paperwork. There is no doubt that there a lack of commitment on the part of state government to provide people with their rightful dues and to make the life of the most vulnerable easier.

1. The whole ration-system has been functioning only on paper, similar to Aanjanwada village. The ration cards of all the families affected with submergence were found empty, and there has not been any mention of allocation of ration. Apart from this, all the families, APL or BPL, were being given rice at Rs. 6.5 / kg and wheat at Rs. 5 / kg. This fact was ascertained in the presence of all the relevant officials.

The Sarpanch also said the same thing. All the families (APL/ BPL) were being given ration at the same rate. When asked about how he manages the deficit due to distribution on same rate, his answer was equally surprising. The Sarpanch said that the expenses incurred on transportation of the ration from Bakhtgarah to the village, which comes at around 3,500 per month is managed by sarpanch from his pocket. This comes to a whopping Rs. 40-45,000 per year. He also said that he has been doing this for the past 5 years. He managed the loss incurred to him from the funds of Gram Panchayat meant for development of the village.

2. Officials present on the occasion maintained that ration has been distributed regularly in Bhitada between April and December 2010 through PDS, as per the needs. Official records with the government state that in April 2010 a total of 54 quintals was distributed. Similarly in May, June, July, August, September, October, and November totals of 116, 52, 48, 4, 70, 71, and 64 quintals were allotted. But the person who runs the ration shop in the village said that he never saw more than 14 "katta" (1 Katta is equal to 50 kg) of ration being unloaded for the shop.

As per the orders of the Supreme Court, 35 kg of ration per family has to be distributed. But, the government, in violation of the orders, has been distributing 23 kg of ration per family. As per the team's estimate, there is a requirement of 62 quintals of ration per month for 271 families in Bhitada. But the actual ration reaching the ration shop is 7 quintals. It was also found that there were instances when the ration shop operator has not taken ration for the shop. People of village Bhitada said that ration is being sent to villages like Khundi and

Sakarja from Bhitada. None of the officials had any answer for this. The role of food and civil supply department and the local distributor is suspect.

DoobKhadda

Ration shop of Doobkhadda is in Baramba village. The whole village of Doobkhadda is spread over 3 separate hamlets. There are 16 BPL families, 3 AAY families and 3 APL families in Doobkhadda. There are 7 people in Doobkhadda who do not have any card, so the total card holders in the village are 156 BPL, 90 APL and 25 AAY.

1. When checked, ration card of **Maniya Vesta** of Doobkhadda was found vacant. Dates of ration delivery mentioned with the district administration were found to be false. Ration cards has description of 18 kg in July 2010, 18 kg in august, no ration in September and 36 kg ration in October 2010.
2. Vakiliya Cheema, card number 020350, resident of Doobkheda informed the team in front of the District food and supply officer that this year they were given 5 kg of ration once before Holi.
3. Ration card of majority of families of Doobkhadda have not a pen-scratch on them. Villagers informed the team that they got ration only once in two months. The Food and Civil Supply officer present at the time said that the ration cards shown by the people are fakes and that the residents are lying. Despite overwhelming evidence, the team reserved its judgment on who was lying - the tribals not receiving adequate food or the officer.
4. The records, on examination, show that 42 quintals of ration and 3 quintals of sugar has been distributed in village Doobkheda. Quota of wheat is for 12 quintals, but the shop operator said that only 7 quintals of wheat, 1.5 quintals of sugar, and 3 quintals of rice was sent to the shop. The ration cards of 7 villagers, Kalu (son of nahaliya, card # 66134), Rimal son of Ugiya, card # 66126), Kalsinh (son of Modiya, card # 66125), Jamsinh (son of Nahaliya, card # 66124), Vima (son of Manu card # 66123), Kirta son of Paitwar, card # 130541), and Raniya (son of Verwa, card # 130524) were found vacant, without any mention of allocation of ration.

FAO guide lines states that people suffering from any disease or disability are ostracized in their community. If district administration doesn't come to their rescue, it can become double blow for people affected by SSP in the district of Alirajpur.

Antyoday Ann Yojana

Case of Reliya

The ancestors of Reliya, son of Verangiya, have been living in Aanjanwada for generations. Reliya's family comprises of 7 members: 6 adults and a child. Before submergence of land, the joint family of 6 brothers and a total of 23 members was able to sustain itself by farming 16 acres of patta land. They would get Jwar, bajra, bhutta, tuar, groundnut and urad from their land, the excess of which they would sell in the market. The submergence of their village and land due to the stagnating and swelling backwaters of their beloved Narmada came like a toronado in 1996 and shattered his family. Now, the 7 members Reliya's family that remain live in a hutment on the heights of a hill far above where their village and land used to be. Somehow they manage to produce millet and jwar. **Reliya has a married son, he disabled also and both of his legs do not function.** Reliya's daughter-in-law and Reliya's juvenile daughter worked in MNREGA at Rs. 122 per day. And they were to be paid Rs. 3,960 for 6 weeks of work, but this payment has not materialized as yet.

The situation of many families in Aanjanwada is similar to that of Reliya. The Bhilala tribes of the village who were self dependent before submergence and were able to lead a good life on their own terms have now lost their self esteem and with moist eyes they are demanding work as laborers so that they can feed their families.

Two questions that emerge are:

- 1. Are Reliya and other families living in similar conditions eligible for antyoday ann yojna?**
- 2. Is it possible for Reliya or other families akin to earn enough to buy ration at APL rates?**

However, these questions have been deemed irrelevant for the Madhya Pradesh government and the Alirajpur District Administration. Both believe that they have fulfilled their constitutional obligation by providing compensation for hutments lost to the backwaters and now whatever they are doing is based on humanity and not on entitlement.

The Supreme Court, in its orders, has always emphasized that it is the constitutional obligation and duty of state to make sure that no one sleeps hungry. However, the district administration is fulfilling its constitutional obligation by providing but 90 kg of ration to the villagers of Aanjanwada. And, the district administration has termed this constitutional duty as a humanitarian act.

The Antyoday ann yojana was started to ensure food security of the poor like Reliya. Such families were to get wheat at Rs. 2 per kg and rice at Rs. 3 per kg. The Supreme Court in its order dated 28th November 2001, has said that such families should be identified by January 2002 and they should be provided ration as per the norms. In another of its orders on 2nd May 2003 the Court has said that, such families where no one is able to go to work due to social customs, taking care of physically handicapped, old and ailing members should be

covered under AAY at any cost. The Supreme Court Commissioners, in their instruction of 8th October to the then chief secretary of MP had asked the government to cover all the SC/ST families of SSP under AAY.

1. The residents of Aanjanwada have been demanding AAY card for the last 5 years. A total of 63 families of the village had applied in writing at the Block office of Sondwa District, Alirajpur for Antyoday cards, but the tehsildar office asked them to submit BPL applications. Now the district administration is saying that the AAY card will be provided only to those families whose names appear on a BPL list. It is to be remembered that none of the families of Aanjanwada has their names on any BPL list. This decision is in contradiction of the Supreme Court orders of 20th April 2004 in which court has said that for the AAY card there will be no such clause needed, such as that of having names on a BPL list.

2. In the district administration's report, the District Collector has mentioned that, the Commissioner food and civil supplies never instructed them to issue BPL/AAY cards to submergence affected families. If any such instruction would have been given the then Jhabua administration (Alirajpur was part of Jhabua district till 2008) should have taken action. SDM Jamuna Bhide also said that there were no clear instructions about submergence affected areas.

Such statements are clearly nothing more than pitting the blame on others, and shirking responsibility. First the administration didn't give BPL card to families despite their demand for over 6 years. In its report district administration said that as per the BPL survey and Appeal mechanism, they published the list of BPL Families in the village in 2006, but none of the villagers made any appeal/application for resurvey for inclusion of their names, who were not included in the first list within 10 days of the publication of BPL List. It is a total misinterpretation of orders of the Supreme Court given on 14th February 2006 that states that the process of addition of names in BPL list will carry on throughout the year. In fact it was duty of the Tehsildar to verify the claims of beneficiaries within 10 days. It is surprising to witness the District administration misinterpreting the instruction for the past 5 years and functioning so arbitrarily.

3. The M.P. government has not issued the instructions despite clear directions from Commissioners of the Supreme Court.

4. Apart from Aanjanwada, 31 families from Bhitada and 17 families of Doobkhedda have applied to the Tehsildar of Sondwa in December 2010. As per rules, action should have been taken within 10 day of application, but nothing has moved in the past 5 months.

5. In present circumstances, 850 families of 26 submergence affected villages need to covered under AAY. There are 600 families who need attention on priority basis. For the past six years, families demanding their rightful dues are now on the brink of hunger and starvation. The District Collector and Tehsildar should rectify their mistakes.

As per FAO guideline (17.6) Schemes in the affected areas should be constantly monitored and reviewed by the administration. Also there should be active participation from the community so that that their society is empowered. In Alirajpur we found that there was no role of community in monitoring of schemes like MNREGA, MDM, Education, etc. There is thus no role of the community in ensuring transparency of functioning.

Chapter 4

Status of ICDS

During the visit of State Advisor, Supreme Court commissioners in writ petition 196/2001, PUCL vs UOI and Others, to monitor the implementation of schemes related to right to food ICDS scheme was also in focus. As it is meant to cater to the needs of children under 6 years of age, pregnant women, lactating mothers and adolescent girls, it covers the marginalized among marginalized. It seeks to provide young children with an integrated package of service such as supplementary nutrition, health care and pre-school education. Because health and nutrition needs of the child cannot be addressed in isolation from those of her mother, the program also extends to adolescent girls pregnant women and lactating mothers. The scheme aims to provide assistance to the mentioned target group in order to curb the cases of malnutrition among mothers and children, provide proper health check ups, pre school education and immunization. This is an important scheme which, starts taking care of a human being right from the beginning of life cycle. It in this way it helps in checking future cases of malnutrition and creates a buffer against various other health related problems by providing supplementary nutrition, immunization and pre-school education.

About Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Scheme (Brief)

Launched on 2nd October 1975, today, ICDS Scheme represents one of the world's largest and most unique programmes for early childhood development. ICDS is the foremost symbol of India's commitment to her children – India's response to the challenge of providing pre-school education on one hand and breaking the vicious cycle of malnutrition, morbidity, reduced learning capacity and mortality, on the other.

1. Objectives: The Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Scheme was launched in 1975 with the following objectives:

- i. to improve the nutritional and health status of children in the age-group 0-6 years;
- ii. to lay the foundation for proper psychological, physical and social development of the child;
- iii. to reduce the incidence of mortality, morbidity, malnutrition and school dropout;
- iv. to achieve effective co-ordination of policy and implementation amongst the various departments to promote child development; and
- v. to enhance the capability of the mother to look after the normal health and nutritional needs of the child through proper nutrition and health education.

2. Services: The above objectives are sought to be achieved through a package of services comprising:

- i. Supplementary nutrition,

- ii. Immunization,
- iii. Health check-up,
- iv. Referral services,
- v. Pre-school non-formal education and
- vi. Nutrition & health education.

The concept of providing a package of services is based primarily on the consideration that the overall impact will be much larger if the different services develop in an integrated manner as the efficacy of a particular service depends upon the support it receives from related services. Three of the six services namely Immunization, Health Check-up and Referral Services delivered through Public Health Infrastructure under the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare.

Nutrition including Supplementary Nutrition: This includes supplementary feeding and growth monitoring; and prophylaxis against vitamin A deficiency and control of nutritional anaemia. All families in the community are surveyed, to identify children below the age of six and pregnant & nursing mothers. They avail of supplementary feeding support for 300 days in a year. By providing supplementary feeding, the Anganwadi attempts to bridge the caloric gap between the national recommended and average intake of children and women in low income and disadvantaged communities.

Growth Monitoring and nutrition surveillance are two important activities that are undertaken. Children below the age of three years of age are weighed once a month and children 3-6 years of age are weighed quarterly. Weight-for-age growth cards are maintained for all children below six years. This helps to detect growth faltering and helps in assessing nutritional status. Besides, severely malnourished children are given special supplementary feeding and referred to medical services.

Immunization: Immunization of pregnant women and infants protects children from six vaccine preventable diseases-poliomyelitis, diphtheria, pertussis, tetanus, tuberculosis and measles. These are major preventable causes of child mortality, disability, morbidity and related malnutrition. Immunization of pregnant women against tetanus also reduces maternal and neonatal mortality

Health Check-ups: This includes health care of children less than six years of age, antenatal care of expectant mothers and postnatal care of nursing mothers. The various health services provided for children by anganwadi workers and Primary Health Centre (PHC) staff, include regular health check-ups, recording of weight, immunization, management of malnutrition, treatment of diarrhoea, de-worming and distribution of simple medicines etc.

Referral Services: During health check-ups and growth monitoring, sick or malnourished children, in need of prompt medical attention, are referred to the Primary Health Centre or its sub-centre. The anganwadi worker has also been oriented to detect disabilities in young

children. She enlists all such cases in a special register and refers them to the medical officer of the Primary Health Centre/ Sub-centre

Pre-School Education (PSE): The Pre-school Education (PSE) component of the ICDS may well be considered the backbone of the ICDS programme, since all its services essentially converge at the anganwadi – a village courtyard. Anganwadi Centre (AWC) – a village courtyard – is the main platform for delivering of these services. These AWCs have been set up in every village in the country. In pursuance of its commitment to the cause of India's Children, present government has decided to set up an AWC in every human habitation/ settlement. As a result, total number of AWC would go up to almost 1.4 million. This is also the most joyful play-way daily activity, visibly sustained for three hours a day. It brings and keeps young children at the anganwadi centre - an activity that motivates parents and communities. PSE, as envisaged in the ICDS, focuses on total development of the child, in the age up to six years, mainly from the underprivileged groups. Its programme for the three-to six years old children in the anganwadi is directed towards providing and ensuring a natural, joyful and stimulating environment, with emphasis on necessary inputs for optimal growth and development. The early learning component of the ICDS is a significant input for providing a sound foundation for cumulative lifelong learning and development. It also contributes to the universalization of primary education, by providing to the child the necessary preparation for primary schooling and offering substitute care to younger siblings, thus freeing the older ones – especially girls – to attend school.

Nutrition and Health Education: Nutrition, Health and Education (NHED) is a key element of the work of the anganwadi worker. This forms part of BCC (Behaviour Change Communication) strategy. This has the long term goal of capacity-building of women – especially in the age group of 15-45 years – so that they can look after their own health, nutrition and development needs as well as that of their children and families.

Situation of ICDS scheme in submergence affected villages (As witnessed by the team during the visit in presence of district officials and villagers)

Doobkheda (Doobkhadda)

As a part of ICDS scheme aanganwadis are the most important link, as they function as the point for delivering services to the beneficiaries. The State Advisor and the team visited Aanjanwada, and Bhitada villages, which are among the 26 submergence affected villages, we also met villagers from other near by villages such as Doobkheda (Doobkhadda). Villagers narrated their status in which they suffered absolute exclusion from the administration and its apathy. There is an AWC functioning in the village in the house of Ghisu s/o Sailaar Singh, in the village of Doob kheda, which has about 40 households. Last year, only twice was the stock for the ICDS program brought into the village. And the Take Home ration was brought directly to the AW worker from the district head quarter. SHG never provided hot cooked meal in the village AWC.

Aanjanwada

There is only 1 aanganwadi in Aanjanwada village, and there is a worker named Rakhi and helper named Barkhi. There are 23 children in the 0 to 3 age group, 36 children of the age group 3 to 6, and there were 8 pregnant and 5 lactating women in the village. For Aanjanwada there has been regular allocation of funds and required grains. Since November 2010 Narmada SHG was given the task of cooking the food for ICDS in the village. As reported by the AW helper, hot cooked meals were never supplied in the village's AWC. The SHG of the village has been very irregular and has not been functioning. Brother of the president of SHG accepted in front of all the officials that the wheat and other grains meant for cooking in AWC were at his home. There has been a record in document of administration which shows release of grains for villages of Anajanwada and Baramba but none of them has received hot cooked meal in their AWC, and this fact was narrated by the villagers in front of the District administration. There is no mechanism to verify the claims of administration about release of ration for AWCs.

The CDPO of Sondwa Block Ajay Chouhan last visited the village one and half year back. He informed that there are 321 AWC under him, so even if he carries out a visit to an AWC every day it won't be possible for him to visit the same AWC twice in same year under normal circumstances. As per Mr, Chauhan, the lack of human resource is another reason which makes it virtually impossible for the existing staff to function.

In Bhitada village there are 2 AWC and one mini AWC, and there has been wide scale irregularity in distribution of Take Home ration and Hot cooked meal in the village. The AW helper informed the team that hot cooked meals were never distributed in the village. The AW helper said she distributed the Take Home ration after opening the packet among children. There was lots of confusion over allocation of MDM and ICDS. The SHG was not being allocated the full quota of grains. The person who ran the SHG said that he was given 3 quintals of grain for 1 month.

In the Guidelines of FAO on Right to Food, it has been said that local administration should be allowed to allocate resources to ensure food security for targeted group. Alirajpur administration can use resources for providing transportation system based on boats for affected villages.

Transportation budget for carrying patients, monitoring of schemes, visits by officials etc can come under this. It will ensure proper implementation of various schemes and also ensures transparency.

Orders of Supreme Court regarding ICDS

While the orders of The Supreme court very clearly stated that every child under 6 should be provided with 300 calories and 8 to 10 grams of protein, each adolescent girl to be provided with 500 calories and 20-25 grams of protein, each pregnant women and nursing mother to get 500 calories and 20-25 grams of protein, each malnourished child to get 600 calories and 16 to 20 gram of protein, have a disbursement centre in every settlement and also directed to

ensure feeding for 300 days. It is clearly evident from the situational evidence and statements of the beneficiaries that none of the above mentioned benefits have been realized by villagers from these submergence affected villages. It is absolutely clear from the evidences and narration of people of these villages in front of district administration that the ICDS scheme is a complete failure in the villages of Anjanwada, Doobkheda, and Bhitada. While these 3 are among the nearest to road link at Kakrana, the situation of these villages in it self can give us a glimpse of worsen situation in other submergence affected villages. State machinery response towards the village has been very irresponsible.

It can also be seen from the evidences that these 15 villages which already are affected with submergence and are hard to access, are facing the double wrath. None of the services being provided by administration reaches them. Some where it points to a deeper conspiracy by which these villages in a systematic manner have been excluded so as to dishearten the inhabitants and force them to abandon the villages.

Lessons from Brazil

In tribal dominated areas of Brazil local administration has made separate budget for food and nutrition security. They send budget proposal for 59 programs running in 16 different areas by Food Security Council. Alirajpur administration never sent any proposals for transportation in the affected areas, nor did they discuss it.

ICDS restricted only to provide supplementary nutrition!

ICDS scheme has 6 components which it has to cover but in these villages it has been limited only to providing supplementary nutrition that too has been irregular and negligible. There has been wide scale misappropriation of food grains and finds meant for women and children of these villages. SHGs that have been given the task of cooking the meal are functioning only on paper. All of them has been formed by family members and are often being run by male.

ICDS scheme also covers the immunization of children; since the visit of ANM and health worker has been irregular complete immunization has not happened in these villages. Pre school education to children, nutrition and health education, referral services are some of the other aspects but none of them are being provided to the villagers. There is provision that there should be separate building for aanganwadi, hardly one or two aanganwadis are being run in their own building. Majority of them are being run from rented building. While opening an AWC it has to be taken care that it is in proximity of poorest families of the village, this criteria has also not been followed. AWC has been opened arbitrarily on the whims and wish of the sarpanch or other influential persons of the village.

Inaccessibility

One of the major reasons behind failure of the system and all the schemes in these villages has been their inaccessibility. After submergence these villages have become accessible only

through boat from Kakrana. Transporting to these villages has been very difficult. As roads are accessible to every one, and provide cheaper means for transportation, while in these submerged areas the only means of transportation is boats. Since on roads there are various options available to people, there is public transportation and than people have option of private transportation, but in submergence the only possible means of transportation is boat. So it's the duty of administration to provide people with affordable means of transportation. Due to lack of transportation facilities, of course, which emerged due to submergence has made it extremely difficult to monitor the implementation of government schemes. Staff for these villages is inadequate in number which puts extra pressure on existing human resource.

SHGs-Dismantling of community based model

SHGs were introduced for preparing hot cooked meal in ICDS and MDM, the idea behind this move was to involve community and ensure its maximum participation in delivery of various services provided. If properly implemented it would have given the community ownership. It also had the role of Gram Sabha, who was to decide on the SHGs. But the real practice in these submergence affected villages is very different, powerful people have formed SHGs which are involved in misappropriation and pilferage of grains. This is a very good example of dismantling systematically a very good and effective community based model. Also there has been rampant corruption in the system, SHGs, have been misappropriating grains and fund meant for poor women and children. Though there hasn't been evidence to back involvement of government officials in it but it cannot be possible without their consent or knowledge that SHGs are not providing hot cooked meal in concerned villages. One such case of misappropriation was of Narmada SHG which was operating in Anjanwada village, where relative of the head of SHG accepted in front of the entire official that food grains were kept at his home. This was documented and an affidavit was made by the CDPO and the villagers signed it.

To improve the quality of services being delivered through ICDS scheme there should be proper action plan for these 15 villages affected by submergence, which should be separate from rest of the district. There is need of extra human resource at every level right from AW worker, helper, Supervisor to CDPO level. This will ensure effective implementation and monitoring of services. There is need to check pilferage and leakage of grains ment for hot cooked meal. Most of the aanganwadi workers and helpers are illiterate; to enhance their capacities so that they can provide effective services they need to be trained better. Extra allowances should be provided to all the staffs to cover their transportation charge from Kakrana to respective village on boat. Also there is need to regularize the process of visits by health care workers in order to provide better health care education. Since AWC and ICDS is an important link for providing immunization, irregular visits by health workers will not help in complete immunization of children. Also referral services have not been provided from the AWC in these villages.

Non-existence of vigilance mechanism

There is a well defined monitoring mechanism and system of vigilance in all the schemes so as to prevent leakage, pilferage and corruption in the system. There is provision for setting up monitoring committee in villages, at community level who will monitor allocation, distribution of grains. This committee is there in place to ensure community monitoring and their participation in delivery of services. Then there are various officials who are in supervisory and monitoring role. The PDS shop of Anjanwada village is ran by the secretary of the Panchayat whose name is Rajesh Kanesh. It was found that the process of monitoring was not been followed at nay level. He took the signature of Rikesh and Paresh who were present at the sight of unloading of grains. When asked about members of monitoring committee he named one Kambu son of Kansiya who was his relative. Similarly there has been no monitoring committee in any of the villages (namely Aanjanwada and Bhitada) for monitoring of ICDS and MDM. Children were not being provided with regular supplementary nutrition, hot cooked meal, immunization or other services meant for them through AWC or MDM in school. But there has been no interference from any one either from administration or from local community members, this not only creates space for corruption and pilferage but also jeopardize the main objective of all the schemes.

Lack of transportation facility for these villages is another very serious, problem which has contributed largely in this systematic exclusion. For reaching these 15 villages one has to go to Kakrana by road and from there a boat ride of half an hour to 2 hour. Cost of every service get multiplied for these villages and contributes a great deal on burdening all ready scarce resources that they have. One way boat ride to the villages costs anything between Rs. 20 to 50 depending up on the distance and various other factors. Getting the allocated quota of grains to the respective villages has become a Herculean task and also leaves gap for corruption pilferage.

Inter mixing of ICDS and MDM

In Village Bhitada, Narmada Jeevan SHG is functioning; it has the responsibility of cooking hot meal for ICDS scheme and MDM. Hot cooked meal is not provided daily at the AWC in the village, while some of the villagers said that MDM was being provided regularly. In ICDS the AW helper used to distribute the packets of nutritious diet meant to be given to children. She would open the packet and distribute it among children. One handful to every children, when asked about hot cooked meal, she said it was being given in school only and not from the AWC. SHG was also confused on this they also said he similar thing.

Vaccination and Immunization; Hopeless case

In these larger conditions, where very basic transportation facilities have not been provided by the development authorities or state, it is impossible to believe that vaccination and immunization is being done. Yes, local administration just receives Rs. 5000.00 in a year for Pulse Polio vaccination to visit these villages twice a year. A part of this no allocations or physical facility of transportation has been provided for the ground staff, this finally results in Zero percent full vaccination-immunization.

Chapter-5

Status of Mid-day-Meal scheme

Mid-day meal scheme is another important link in providing essential nutrition to all the school going children. This scheme aims at providing hot cooked nutritious meal to all school going children in government and government aided schools. This scheme was reviewed to assess its effective implementation in submergence affected area the area.

About mid-day meal scheme (Brief)

With a view to enhancing enrollment, retention and attendance and simultaneously improving nutritional levels among children, the National Programme of Nutritional Support to Primary Education (NP-NSPE) was launched as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme on 15th August 1995, initially in 2408 blocks in the country. By the year 1997-98 the NP-NSPE was introduced in all blocks of the country. It was further extended in 2002 to cover not only children in classes I-V of government, government aided and local body schools, but also children studying in EGS and AIE centres. Central Assistance under the scheme consisted of free supply of food grains @ 100 grams per child per school day, and subsidy for transportation of food grains up to a maximum of Rs.50 per quintal.

In September 2004 the scheme was revised to provide cooked mid day meal with 300 calories and 8-12 grams of protein to all children studying in classes I-V in Government and aided schools and EGS/AIE centers. In addition to free supply of food grains, the revised scheme provided Central Assistance for (a) Cooking cost @ Re 1 per child per school day, (b) Transport subsidy was raised from the earlier maximum of Rs.50 per quintal to Rs.100 per quintal for special category states, and Rs.75 per quintal for other states, (c) Management, monitoring and evaluation costs @ 2% of the cost of food grains, transport subsidy and cooking assistance, (d) Provision of mid day meal during summer vacation in drought affected areas.

In July 2006 the scheme was further revised to provide assistance for cooking cost at the rate of (a) Rs.1.80 per child/school day for States in the North Eastern Region, provided the NER states contribute Rs.0.20 per child/school day, and (b) Rs.1.50 per child/school day for other States and UTs, provided that these States and UTs contribute Rs.0.50 per child/school day.

Objectives

The objectives of the mid day meal scheme are:

- Improving the nutritional status of children in classes I-V in Government, Local Body and Government aided schools, and EGS and AIE centres.

- Encouraging poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections, to attend school more regularly and help them concentrate on classroom activities.
- Providing nutritional support to children of primary stage in drought affected areas during summer vacation.

Components of the revised scheme The revised scheme provides for the following components:

- Supply of free food grains (wheat/rice) @ 100 grams per child per School Day from the nearest FCI godown
- Reimbursement of the actual cost incurred in transportation of food grains from nearest FCI godown to the Primary School subject to the following ceiling :
 - Rs.100 per quintal for 11 special category States viz. Arunachal Pradesh, Assam, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Manipur, Nagaland, Tripura, Sikkim, J&K, Himachal Pradesh and Uttarakhand, and
 - Rs.75 per quintal for all other States and UTs
- Provision of assistance for cooking cost at the following rates :
 - States in North-Eastern Region: @ Rs.1.80per child per school day provided the State Govt. contributes a minimum of 20 paise.
 - For other States & UTs : @ Rs.1.50 per child per school day provided the State Govt./UT administration contributes a minimum of 50 paise.

State Governments/UT administrations are required to provide the above minimum contribution in order to be eligible for the enhanced rate of Central assistance mentioned above.

- Provision of assistance for cooked Mid-Day Meal during summer vacations to school children in areas declared by State Governments as "drought-affected".
- Provision of assistance to construct kitchen-cum-store in a phased manner up to a maximum of Rs. 60,000 per unit. However, as allocations under MDMS for construction of kitchen-cum-store for all schools in next 2-3 years may not be adequate states would be expected to proactively pursue convergence with other development programmes for this purpose.
- Provision of assistance in a phased manner for replacement of kitchen devices at an average cost of Rs. 5,000 per school. The States/UT administration will have the flexibility to incur expenditure on the items listed below on the basis of the actual requirements of the school (provided that the overall average for the State/UT administration remains Rs. 5000 per school).
 - Cooking devices (Stove, Chulha, etc.)
 - Containers for storage of food grains and other ingredients.
 - Utensils for cooking and serving.

- Provision of assistance to States/UTs for Management, Monitoring & Evaluation (MME) at the rate of 1.8% of total assistance on
 - Free food grains,
 - Transport cost and
 - Cooking cost. Another 0.2% of the above amount will be utilized at the Central Government for management, monitoring and evaluation.

Situation of Mid-day Meal scheme in submergence affected villages (As witnessed by the team during the visit in presence of district officials and villagers)

Status of schools and MDM

Aanjanwada

There is a school in Aanjanwada village, which was earlier a satellite school, and latter converted to primary school after the implementation of Right to Education act started in the state from 1st of April 2010. The school in Aanjanwada had a guest teacher, currently it was being handled by Mr. Ramesh Thakrav, and he said that he was posted there for past 3 years in the school. Majority of villagers present there were unable to identify the teacher, this in itself was a testimony of his efficiency. It was said that he hardly came to school, and has been very irregular vis-à-vis functioning of school. Distribution of MDM in school has not been proper, other things like uniform, text books etc also has not been distributed among children in the school.

While the teacher said that he opened the school for 200 days in the year it was almost evident from villagers' statement that it was not true. He himself was not confident about what he was saying. He said that there were 58 children enrolled in the school. MDM in the school was being provided by SHG from Sakarja village, Ramati bai of Aanjanwada was given the responsibility of cooking MDM for the children since November 2010. The responsibility of MDM was given to a new SHG from the month of February 2011.

School teacher Mr. Ramesh Thakrav said that about 20 children come to school. He also complained that villagers didn't send children to school regularly. When asked, if he ever tried to persuade them to send their children to school he had no answers. While there were 58 children enrolled in the school and there was on an average attendance of only 20 every day, but the MDM allocation records said that full quota of ration was being released for the school. So, the ration for 38 children was being misappropriated at various stage of allocation and being cooked. When asked about the records of attendance of children in school, cooking of MDM, its distribution among children, the teacher wasn't very convincing in his answers so he was asked to bring the records which he maintained. He was categorically told to come back with the record but he did not returned till team was there.

District Program |Coordinator (SSA), Mr. KK Dongre was witness to all the proceedings, he informed that Aanjanwada had a satellite school earlier which has now been upgraded to a primary school. The school is being run from a rented house of a villager and he has been made the president of the PTA none of the procedures and norms for formation of PTA were followed in the school.

Bhitada

Bhitada the other village of Sondwa block in Alirajpur district has 3 primary schools as stated by the district officials. All three are primary school and has one teacher appointed in each of them. Status of education in the village is very bad there weren't any 5th grade pass till few years back. Some children went to places like Sondwa, or Alirajpur and studied till 12th from private schools. It was said by the villagers that if the schools in the village are running than where are the children who have passed from these schools. To this none of the officials had any answer. One of the teacher appointed in the school is from Devkuli a village which is about 10 Km from Sondwa. He said that he lived in Bhitada till Saturday and went back on Saturday evening only to come back on Monday morning or by noon. But this turned to be false as he was not coming regularly. Distribution of MDM in school was not being implemented properly in the village. There are 149 children of the age group of 6 to 14.

The SHG which has the responsibility of MDM in the village has not been functioning properly. It was informed by the villagers that there was no regular distribution of MDM in the school. While the record showed that the allotted quota of ration was being released every month it being utilized for the very same purpose it was meant for. In Bhitada village the Sarpanch was distributing PDS ration to everyone at BPL prices and the gap of the expenditure on this and also of transportation was being filled from the ration meant for MDM and ICDS. DPC of Alirajpur district also informed that there were lots of posts of teachers which were lying vacant. Those who were appointed in these areas did not join.

Orders of Supreme Court

The Supreme Court's order of 28th November 2001 directs state governments to provide cooked Mid-day meals in Primary schools. Every child who attends a government school or government assisted primary school is entitled to a cooked nutritious mid-day meal every day. The provision of cooked Mid-day meal in primary schools is an important step towards right to food. Mid-day meal help children protect from hunger (including "class room hunger") if meals are nutritious they can facilitate the healthy growth of children Mid-day meal also serves many other useful purposes for instance they are quite effective contribute not only to right to food but also in right to education

Violations of orders

|While it was evident that various norms and guidelines of Supreme Court have not been followed in implementation of mid-day meal scheme. The schools didn't open for requisite

number of days primarily because the teacher appointed for the schools has not been coming regularly. The SHG responsible for Mid-day meal in the village did not perform its tasks and also there has been irregularity in allocation of ration for the school children of the village. Many of the villagers said that distribution of Mid-day meal was not regular in the village. Teachers did not maintain proper record of attendance of the children in the school, which latter would result in discrepancy in allocation of ration for MDM.

To improve the situation of Mid-day meal in schools of village teachers need to perform their duties properly. First of all they have to ensure that they come regularly and opened the school on time. More teachers should be appointed on priority in these villages so that schools function regularly. Teachers who have been appointed in inaccessible submerged affected villages should be provided some staying accommodation in the village of their posting so that it becomes convenient for them and also it will save lots of time of teachers. There should be proper monitoring of the allocation of ration, children's attendance in the school, distribution of Mid-day meal. It will ensure proper implementation of the scheme.

Chapter- 6

Groaning in Submergence

Aanjanwada in Alirajpur is situated between hills and river, and to reach this village the only way is from Kakrana by boat. There are 15 such villages in Alirajpur, which are accessible only by boat. People living in these areas don't get benefit of most government schemes.

If one has to understand the status of citizen health and public health-care in Madhya Pradesh than one ought to visit Aanjanwada in Alirajpur. The Visit of MPW and ANM is a one in a blue-moon affair; at best they visit every 3-4 months. Last time immunization happened was on 19/12/10. No woman or child has been completely immunized in the village. The Health supervisor B. S. Chauhan of the area said that he has 32 villages to cover, so practically if he visits one village a day, next time he visits the same village after a month. And as there is lack of sensitivity in the administration, the health supervisor visits are not regular. According to Mr. Chauhan, complete immunization is not possible in the villages due to non-availability of boats. This acceptance of the health supervisor is in itself is testimony to the situation of immunization in the village, and magnitude of problem being faced by women and children in the village.

Pregnant mothers need proper care and check-ups before delivery. They need two tetanus vaccines, 100 iron tablets, and 3 check-ups by ANM's as a basic minimum. It is clear that when the ANM is visiting only once a while, complete immunization is not possible in the village. Similarly, safe delivery has also become something out of reach for the community. Round three of National Family Health Survey shows that 74% tribal women are anaemic. Alirajpur is a tribal village. And, perhaps even more in need than others.

Jasma Bai of Aanjanwada says that majority of deliveries in the village are carried out at home, because they do not have any source to carry the patient to hospital. CMHO of the district informed the team that only 2 institutional deliveries have taken place in Sondwa Block in past 1 year, while the website of district shows that 55% deliveries have been institutional. While there have been various policies by government to save the life of the mother, it can be seen here that none of the benefits are actually percolating to real beneficiaries. Jasma Bhai informed the team that 'there is no mode of transportation for taking women to hospital, and we have to hire boat for it which is costly. The nearest SHC is at Kakrana (12 km), which takes around 2 hours to reach. The Kakrana SHC do not have any doctor, so we have to take them to Sondwa.'

Besti Bai of Aanjanwada said that many a-times the situation gets out of hand and it seems as if the women may die in the boat. She said that if health check-ups are done regularly in the village, such emergency situations will not occur. She says that 'institutional delivery is very costly for us because we have to hire a private boat for going to Kakarana, which at-times

costs up to Rs. 2,000, and from Kakarana we have to hire taxi or jeep which costs another Rs. 1,000. Medicine in government hospital is not provided for free, and we have to buy it from the market, so the Janani suraksha Yojana is of no meaning for us.'

Arli bai said that 'for us it better to have the delivery done in village instead of hospital. She further adds that they do not get any benefits for delivery in village.' Thus it became clear to the team that the residents were not getting any benefits under the National Maternity Benefit Scheme. Mr. Chauhan, the health supervisor for the village, said that since none of the villagers had BPL cards they were not eligible for NMBS. It should be noted that the benefits of NMBS is given only to those whose name is on the BPL list.

In Aanjanwada, there is a wide gap between ground realities and the records of BPL survey. There are 65 families in the village but none of them has their names on the BPL list, despite fulfilling all requisite criteria for being BPL. This shows that the BPL survey carried out in the village was full of flaws, which has excluded various eligible women and men. This resulted in various women losing out on benefits under NMBS.

Conclusion

Witnessing the trying and hazardous predicament of mothers, it has become apparent that had the BPL survey been properly conducted many of villagers would have benefitted from NMBS. It should be noted that in 2004, the Commissioner of the Supreme Court, Dr. N. C. Saxena, directed the then chief secretary Vijay Singh to cover all the SC/ST families affected by SSP under AAY, but no action has been taken on it since than. If the survey for BPL would have been done properly many families would have been getting the benefits of the schemes. Apart from this, regularizing and enforcing other health services in the village are essential to safeguard the residents, i.e. check-ups by ANM, iron tablets, supplementary nutrition, and, most importantly, creating an arrangement for mobile health boats reaching the village.

Chapter-7

Displacement and Social Security

Social security and its denial have wide ranging effects on society. A total of 23 elderly persons from Aanjanwada are still waiting for their old-age pension, but there has been no initiative from the government to help them avail this. The main document of the scheme says that Social Security means a person's security in family work place and in society. The premise of Social security is to stop the deprivation and marginalization. The most important point is that citizens should get direct helps in order to fulfill their basic needs. Social security also means that a person should get livelihood security without which all other rights mean nothing.

For providing social security to the disadvantaged and deprived, in 1995 the government started the National Family Benefit Program, and the National Old Age Pension scheme (NOAPS). The National Family Welfare Scheme is a subset to the NOAPS. In NOAPS, every person 65 years old or more, and BPL card holders, will get Rs. 275 a month, while in the National Family Welfare Scheme, a family is provided with one-time payment of Rs. 10,000 on death of the principal earning member of a family, aged between 18 to 64 years of age. In the writ petition 196/2001 between PUCL Vs GOI & others, the National Family Welfare Program is also covered

Social Security in Affected Areas

In Aanjanwada, residents do not get ration from the PDS shop because their names are not on BPL list. People here do not have any source of livelihood. Work is not being done under MNREGA. If any work has been done, its wages are still pending. All these things have forced people to migrate. The families migrating in search of jobs, leave behind old-age members at home. In these circumstances, the old age pension scheme comes as a much needed relief.

During the visit, the team found that there were many old aged persons, widows, and destitute families who were eligible for various pensions, but since they didn't have BPL cards they were not getting benefits of the schemes. Their condition was such that they should have been covered under AAY, and the the irony is that they had been granted APL cards. In Aanjanwada only one person Sankariya was found to be getting pension. Sankariya said that whether he got it or not, it had no significance. Also, his passbook was with the secretary. The amount which he was getting was not as per the directions of the Supreme Court. At times, he would not get the pension for more than two months. It is to be understood that there is no monitoring system in these areas.

There are atleast 23 such persons, more than 65 years of age, but excluded from availing the benefit of pension because their name is not on the BPL list. There are 3 widows in the village. They are eligible for widow pension, but again due to the fallacies that have crept into the system and the BPL survey; they have been deprived of their rights. Kishat Reliya, a physically disabled person is also facing the same fate. He is eligible for disability pension. But since his name is in the APL List he has been deprived of the pension. The families eligible for the national family welfare scheme have also been deprived so far on the pretext of being on the APL rather than BPL list.

Conclusion

After this discussion, the team arrived at the conclusion that people were being deprived of various social security schemes only because the BPL survey had lots of flaws and it excluded various eligible persons. If the survey would have been done correctly many excluded from the list presently would have got the benefits of the schemes.

It should be noted that in 2004 commissioner of the Supreme Court Dr. N. C. Saxena had directed the then chief secretary Vijay Singh to cover all the SC/ST families affected by SSP under AAY. No action has been taken on it since than. If the survey for creating the BPL list would have been done properly, many families would have been getting the benefits of the schemes. It looks like it has been a systematic failure on the part of administration. That the failure is this systemic in this particular area, it appears to be an intentional exercise, not one committed due to oversight.

Chapter-8

Status of basic Health Services

Health services are key among various deliverable services of government, especially in areas where a community has been rendered hapless by an event outside their control, where poverty reigns, or where a community is living like a refugee community. As it has been established, various government schemes have failed to provide any kind of relief to the villagers. The status of health services in the area is no different. Adding to the problem is the inaccessibility of these villages. During the visit to assess the situation of these affected villages, the team inquired into the effectiveness and delivery of health service in these areas.

Ground Realities- Inviting Death

The situation of these 15 villages is such that even a minor problem may escalate in to a major problem. Last year in Aanjanwada, a girl was bitten by a dog and her father had to spend Rs. 2,000 on her treatment. Considering the average annual income of a family, this was a substantial treatment expense. In case of fever or other minor problems, residents have to go to Kakrana, which is 2 hours by boat from Aanjanwada. In case of any health related problems, people have to travel to places like Kakrana and Sondwa and if there is any emergency it is almost impossible to provide quick relief to the patient.

If there is any case of emergency in the village, residents have to arrange for boat. The cost of diesel just to Kakrana is around Rs. 400. Now from Kakrana villagers have to hire a vehicle which may cost up to Rs. 400 to 500 depending upon the situation and availability. So in case of any emergency if they don't have enough money it is impossible to get medical help. The villagers, who are already bearing the wrath of 'development', have to face a double-beating. And inaccessibility of affordable health-care directly affects their food security.

Services provided by the health department

There is a medicine depot in Aanjanwada, Rakhi is the depot holder. In the past six months, there have been just two reinforcement stocks of medicine delivered to the village: one on 19.12.2010 and the other on 17.5.2011. Visit of the health worker appointed for the area has been very irregular. The health worker last came to the village during Bal Suraksha abhiyan and Pulse Polio Campaign. No regular checkups are carried out in these villages. There hasn't been any visit by the health worker between the months of January and May 2011.

The reality of immunization provided by the health department through anganwadis has been very poor. If there is no regular visit by health worker and other concerned official, it is

virtually impossible to achieve the targets of complete immunization. Since there hasn't been any regular visit, complete immunization hasn't happened in the villages.

Narendra Kanesh is the MPW appointed for Aanjanwada village. He has 11 villages to cover. There hasn't been any day fixed for his visit in the village. He arbitrarily chooses the villages as per his convenience. This inefficiency might not yield much result - villagers not knowing about the visits could miss out on the services.

Inaccessibility

One of the principal reasons behind such a poor state of services and facilities provided to these villagers is inaccessibility. The lack of transportation options has also contributed to the problem. Every year NVDA hires about 20 boats during monsoon in the name of flood relief. Lakhs of rupees is spent on the name of flood rehabilitation. Administration hires boats which are kept on standby; they are rarely used for flood relief. As per the villagers, these boats are used for illegal liquor transportation, pilferage of ration and ferrying illegal wood from the forest.

Connecting these areas by boat will solve, to an extent the problem of transportation. If the administration hires boats to provide services, it would be a much better option. Also to provide the benefits of various schemes, it is the most basic and important thing. Without an efficient and regular mode of transportation, it is impossible to provide service. Lack of transportation isolates these villages and contributes to violating a variety of their residents' human rights. Health supervisor B.S. Chauhan said that if boat facility similar to Maharashtra is provided, a majority of problems can be solved.

Observations

This strip of Bhil-land which stretches up to Panchmahal, has traits of sickle-cell anemia. Lack of health services, coupled with food security, is only going to increase the problem manifold. Now, if we analyze the situation of human resources in the health department in Alirajpur district, it can be seen that the district is acutely short-staffed. Add to this the tough conditions and inaccessibility of these 15 villages, the lack of proper source of water, and the proximity to stagnant water of the dam. There are all requisite conditions present for a health disaster. Yet, this area that is headed towards a health disaster is an area facing lack of attention from the district administration.

Due to lack of facilities, repeated denial of services, and "systematic exclusion", people of the area have lost faith in the administration. The Maharashtra Government has provided various facilities to people affected by SSP. There are health boats which ferry regularly to villages on the Maharashtra side of SSP and carry out regular health checkups, provide other

health facilities and services. They are also available in case of any emergency, but there has been no such initiative from MP government, due to which people suffer in displeasure.

Recommendations

There should be up-gradation of health services in the affected villages. There have been just 2 health camps in recent times: one at Sakarja and other one in Kakrana. More health camps should be held in order to provide villagers necessary relief. Visits by doctor to this area are simply not happening. And, the posts of doctors are lying vacant in the district. In filling vacancies, these areas should be given preference. There should be a provision for mobile health-boats for the area, which should be on the move constantly. All the transportation expenses in case of emergency should be paid by the administration. The SHC at Kakrana should be upgraded to a PHC, so that residents of these affected villages can avail the benefits of health services.

Chapter-9

NREGA- Threat to livelihood?

Background:-

Alirajpur is one of the newer districts of Madhya Pradesh; it was carved out of Jabua district 3 years ago. As much as 87% of the district population is tribal, whose life is dependent on agriculture, forest produce, fishing, etc. Money does not have as big a hold in this life, and communities have a deep relation with the forests and the river.

Tribal communities are amongst the most excluded in our society, so special provisions have been made for them under Schedule V of the constitution. Exploitation of tribes is not new. Tribals of Alirajpur have been facing exploitation, but the real source of their woes in recent times has been the Sardar Sarovar Project. Some of the first villages to be affected by the SSP are those in Alirajpur. A total of 15 villages of Alirajpur are affected by SSP and the only way to reach them is by boat from Kakrana. The government says that residents here have been compensated, while the villagers say that they have been compensated for their houses only.

A day will come when people will die from hunger

Patel baba of village Anjanwada district Alirajpur said that due to unavailability of employment, farmers have to find manual labor. He said: 'I want to ask the government - our land has been submerged in water, how someone can we produce crops in water? If same situation continues, no farmer will be left and a day will come when people will die from hunger.' Patel Baba said that from each family in his village, 4-5 members go to Maharashtra and Gujarat for labor work and only old people are left here.

As per the Narmada water dispute tribunal 1979 decision, all the families who have suffered 25% of submergence of their land due to the project, should get at least 2 hectare of irrigable agricultural land, plot for houses, along with other amenities. The government offered land in Gujarat, which was either in possession of locals or was affected by water logging and salination. So, most of the families of the 15 affected Alirajpur villages have returned back this land. However, the government maintains rehabilitation is completed, which the tribals believe is not justified.

Land, and a natural resource base, was the main source of income and sustenance for these 15 villages. With the submergence of their land due to the dam, they have lost their land and hence livelihood also. As per the study report of Walter Fernandez on displacement, poverty

is one of the first products of displacement. Poverty is directly related to the economic state and loss of livelihood caused due to the project. It has nothing to do with their earlier state.

MNREGA in affected areas

MNREGA should have acted as a support for these villagers at a time of great social and livelihood loss, but they are not getting its benefits. The result, large swathes of the community is migrating to Gujarat or Maharashtra for work, as well as when faced with sleeping with hunger at home. Surbhan says that in January and February when they migrate, their total earning is 24,000 in which Rs 22,000 are spent during same period. So if he gets work in his village he will be able to save more than just Rs. 2,000 out of Rs. 24,000.

NREGA was implemented in 2006 in 3 phases. This area saw the implementation of the Act in the 1st phase. So now it has almost been 5 years, since the Act began to be implemented. By now the state and central governments have been praising themselves in its wake. But, they have not bothered to notice the situation in Alirajpur, where people have been deprived from their right of livelihood, both in terms of the Project and a dysfunctional MNREGA.

Earlier we were happy

Khajan singh of the village said that when our land was not submerged in water, the one crop harvest could last us for 2 years of food, but now the land is submerged in water. He questioned – ‘if the people of Maharashtra can get land against land than why not us?’ He said, ‘it has been 15 years since our land sunk under water, but still we did not get compensation for animals, land, and trees. Land has been their only income. Today they don’t have any option for their livelihood, but migration.

The first pre-requisite of NREGA is that all the families must be registered with the panchayat. After this, they will be given job-cards, which will ensure that they get work. There were 27 such families in Anjanwada who do not have their job cards; they have applied for it many times but to no avail. These 27 families have been deprived of their right to livelihood.

On the other hand, the government website states that all the families of the village have been issued job cards after identification. So if it is true, then it would appear that the job cards are stuck somewhere at janpad and

gram panchayat levels or the data is wrong. Either way, it is people are suffering.

As per the new rules, job cards of those who haven't worked in last 5 years will not be renewed. There are many residents in the village who haven't worked in the last five years, either due to non-availability of job cards or due to non-availability of work. All of them will lose their job cards according to the new rules.

No work for ME!

The mainstay of MNREGA is that when one applies for a job and one can get it, and that too within 5 km radius and inside 15 days. In case no work is allotted, un-employment allowance will be given, which is the sole responsibility of state government. The central government has no role to play in this regard. And it is this very clause that creates opportunity for irregularity. No state government wants to accept that they were unable to provide jobs.

18 residents of Aanjanwada in Sakarja Panchayat demanded for work on 5/01/09. Not getting any, they applied for un-employment allowance. Taking action, the administration gave them un-employment allowance. More recently, on 22/11/10, a total of 87 villagers applied for work with the Janpad CEO. They did not receive any work, so as per the provisions, they have applied for un-employment allowance. Nothing has been progressed on this so far.

As per the data, none of the residents of Sakarja Panchayat demanded work in 2008-09. In 2009-10, 114 people demanded work which was given to them. The government data says that no un-employment allowance was provided to any one in 2008, but their own records presented in MIS have a different story, which says that un-employment allowance has been paid in 2009.

In Bhitada, no work under MNREGA was done in 2007-08. The government data tells a different story. It's a clear case of violation of provisions of the Act, if not out-right corruption. Madhya Pradesh has claimed to be one of the successful states in the implementation of MNREGA on the grounds that it has provided work to all those that demanded it. But, ground realities differ starkly from what the government data and claims.

Corruption and Fake Entries

In Anjanwada, none of the job cards have any entry. This is the reality despite some of the villagers having found work under MNREGA, with payment being made to them. It shows how there is no monitoring at any level in MNREGA. District administration has also accepted this fact, which shows the acceptance of immense possibility for corruption.

Village Development Plan

One of the most important aspects of MNRGA is to make village development plans, created by villagers themselves based on priority. Aanjanwada is a revenue village but the land around is that of the forest department. So, any work in the village needs coordination between the revenue and forest departments. Under MNREGA, the forest department is also an implementing agency, but in these affected areas, the forest department has created the

maximum hurdles. The district administration says that the village is on the hills, so there are very few options of work. The villagers have said that works like plantation, approach roads, watershed etc. can easily be done in the village. Reliya, from Aanjanwada said that problems of the village will have to be solved within the village, but there has been no discussion on village development plans with the administration.

Delay in Payment

A total of 180 people from Aanjanwada worked at digging a pond in the village in 2011 for 6 weeks, but none of them has got payment until now. While there is a provision for payment within 7-15 days, in case of delay, there are provisions that entitle the labour to compensation under the Compensation of Wages act 1936. But in Aanjanwada people haven't got their wages, or compensation.

Delay in payment can be found in every village of this area. Villagers of Doobkheda had worked together digging a pond in 2010, but they haven't got their wages yet. The importance of timely payment of wages in areas suffering from food insecurity needs to be understood. These families depend upon this payment, their daily wages, for basic necessities, and a delay in payment will result in increased food insecurity.

A similar story has been repeated in Bhitada village. Some residents of village, such as Saya (son of Khamsingh), and Sardar (son of Hati), had worked on digging a pond in 2006-07. They haven't got their wages yet. In 2008-09, 7 wells were dug in the village: 3 in Renjari faliya, 1 in Patel faliya, 2 each in Barkhedi faliya and Charseri faliya. A total of 10 laborers were appointed to work on each well for 5-6 months, but they haven't got their wages till date. The villagers said that Jarsiya was the sarpanch at the time, but the work was done by Prem Singh Jamra, who is the present sarpanch. The work was passed by the panchayat. It was also reported that there were instances when there would be no entries made of laborers working.

In 2009-10 a pond was dug in Bhitada village, which involved resident of both Renzari faliya and in Patel faliya. A total of 44 labourers of Renzari faliya and 5 laborers of Patel faliya have not yet received wages for this work. Again in 2011, 150 people worked for 3 weeks in Bhitada village digging yet another pond, but they haven't got their wages.

As per official records, no payment of wages is pending in Sakarja panchayat. In Gulwat panchayat (under the umbrella of which Bhitada Village is also situated), wages worth Rs. 3, 10,310 is pending. In the same year Rs, 742582 is pending in Gulwat.

| Village | Application Date & To | Work Date & | Laborers | Comments | Suggested Action |
|----------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------------|
|----------------|----------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------------|

| | | Days | | | |
|------------|---|----------------------------|----|--|---|
| Aanjanwada | 20/11/07 to Gram Panchayat Secretary | 10/12/07 for 30 days | 44 | Unemployment allowance application given on 30/1/08 & again to Collector on 6/3/08 | Who don't get employment on time, should be given unemployment allowance. |
| Aanjanwada | 16/05/08 | 11/06/08 for 19 days | 66 | | |
| Aanjanwada | 05/01/09 to Main Executive Officer | 27/01/09 for 68 days | 67 | Got work for 18 days. Gave unemployment allowance application for other days | Who don't get employment on time, should be given unemployment allowance |
| Aanjanwada | 17/11/10 to Executive Officer | 15/12/10 for 50 days | 64 | Got work for 24 days | |
| Aanjanwada | 30/01/08 Secretary | 16/02/08 for 60 days | 52 | | |

Monitoring and Transparency

Transparency is an important aspect of MNREGA. There is provision of establishing monitoring committees in every village. In the monitoring committee, there will be laborers working, who will keep an account of the progress of the work. A monitoring committee, in a way, ensures active participation of laborers. During the visit, the team found that there was no monitoring committee in any villages, which is also a reason behind non-fulfillment of MNREGA provisions. To increase transparency in MNREGA there is also the provision for a social audit by the gram sabha every 6 months. In this process, all details related to

MNREGA are audited. In none of the villages has this process of social audit taken place, which means there hasn't been any participation from the people.

MNREGA in Affected Areas

Residents of villages affected by SSP were very hopeful that MNREGA will improve their conditions, but it has failed to fulfill these expectations. The M.P. government has been awarded for better implementation of MNREGA, but in Alirajpur people are migrating in search of work. The seriousness of the government on MNREGA can be understood from the fact that in Aanjanwada, 27 families haven't been able to get a job card in the last 5 years. They have been deprived of their right to livelihood by the administration.

While the website says that every one who demanded work have been provided with it, the reality is very different on ground. People who had their job cards didn't get any work. When they asked for un-employment allowance, the government became defensive.

Delay in payment is not a new thing but there are provisions for compensation on delayed payment in MNREGA. But no compensation has been paid yet anywhere, as the government hasn't formulated its rules. There are some works in which payment of wages is still pending in the villages the team visited. Talking about monitoring and transparency would be waste of time, as no one knows or have even heard about social audit.

Submergence of agricultural land due to SSP had caused problems of livelihood. MNREGA was expected to help. But, the presence of a sensitive administration to help implement the schemes is entirely lacking. The reality is that the submergence affected communities, now pushed up to the top of rocky hills live amidst what have become islands in a land of the stagnant. Villages have become like mausoleums quietly floating on the calmest of water.

Chapter 10

Recommendations

Public distribution system

1. All the families residing in submergence affected villages must be provided with 35KGS subsidized food grain under AAY till the new BPL Identification process is over and new lists are prepared.
2. There has been wide scale leakage in the public distribution system in Bhitada, Aanjanwada and Doobkhadda. If we talk about last year's detail, there was an allotment of 44 quintals but only 14 quintal reached the village. Due to lack of monitoring mechanism, the whole system has been running like this for long. Administration should inquire into the cases of PDS pilferage in all the villages and action should be taken against those who are found guilty.
3. Inquiry against lead society for its role
4. Ration should be distributed regularly as per the quota. Villagers of Aanjanwada, Bhitada and Doobkheda got ration only 3-times in 2010 and there has been no distribution since February this year. Since there was no entry in the ration cards of the villagers, claims in the government report cannot be substantiated. So we had to accept what the villagers said.
5. Under Madhya Pradesh PDS control order 2009, there is a system of roster, and the District Collector is mandated to inspect the shops in his jurisdiction every 3 months. The provision of Madhya Pradesh PDS control order should be implemented. Community participation in monitoring should be ensured within one month in affected villages.
6. The sarpanch of Bhitada has been spending Rs. 50,000 a year on transportation of ration from Bakhtgarh to the village shop, and he compensated this money from the development fund of the gram sabha. In these villages, boat is the only medium of transportation. The district administration should take this matter with the government. Citing, the special status of these villages, transportation arrangements or provision for transportation cost should be made by the administration and it shouldn't be passed on to the shop operator. An action plan for these villages should be made and shared with us within 30 days.
7. The sarpanch of Bhitada has kept the ration card of all the villagers on the pretext of making ration cards, which is illegal. A camp should be held in the villages to make the caste certificate on priority.
8. There is a provision for the construction of godown under the Madhya Pradesh PDS control order. During the months of monsoon, the quota of 4 months is allotted at one time, which creates storage problem. Proper storage facility should be made for stocking the ration.

As per the directives of Dr. N C Saxena, Commissioners to the Supreme Court of India, given to the then Chief Secretary of Madhya Pradesh Mr. Vijay Singh in March 2004: all the SC/ST families affected by SSP should be covered under AAY. Till now nothing has been done regarding this. This should be done on priority. Also, there is no obligation of having name on the BPL list, for getting AAY benefits. This should be also kept in mind. The AAY card of all the families who had applied for it should be made on priority without any delay.

MNREGA

1. Since all the revenue land of all these villages has submerged in the dam, there is no revenue land available. Forest department owns majority of land available in these areas, in coordination with forest department further action plan should be developed for these villages and implemented on priority.
2. By participatory planning with the community various works can be done in the village. There is the chance for doing work like hill treatment, building approach roads, and forestation. All these should be done on priority in order to ensure that people do not migrate in search of job.
3. No entry of work has been done in the job cards even after payment has been released in some cases. This is against the law. It has happened due to lack of transparency and no monitoring mechanism at the ground level.
4. There hasn't been any payment of wages for the 12 days of work done by 95 villagers in 2011. Compensation for delay in payment of wages should be done as per the provisions of Compensation of wages act 1936
5. Social audit of MNREGA within 6 months should be done.
6. There have been cases in which people have demanded work and they have not been allotted any. In such cases, un-employment allowance should be given as per the provision of the Act.
7. Monitoring committee should be formed for MNREGA

Integrated Child Development Scheme

1. As per the observations of the team, 63% children in the villages are malnourished. For the last two years, children haven't got hot cooked meals in these villages due to non-availability of ration on time. There hasn't been any monitoring on the functioning of the scheme. And, due to lack of a monitoring committee at village level, there hasn't been any check on malpractices. A monitoring committee of 7-10 women in every village should be made.
2. Narmada SHG has embezzled Rs. 30,276 in Aanjanwada alone. Still it has been functioning in the villages of Doobkhadda, Baramba, Aanjanwada, Sakarja, Sikhedi and Khundi. There should be an inquiry in this matter.

3. For regular monitoring of coupons for the SHG, a committee of women should be formed in every village.
4. Most of the families do not know about take home ration, supplementary nutrition, and other services of ICDS. The administration should organize awareness campaigns for the affected villages and community participation should be ensured for this.
5. A detailed report on the status of malnourishment of children in all the villages affected by the project should be done and the report should be sent to us soon.
6. For ensuring immunization and other check-ups of pregnant women and children, a group of supervisors along with an MPW should visit all the villages. Action plan should be shared with us within 30 days.

Health

1. There is not much provision for health check up in the villages. Last year there was an allocation of Rs. 50,000 from NVDA, and this budget has been used for immunization every 6 months, which should have been a regular process. Health workers do not have a budget for visiting the villages. No doctor has visited the villages in the past one year. As per the health workers, no immunization has been done for DPT and BCG. It should be regularized and we should be informed within 30 days about the action taken in this regard.
2. During the monsoon season villagers are prone to water-borne and skin diseases. Facilities for treatment of such diseases should be established in the village. Currently, aanganwadi worker has been provided with some medicine. During monsoon, a health camp is organized in Kakrana, but what arrangements will be made for the rest of the 9 months should be intimated to us by the administration.
3. There is lack of staff in the health department, there should be 1ANM and 1 AMPW in each SHC and 4 doctors in a CHC, and this should be addressed on priority.
4. There have been only two cases of institutional delivery in Sondwa. The rest have all been home delivery. There is great need for the posting of an ANM in every village.
5. There have been only 27 cases of NMBS in the villages, which mean that the scheme is not being implemented properly in the area. Steps should be taken for better implementation of the scheme.
6. One of the principal reasons behind such a poor state of services and facilities provided to these villagers is their inaccessibility. Connecting these areas by boat will solve, to an extent, the problem of transportation. If the administration hires boats to provide services it would be a much better option. Also to provide the benefits of various schemes, is the most basic and important thing. Health camps should be organized in the villages and affected people should be given medicines there itself.

Transportation

There is no arrangement for transportation in submergence affected villages. The government should arrange for boats for every 4-5 villages. The administration can take boats from NVDA on rent. We should be informed in 30 days about the steps taken regarding this.

Public health and engineering

Stagnant water of Narmada gets polluted in monsoon. Yet, the villagers do not have any other option, but to use this water for drinking. In Bhitada, a well has been dug for the purpose of drinking. But due to non-availability of land this cannot happen in other villages. Department should do a mapping for sources of drinking water in the villages and it should attempt digging bore wells through small portable machines.

Distribution of chlorine should be done at the individual level during monsoon.

Education

1. To ensure regular presence of teachers in the school, they should be provided extra facilities such as staying accommodation. Teachers of all the 3 schools of Bhitada are from outside the village. Teachers from outside the area do not want to be posted in the village, due to lack of transportation and other facilities.
2. Administration should try opening residential schools in the villages. Such girl/boys hostels or ashrams are running successfully in many tribal areas.
3. Despite PTA and monitoring committees, the various schemes are not being implemented properly in the villages. A monitoring team of 10 members, 5 from the village and 5 from the district should be made. The administration should look for its viability. The committee can look into the idea of a cluster of 6 villages for better implementation of schemes.
4. The schools proposed under Right to Education (RTE) should have arrangement for teachers to stay there.

Mid-day-Meal

The biggest problem is the lack of coordination. There are coupons for ICDS schemes, but the SHG has taken its quota of ration. The whole process of sanjha chulha should be seen in totality, linked with PDS. There has been irregularity in the whole process since 2009. District administration should ensure proper action against those responsible.

The school monitoring committee should be responsible for monitoring of the scheme, which should have equal participation from the community. The administration should make the teachers accountable for proper implementation of the scheme. Urgent steps are necessary for proper implementation, so that malnutrition in children can be addressed quickly.

Social Security and Pension Scheme

For proper implementation of the schemes, the names of beneficiaries should be in the BPL list, than only can they can get benefits. The administration should ensure prompt action.

Department-wise Action Plan

A department-wise action plan for the public distribution system, MNREGA, family welfare, maternity benefits, janani suraksha, BPL, social security, aanganwadi, and ICDS should be created with respect to the affected villages -

1. Total number of families still residing in submergence affected villages.
2. Status of beneficiaries and villages for the particular scheme
3. Special Needs for implementation of the schemes
4. How will implementation of the schemes take place?
5. How will participation of people in the implementation of schemes be ensured?
6. What will be the mechanism for selecting eligibility for various schemes
7. Formation and functioning of monitoring committee
8. How regular reviews will be carried out in the villages
9. What steps will be taken for transparency and accountability?
10. What will be the mechanism for redressal of grievances?